

GOD AND BEING

JOHN
VERVAEKE

IAIN
McGILCHRIST



ROUND ONE

1
00:00:04,249 --> 00:00:02,450
even mcgilchrist is a psychiatrist a

2
00:00:05,990 --> 00:00:04,259
writer and a former Oxford literary

3
00:00:07,670 --> 00:00:06,000
scholar who came to prominence with his

4
00:00:09,830 --> 00:00:07,680
work the master and his Emissary

5
00:00:11,690 --> 00:00:09,840
subtitled The Divided brain and the

6
00:00:13,370 --> 00:00:11,700
making of the Western World we've spoken

7
00:00:14,990 --> 00:00:13,380
last year regarding the very topic and

8
00:00:17,269 --> 00:00:15,000
the link is in the description his new

9
00:00:19,370 --> 00:00:17,279
book the matter with things our brains

10
00:00:21,349 --> 00:00:19,380
our delusions and the unmaking of the

11
00:00:23,689 --> 00:00:21,359
world and the links to both books are in

12
00:00:25,189 --> 00:00:23,699
the description John verviki is a

13
00:00:27,170 --> 00:00:25,199

professor of cognitive science at the

14

00:00:29,150 --> 00:00:27,180

University of Toronto my former home

15

00:00:30,890 --> 00:00:29,160

who's one of the few Scholars taking an

16

00:00:33,110 --> 00:00:30,900

extensive and meticulous cognitive

17

00:00:35,209 --> 00:00:33,120

scientific approach to wisdom Buddhism

18

00:00:37,430 --> 00:00:35,219

and Consciousness John and I have also

19

00:00:39,290 --> 00:00:37,440

spoken several times on this podcast and

20

00:00:40,549 --> 00:00:39,300

you can see the thumbnails here and the

21

00:00:42,350 --> 00:00:40,559

links to each will be in the description

22

00:00:44,930 --> 00:00:42,360

as well it's that latter topic

23

00:00:47,090 --> 00:00:44,940

Consciousness that in more ways than one

24

00:00:48,709 --> 00:00:47,100

binds us here today as usual click on

25

00:00:51,170 --> 00:00:48,719

the timestamp in the description to skip

26
00:00:52,970 --> 00:00:51,180
this intro my name is Kurt J mungle I'm

27
00:00:54,889 --> 00:00:52,980
a torontonian filmmaker with a

28
00:00:56,389 --> 00:00:54,899
background in mathematical physics and

29
00:00:58,729 --> 00:00:56,399
this channel is dedicated to the

30
00:01:01,430 --> 00:00:58,739
explication of the variegated terrain of

31
00:01:03,529 --> 00:01:01,440
theories of everything that is primarily

32
00:01:05,929 --> 00:01:03,539
from a theoretical physics perspective

33
00:01:07,550 --> 00:01:05,939
so for example Grand unification and

34
00:01:09,289 --> 00:01:07,560
quantum gravity but as well as

35
00:01:11,510 --> 00:01:09,299
understanding the role Consciousness has

36
00:01:13,130 --> 00:01:11,520
to play to the fundamental laws provided

37
00:01:15,170 --> 00:01:13,140
these laws exist at all in a form

38
00:01:16,910 --> 00:01:15,180

knowable to us two quick announcements

39

00:01:18,830 --> 00:01:16,920

firstly there's a physics and

40

00:01:20,149 --> 00:01:18,840

Consciousness contest on this channel

41

00:01:21,590 --> 00:01:20,159

the link to which will be in the

42

00:01:23,390 --> 00:01:21,600

description as well as the thumbnail is

43

00:01:25,370 --> 00:01:23,400

over here essentially it's the physics

44

00:01:27,590 --> 00:01:25,380

version of the three blue one brown math

45

00:01:29,210 --> 00:01:27,600

contest except ours is for physics and

46

00:01:31,190 --> 00:01:29,220

Consciousness as well if you have an

47

00:01:33,469 --> 00:01:31,200

idea for some explainer of an advanced

48

00:01:35,090 --> 00:01:33,479

physics or Consciousness concept then

49

00:01:36,770 --> 00:01:35,100

think about creating a video for this

50

00:01:38,690 --> 00:01:36,780

and submitting as you have the chance to

51
00:01:40,550 --> 00:01:38,700
win one thousand dollars brilliances

52
00:01:42,109 --> 00:01:40,560
come in to give five thousand among the

53
00:01:43,850 --> 00:01:42,119
top five so that's one thousand for each

54
00:01:45,190 --> 00:01:43,860
the second announcement is that there's

55
00:01:47,510 --> 00:01:45,200
a new

56
00:01:49,370 --> 00:01:47,520
theoriesofeverything.org website this is

57
00:01:52,370 --> 00:01:49,380
a website where you can support toe

58
00:01:54,530 --> 00:01:52,380
slash Kurt which is me instead of on

59
00:01:56,450 --> 00:01:54,540
patreon because patreon takes a huge cut

60
00:01:58,130 --> 00:01:56,460
as well as PayPal takes a cut there's

61
00:01:59,630 --> 00:01:58,140
many different places that take their

62
00:02:02,030 --> 00:01:59,640
share and as a Creator you don't have

63
00:02:04,850 --> 00:02:02,040

control over your donations so for

64

00:02:06,889 --> 00:02:04,860

instance patreon may decide to shut you

65

00:02:08,510 --> 00:02:06,899

down for whatever reason they like there

66

00:02:10,309 --> 00:02:08,520

are also a variety of benefits that come

67

00:02:11,809 --> 00:02:10,319

with being a member on the toe website

68

00:02:13,430 --> 00:02:11,819

for instance you get an ad free version

69

00:02:15,710 --> 00:02:13,440

of the shows that are coming out an

70

00:02:17,690 --> 00:02:15,720

audio ad-free version that is to say you

71

00:02:19,250 --> 00:02:17,700

get a private link to the RSS feed to

72

00:02:21,949 --> 00:02:19,260

download the audio versions and they

73

00:02:23,930 --> 00:02:21,959

come out about 12 to 48 Hours sometimes

74

00:02:25,790 --> 00:02:23,940

even one week prior to you seeing them

75

00:02:27,650 --> 00:02:25,800

here on YouTube Just so you know the way

76

00:02:29,089 --> 00:02:27,660

that it works is that I finished editing

77

00:02:30,890 --> 00:02:29,099

and then I have to do another run

78

00:02:33,470 --> 00:02:30,900

through and go through timestamps and

79

00:02:36,050 --> 00:02:33,480

catalog references and so on that takes

80

00:02:38,390 --> 00:02:36,060

time and what it means is that I put it

81

00:02:40,250 --> 00:02:38,400

out on YouTube and then I have a lag so

82

00:02:42,229 --> 00:02:40,260

that I can build up some hype and some

83

00:02:43,670 --> 00:02:42,239

audience prior to the premiere but then

84

00:02:46,550 --> 00:02:43,680

that means that I've actually finished

85

00:02:48,350 --> 00:02:46,560

the episode a couple days before so what

86

00:02:50,509 --> 00:02:48,360

I'll do is I'll upload simultaneously

87

00:02:52,369 --> 00:02:50,519

for the members and audio version ads

88

00:02:54,589 --> 00:02:52,379

free and then later it premieres on

89
00:02:56,330 --> 00:02:54,599
YouTube for you as the YouTube audience

90
00:02:57,890 --> 00:02:56,340
nothing changes this is the way I've

91
00:03:00,410 --> 00:02:57,900
always done it it's just that I have

92
00:03:02,330 --> 00:03:00,420
here an audio version for a little while

93
00:03:04,190 --> 00:03:02,340
prior which I'm going to release to the

94
00:03:05,570 --> 00:03:04,200
toe members as a thank you and it's

95
00:03:06,890 --> 00:03:05,580
going to be ads free so that's one of

96
00:03:09,229 --> 00:03:06,900
the benefits from this point forward

97
00:03:11,149 --> 00:03:09,239
there may be mid-rolls that is ads in

98
00:03:13,369 --> 00:03:11,159
the middle of a podcast and that's just

99
00:03:16,070 --> 00:03:13,379
part and parcel of the total members of

100
00:03:17,930 --> 00:03:16,080
the tow audience you are sponsoring toe

101
00:03:19,369 --> 00:03:17,940
and then the sponsors also sponsor toe

102
00:03:21,410 --> 00:03:19,379
so thank you for your support those

103
00:03:23,089 --> 00:03:21,420
won't be there in the audio ads free

104
00:03:25,309 --> 00:03:23,099
version for the toe members second

105
00:03:27,530 --> 00:03:25,319
benefit is that you get discounts to any

106
00:03:30,410 --> 00:03:27,540
Live Events when we do have them for

107
00:03:32,509 --> 00:03:30,420
instance I'd like to do Carl friston in

108
00:03:34,729 --> 00:03:32,519
London live in front of an audience same

109
00:03:36,470 --> 00:03:34,739
with Eman Gilchrist and John vervaki at

110
00:03:38,330 --> 00:03:36,480
some point another benefit is that there

111
00:03:39,949 --> 00:03:38,340
will be exclusive merch offered to the

112
00:03:41,570 --> 00:03:39,959
toe members another benefit is that

113
00:03:43,369 --> 00:03:41,580

there's a number to text me again if

114

00:03:45,110 --> 00:03:43,379

that's what you're into we're testing

115

00:03:46,970 --> 00:03:45,120

this out for about a month and yes this

116

00:03:49,009 --> 00:03:46,980

is something where I am texting you back

117

00:03:50,869 --> 00:03:49,019

to your phone throughout much of this

118

00:03:52,610 --> 00:03:50,879

you can see that the artwork here is

119

00:03:54,649 --> 00:03:52,620

exquisite on the website and that's

120

00:03:57,050 --> 00:03:54,659

because it's been done by Boris Martinez

121

00:03:58,789 --> 00:03:57,060

Costello a link to his Instagram is in

122

00:04:00,949 --> 00:03:58,799

the description as well thank you Boris

123

00:04:01,930 --> 00:04:00,959

thank you so much as for today's sponsor

124

00:04:03,710 --> 00:04:01,940

it's

125

00:04:05,750 --> 00:04:03,720

brilliantbrilliant.org now Brilliance

126

00:04:07,309 --> 00:04:05,760

has been with toe since near the

127

00:04:09,649 --> 00:04:07,319

beginning I recommend you check out

128

00:04:11,330 --> 00:04:09,659

brilliant.org toe if you're interested

129

00:04:13,610 --> 00:04:11,340

in learning math and physics and science

130

00:04:14,929 --> 00:04:13,620

so brilliant is a place that you go to

131

00:04:16,370 --> 00:04:14,939

learn about stem subjects in an

132

00:04:19,009 --> 00:04:16,380

interactive manner they have these

133

00:04:21,110 --> 00:04:19,019

bite-sized courses it's extremely easy

134

00:04:23,510 --> 00:04:21,120

you may think that special relativity is

135

00:04:25,010 --> 00:04:23,520

beyond you no it's not it's something

136

00:04:26,749 --> 00:04:25,020

that someone can understand in

137

00:04:29,390 --> 00:04:26,759

elementary school the way that brilliant

138

00:04:30,830 --> 00:04:29,400

breaks down these extremely ordinarily

139

00:04:32,629 --> 00:04:30,840

extremely advanced concepts is

140

00:04:35,450 --> 00:04:32,639

Elementary at some point I'll be doing

141

00:04:37,790 --> 00:04:35,460

an introduction to information theory in

142

00:04:40,010 --> 00:04:37,800

particular there's David Deutsch and

143

00:04:41,810 --> 00:04:40,020

Chiara marleto's Constructor Theory and

144

00:04:43,550 --> 00:04:41,820

because I'd like to learn that I decided

145

00:04:45,590 --> 00:04:43,560

let me brush up on the fundamentals of

146

00:04:47,450 --> 00:04:45,600

information Theory and I took Brilliance

147

00:04:51,170 --> 00:04:47,460

course just to do so over this winter

148

00:04:53,810 --> 00:04:51,180

break visit brilliant.org toe that's toe

149

00:04:54,890 --> 00:04:53,820

to get 20 off the annual subscription I

150

00:04:57,170 --> 00:04:54,900

recommend that you don't stop before

151

00:04:59,330 --> 00:04:57,180

four lessons just keep going until you

152

00:05:01,249 --> 00:04:59,340

hit four and you'll be greatly surprised

153

00:05:03,530 --> 00:05:01,259

at the easy which you can now comprehend

154

00:05:05,689 --> 00:05:03,540

subjects you previously had a difficult

155

00:05:07,249 --> 00:05:05,699

time grocking okay thank you and enjoy

156

00:05:08,629 --> 00:05:07,259

today's episode we'll start this by

157

00:05:11,510 --> 00:05:08,639

asking each of you what is the meaning

158

00:05:14,290 --> 00:05:11,520

crisis and what are its causes and we'll

159

00:05:17,689 --> 00:05:14,300

start with Ian if you don't mind well

160

00:05:19,129 --> 00:05:17,699

what I understand by it is is the fact

161

00:05:22,610 --> 00:05:19,139

that people have

162

00:05:25,430 --> 00:05:22,620

lost any sense that things really speak

163

00:05:27,830 --> 00:05:25,440

to them from somewhere beyond their own

164

00:05:33,050 --> 00:05:27,840

what they've made up in their own minds

165

00:05:39,110 --> 00:05:36,290

um great possibly Transcendent certainly

166

00:05:41,810 --> 00:05:39,120

of existential importance is harder now

167

00:05:44,270 --> 00:05:41,820

because we live in a world of reductive

168

00:05:47,050 --> 00:05:44,280

materialism in which everything is

169

00:05:50,990 --> 00:05:47,060

supposed to be explained as the dead

170

00:05:54,710 --> 00:05:51,000

movements of mechanical pieces

171

00:05:57,170 --> 00:05:54,720

um I I think this is not only incredibly

172

00:05:59,749 --> 00:05:57,180

unhealthy and causes mental illness

173

00:06:02,810 --> 00:05:59,759

which is not just my opinion but the

174

00:06:05,270 --> 00:06:02,820

statistics speak for themselves

175

00:06:08,230 --> 00:06:05,280

but is

176
00:06:10,370 --> 00:06:08,240
a huge mistake in its conception because

177
00:06:12,290 --> 00:06:10,380
I don't believe that meaning is

178
00:06:14,510 --> 00:06:12,300
something we make up I believe it's

179
00:06:16,490 --> 00:06:14,520
something we find and we have to put our

180
00:06:18,409 --> 00:06:16,500
way ourselves in the way of finding it

181
00:06:20,570 --> 00:06:18,419
and that would mean

182
00:06:22,550 --> 00:06:20,580
putting a certain degree of

183
00:06:24,230 --> 00:06:22,560
vulnerability of opening oneself to

184
00:06:26,090 --> 00:06:24,240
something in case one finds there's

185
00:06:28,129 --> 00:06:26,100
something there and if one doesn't open

186
00:06:31,010 --> 00:06:28,139
oneself through one won't find that at

187
00:06:34,490 --> 00:06:31,020
all I think it applies to

188
00:06:37,490 --> 00:06:34,500

um spiritual life to religion in as much

189

00:06:41,529 --> 00:06:37,500

as that is part of it or many people and

190

00:06:44,210 --> 00:06:41,539

it also applies to experiences of Art

191

00:06:45,950 --> 00:06:44,220

and the experiences of one another and

192

00:06:48,170 --> 00:06:45,960

what it is to be a human being we've

193

00:06:50,710 --> 00:06:48,180

degraded ourselves and then find

194

00:06:54,170 --> 00:06:50,720

ourselves in a nihilistic

195

00:06:57,230 --> 00:06:54,180

Universe where nothing makes sense and

196

00:06:59,330 --> 00:06:57,240

nothing has meaning and that's a very

197

00:07:02,090 --> 00:06:59,340

dangerous place to be for a number of

198

00:07:05,090 --> 00:07:02,100

reasons for the course of civilization

199

00:07:09,830 --> 00:07:05,100

and also for each of us as individuals

200

00:07:11,809 --> 00:07:09,840

so yes it's a very important element in

201
00:07:14,990 --> 00:07:11,819
the position we find ourselves in as you

202
00:07:18,710 --> 00:07:15,000
know one of the things I believe has

203
00:07:21,070 --> 00:07:18,720
happened is that gradually over the

204
00:07:25,510 --> 00:07:21,080
course of recent western civilization

205
00:07:30,170 --> 00:07:25,520
and particularly after the enlightenment

206
00:07:32,990 --> 00:07:30,180
we we overreached ourselves we we were

207
00:07:35,689 --> 00:07:33,000
not content with the idea that

208
00:07:39,469 --> 00:07:35,699
um thinking rationally helps banish many

209
00:07:42,170 --> 00:07:39,479
unnecessary woes and mistakes and and so

210
00:07:44,270 --> 00:07:42,180
on but that we actually could understand

211
00:07:45,830 --> 00:07:44,280
everything and once you think you can

212
00:07:47,450 --> 00:07:45,840
understand everything your chances of

213
00:07:48,909 --> 00:07:47,460

understanding anything

214

00:07:51,890 --> 00:07:48,919

are remote

215

00:07:55,730 --> 00:07:51,900

and this has been taken to hubristic

216

00:07:58,490 --> 00:07:55,740

extremes during uh our lifetimes

217

00:08:00,110 --> 00:07:58,500

and I associate this with the rise of a

218

00:08:03,350 --> 00:08:00,120

certain way of thinking about the world

219

00:08:06,170 --> 00:08:03,360

that I believe is the way in which the

220

00:08:09,350 --> 00:08:06,180

left hemisphere operates it it has

221

00:08:12,230 --> 00:08:09,360

evolved the way it has because it helps

222

00:08:14,270 --> 00:08:12,240

us grab stuff and get stuff but it has

223

00:08:17,029 --> 00:08:14,280

outsourced the business of meaning and

224

00:08:18,890 --> 00:08:17,039

understanding to the right hemisphere

225

00:08:21,170 --> 00:08:18,900

or to put it another way the right

226

00:08:23,150 --> 00:08:21,180

hemisphere has Outsource grabbing and

227

00:08:25,189 --> 00:08:23,160

getting stuff to the left hemisphere and

228

00:08:27,249 --> 00:08:25,199

remained able to understand

229

00:08:29,809 --> 00:08:27,259

and that would bring a different

230

00:08:31,670 --> 00:08:29,819

relationship between ourselves and the

231

00:08:34,670 --> 00:08:31,680

world indeed I think this idea of

232

00:08:36,469 --> 00:08:34,680

relationship and encounters with reality

233

00:08:38,389 --> 00:08:36,479

is a very important one which no doubt

234

00:08:39,889 --> 00:08:38,399

will come back to it I argue in my

235

00:08:42,350 --> 00:08:39,899

latest book the matter with things has

236

00:08:44,870 --> 00:08:42,360

in fact relations of what everything is

237

00:08:47,990 --> 00:08:44,880

built out of and that relations are even

238

00:08:49,550 --> 00:08:48,000

prior to relata so that would be my

239

00:08:54,949 --> 00:08:49,560

first

240

00:08:56,509 --> 00:08:54,959

what I think about that huge question

241

00:08:57,769 --> 00:08:56,519

well

242

00:08:59,150 --> 00:08:57,779

um and I suppose that's one of the

243

00:09:01,190 --> 00:08:59,160

reasons why we're talking my answer is

244

00:09:03,769 --> 00:09:01,200

going to be uh I find at least in my

245

00:09:05,570 --> 00:09:03,779

mind by conversion with what Ian said

246

00:09:07,490 --> 00:09:05,580

um so but I'll start from a different

247

00:09:10,310 --> 00:09:07,500

place but I think I'll end up in the

248

00:09:11,090 --> 00:09:10,320

same or very close to where he ended up

249

00:09:13,370 --> 00:09:11,100

um

250

00:09:15,650 --> 00:09:13,380

I think the very processes that make us

251
00:09:17,750 --> 00:09:15,660
intelligently adaptive make us

252
00:09:20,269 --> 00:09:17,760
parentally susceptible to self-deceptive

253
00:09:23,269 --> 00:09:20,279
self-destructive behavior

254
00:09:25,670 --> 00:09:23,279
um and that the cross time and culture

255
00:09:27,610 --> 00:09:25,680
people have come up with complex systems

256
00:09:29,990 --> 00:09:27,620
because this is a very complex system

257
00:09:32,389 --> 00:09:30,000
ecologies of practices I call them for

258
00:09:34,250 --> 00:09:32,399
intervening and ameliorating that

259
00:09:37,430 --> 00:09:34,260
self-deceptive self-destructive behavior

260
00:09:39,410 --> 00:09:37,440
and also enhancing the sense of

261
00:09:44,449 --> 00:09:39,420
connectedness

262
00:09:48,110 --> 00:09:46,190
deceptive self-destructive Behavior

263
00:09:50,449 --> 00:09:48,120

that's to oneself to other people to the

264

00:09:52,130 --> 00:09:50,459

world and when you take a look at that

265

00:09:53,690 --> 00:09:52,140

sense of connectedness it overlaps very

266

00:09:56,210 --> 00:09:53,700

much with what's called meaning in life

267

00:09:57,949 --> 00:09:56,220

and it's and as Ian said we want to feel

268

00:10:00,769 --> 00:09:57,959

that we are connected to something that

269

00:10:03,470 --> 00:10:00,779

has a value and a reality other than our

270

00:10:05,269 --> 00:10:03,480

own egocentric preferences and existence

271

00:10:06,769 --> 00:10:05,279

all right so I'll often ask people what

272

00:10:08,090 --> 00:10:06,779

do you mean by meaning in life and I'll

273

00:10:10,130 --> 00:10:08,100

say well tell me what you would want to

274

00:10:12,290 --> 00:10:10,140

continue existing even if you weren't

275

00:10:13,910 --> 00:10:12,300

here and they'll tell me and I'll tell

276

00:10:16,070 --> 00:10:13,920

and they'll say that's what matters to

277

00:10:17,630 --> 00:10:16,080

you that's what you want that's what you

278

00:10:19,670 --> 00:10:17,640

want to be connected to beyond your

279

00:10:21,889 --> 00:10:19,680

egocentric preferences and your

280

00:10:25,910 --> 00:10:21,899

egocentric existence

281

00:10:27,350 --> 00:10:25,920

I think the capacity to ameliorate that

282

00:10:30,110 --> 00:10:27,360

self-deceptive self-destructive

283

00:10:32,449 --> 00:10:30,120

foolishness and to enhance the sense of

284

00:10:34,910 --> 00:10:32,459

connectedness is what people what

285

00:10:38,269 --> 00:10:34,920

cultures have called wisdom and I think

286

00:10:40,070 --> 00:10:38,279

what we're facing today is a two-pronged

287

00:10:41,630 --> 00:10:40,080

problem

288

00:10:44,269 --> 00:10:41,640

um people don't know where to go for

289

00:10:46,910 --> 00:10:44,279

wisdom they overwhelmingly know to where

290

00:10:49,430 --> 00:10:46,920

to go for information but like T.S Eliot

291

00:10:50,509 --> 00:10:49,440

said we have lost the wisdom and the

292

00:10:53,090 --> 00:10:50,519

knowledge and the knowledge and the

293

00:10:54,710 --> 00:10:53,100

information so they precisely lack the

294

00:10:56,090 --> 00:10:54,720

discernment as to what they should pay

295

00:10:58,550 --> 00:10:56,100

attention to what they should take

296

00:11:00,829 --> 00:10:58,560

seriously what really matters so they're

297

00:11:02,870 --> 00:11:00,839

overwhelmed with information what counts

298

00:11:04,730 --> 00:11:02,880

as knowledge is now significantly in

299

00:11:05,990 --> 00:11:04,740

question in our culture and of course

300

00:11:08,449 --> 00:11:06,000

when I ask people where they go for

301
00:11:10,970 --> 00:11:08,459
wisdom I either get a deafening silence

302
00:11:13,970 --> 00:11:10,980
or I get some autodidactic religion of

303
00:11:16,370 --> 00:11:13,980
me that the person gives me typically

304
00:11:17,990 --> 00:11:16,380
um and so

305
00:11:20,870 --> 00:11:18,000
um the fastest growing group in our

306
00:11:23,030 --> 00:11:20,880
culture are the nuns n-o-n-e-s they have

307
00:11:24,470 --> 00:11:23,040
no official religious affiliation that

308
00:11:26,810 --> 00:11:24,480
does not mean they are overwhelmingly

309
00:11:29,210 --> 00:11:26,820
atheist they are by and large they

310
00:11:31,790 --> 00:11:29,220
describe themselves by this phrase that

311
00:11:33,050 --> 00:11:31,800
is very popular to exactly agree to

312
00:11:35,030 --> 00:11:33,060
which I find it vapid if they're

313
00:11:36,829 --> 00:11:35,040

spiritual but not religious and it's

314

00:11:38,810 --> 00:11:36,839

very hard to determine what that

315

00:11:40,190 --> 00:11:38,820

actually means other than they have some

316

00:11:42,290 --> 00:11:40,200

intuitive sense that they should be

317

00:11:44,930 --> 00:11:42,300

seeking wisdom they should be seeking

318

00:11:47,449 --> 00:11:44,940

connectedness but they distrust any of

319

00:11:49,970 --> 00:11:47,459

the institutionalized sources the

320

00:11:51,410 --> 00:11:49,980

problem is the the what was supposed to

321

00:11:53,630 --> 00:11:51,420

offer

322

00:11:56,090 --> 00:11:53,640

you'll so religions have been the home

323

00:11:58,250 --> 00:11:56,100

for these ecologies of practices and the

324

00:12:00,470 --> 00:11:58,260

enlightenment offered to free us from

325

00:12:02,269 --> 00:12:00,480

the tyranny of religion and give us an

326

00:12:04,310 --> 00:12:02,279

alternative home

327

00:12:07,009 --> 00:12:04,320

and it gave us

328

00:12:08,690 --> 00:12:07,019

gave us the scientific worldview a

329

00:12:10,490 --> 00:12:08,700

scientific worldview which explains

330

00:12:12,889 --> 00:12:10,500

everything except how we generate

331

00:12:15,230 --> 00:12:12,899

science and the meaning that makes truth

332

00:12:17,569 --> 00:12:15,240

possible and how science itself could

333

00:12:20,630 --> 00:12:17,579

possibly exist as a real entity within

334

00:12:23,269 --> 00:12:20,640

the ontology of that world of you and so

335

00:12:27,769 --> 00:12:23,279

we and our science actually have no

336

00:12:29,630 --> 00:12:27,779

proper home in that worldview and so the

337

00:12:32,090 --> 00:12:29,640

science can't provide the home for the

338

00:12:34,910 --> 00:12:32,100

Ecology of practices the religions are

339

00:12:38,210 --> 00:12:34,920

are now largely regarded as obsolete or

340

00:12:40,550 --> 00:12:38,220

irrelevant uh for of homing the Ecology

341

00:12:44,810 --> 00:12:40,560

of practices and so the perennial

342

00:12:47,210 --> 00:12:44,820

problems now go largely uh unabated or

343

00:12:49,550 --> 00:12:47,220

ameliorated at Best by autodidactic

344

00:12:53,329 --> 00:12:49,560

systems that have a strong proclivity

345

00:12:54,769 --> 00:12:53,339

for enhancing personal bias or group

346

00:12:57,410 --> 00:12:54,779

Echo chambering and of course social

347

00:13:00,710 --> 00:12:57,420

media has just exacerbated uh both of

348

00:13:03,230 --> 00:13:00,720

these Tendencies uh tremendously

349

00:13:06,530 --> 00:13:03,240

and so we starve for meaning

350

00:13:08,930 --> 00:13:06,540

uh in the midst of a wisdom famine we

351

00:13:11,150 --> 00:13:08,940

can't ignore a scientific worldview

352

00:13:14,569 --> 00:13:11,160

but that worldview does not properly

353

00:13:17,090 --> 00:13:14,579

Place us and what it does is it gives a

354

00:13:19,269 --> 00:13:17,100

tremendous emphasis on propositional

355

00:13:20,930 --> 00:13:19,279

knowing at the expense of all the

356

00:13:22,910 --> 00:13:20,940

non-propositional kinds of knowing

357

00:13:24,590 --> 00:13:22,920

procedural perspectival and

358

00:13:26,750 --> 00:13:24,600

participatory so we live in a

359

00:13:28,670 --> 00:13:26,760

propositional tyranny that prevents us

360

00:13:31,490 --> 00:13:28,680

from accessing those ways of knowing

361

00:13:34,069 --> 00:13:31,500

that would be properly the most

362

00:13:36,050 --> 00:13:34,079

powerful Vehicles by which we can

363

00:13:38,449 --> 00:13:36,060

cultivate wisdom and a sense of

364

00:13:40,490 --> 00:13:38,459

connectedness and I think that is the

365

00:13:42,650 --> 00:13:40,500

meaning crisis and that is the situation

366

00:13:44,030 --> 00:13:42,660

they're in and it's getting worse and

367

00:13:45,650 --> 00:13:44,040

worse

368

00:13:47,990 --> 00:13:45,660

um people experience it as a kind of

369

00:13:49,850 --> 00:13:48,000

domicide a loss of home even though they

370

00:13:52,310 --> 00:13:49,860

have shelter

371

00:13:53,930 --> 00:13:52,320

um and covid made it much much worse and

372

00:13:56,329 --> 00:13:53,940

we are seeing the mental health tsunami

373

00:13:58,129 --> 00:13:56,339

and the political ramifications of the

374

00:13:59,030 --> 00:13:58,139

acceleration of the meeting crisis right

375

00:14:01,250 --> 00:13:59,040

now

376

00:14:04,550 --> 00:14:01,260

that would be my take on it and one more

377

00:14:07,009 --> 00:14:06,170

because it's conversion with what Ian

378

00:14:11,030 --> 00:14:07,019

said

379

00:14:13,310 --> 00:14:11,040

we've lost alitha we've lost the sense

380

00:14:16,490 --> 00:14:13,320

of Truth as what I call transjectivity

381

00:14:18,769 --> 00:14:16,500

the deeper thing that binds subjectivity

382

00:14:20,449 --> 00:14:18,779

and objectivity together the thing that

383

00:14:23,329 --> 00:14:20,459

is being given prominence by four

384

00:14:26,569 --> 00:14:23,339

e-cognitive science and meaning is such

385

00:14:28,910 --> 00:14:26,579

a real transgender relation it's not a

386

00:14:31,850 --> 00:14:28,920

it's not arbitrarily subjective it's not

387

00:14:33,889 --> 00:14:31,860

merely objectively measurable it is a

388

00:14:36,530 --> 00:14:33,899

proper real relation that's why I use

389

00:14:39,769 --> 00:14:36,540

the term connectedness

390

00:14:41,329 --> 00:14:39,779

that's um that's what I would say there

391

00:14:43,250 --> 00:14:41,339

Ian is there anything there that you

392

00:14:46,370 --> 00:14:43,260

would like to respond to

393

00:14:49,329 --> 00:14:46,380

I mean I I would in a broadly accept

394

00:14:51,710 --> 00:14:49,339

what what um Jonah said I mean he's he's

395

00:14:53,210 --> 00:14:51,720

put really the same points I was trying

396

00:14:55,069 --> 00:14:53,220

to make but just in slightly different

397

00:14:57,050 --> 00:14:55,079

way with perhaps from a different

398

00:14:57,710 --> 00:14:57,060

perspective

399

00:15:00,050 --> 00:14:57,720

um

400

00:15:01,430 --> 00:15:00,060

I think we both see the importance of

401
00:15:05,810 --> 00:15:01,440
something

402
00:15:08,870 --> 00:15:05,820
that calls to us we can't we feel

403
00:15:11,090 --> 00:15:08,880
ourselves attracted towards something

404
00:15:12,410 --> 00:15:11,100
um and we've lost the confidence to go

405
00:15:15,769 --> 00:15:12,420
there because

406
00:15:17,990 --> 00:15:15,779
um technology and information have

407
00:15:20,389 --> 00:15:18,000
substituted for deep knowledge and

408
00:15:22,310 --> 00:15:20,399
wisdom which is really what what's John

409
00:15:24,590 --> 00:15:22,320
was saying

410
00:15:26,150 --> 00:15:24,600
um and I think the dangers

411
00:15:29,449 --> 00:15:26,160
in

412
00:15:31,250 --> 00:15:29,459
I mean the technology problem is the

413
00:15:33,650 --> 00:15:31,260

genius out of the box and it can't be

414

00:15:35,210 --> 00:15:33,660

put back in but one of the difficulties

415

00:15:37,129 --> 00:15:35,220

about it is all it does it doesn't

416

00:15:39,470 --> 00:15:37,139

answer any questions of course all it

417

00:15:40,569 --> 00:15:39,480

does is enlarge our powers to alter

418

00:15:43,790 --> 00:15:40,579

things

419

00:15:46,670 --> 00:15:43,800

and that's only as good as our wisdom

420

00:15:49,490 --> 00:15:46,680

about what needs whole thing and in what

421

00:15:51,530 --> 00:15:49,500

way into what end and I don't believe we

422

00:15:53,629 --> 00:15:51,540

have that wisdom at all we have more

423

00:15:57,050 --> 00:15:53,639

power than we've ever had

424

00:15:59,930 --> 00:15:57,060

in the history of humanity and the least

425

00:16:02,810 --> 00:15:59,940

wisdom we've ever had I believe

426

00:16:05,689 --> 00:16:02,820

and I think that this what

427

00:16:07,069 --> 00:16:05,699

um John was calling the the rise of

428

00:16:08,449 --> 00:16:07,079

propositional knowledge is very

429

00:16:13,009 --> 00:16:08,459

important when it comes to look at

430

00:16:17,329 --> 00:16:13,019

things like belief in the nature of

431

00:16:20,090 --> 00:16:17,339

God or the world because I think they

432

00:16:22,310 --> 00:16:20,100

are dispositional forms of knowing not

433

00:16:24,829 --> 00:16:22,320

propositional forms of knowing and

434

00:16:27,170 --> 00:16:24,839

unfortunately in recent history they've

435

00:16:29,150 --> 00:16:27,180

been presented to us as propositions

436

00:16:31,550 --> 00:16:29,160

that we either are sent to or fail to

437

00:16:34,670 --> 00:16:31,560

assent to whereas in fact it's a matter

438

00:16:37,970 --> 00:16:34,680

of how we attend to the world because

439

00:16:40,430 --> 00:16:37,980

attention is absolutely at the root of

440

00:16:42,889 --> 00:16:40,440

all of this problem we see

441

00:16:44,810 --> 00:16:42,899

coffee helps me work it helps me fast

442

00:16:46,850 --> 00:16:44,820

from carbs it's become one of the best

443

00:16:48,230 --> 00:16:46,860

parts of my day consistently that's why

444

00:16:50,329 --> 00:16:48,240

I'm delighted that we're collaborating

445

00:16:52,550 --> 00:16:50,339

with Trade coffee they partner with top

446

00:16:54,769 --> 00:16:52,560

independent Roasters to Freshly roast

447

00:16:56,810 --> 00:16:54,779

and send the finest coffee in the

448

00:16:58,850 --> 00:16:56,820

country directly to your home on your

449

00:17:01,009 --> 00:16:58,860

preferred schedule this matters to me as

450

00:17:03,230 --> 00:17:01,019

I work from home their team of experts

451

00:17:05,750 --> 00:17:03,240

do all the work testing hundreds of

452

00:17:09,169 --> 00:17:05,760

disparate coffees to land on a final

453

00:17:11,510 --> 00:17:09,179

curated collection of 450 exceptional

454

00:17:13,490 --> 00:17:11,520

coffees I chose these three and the team

455

00:17:15,049 --> 00:17:13,500

at Trade coffee worked to create a

456

00:17:17,090 --> 00:17:15,059

special lineup for theories of

457

00:17:19,010 --> 00:17:17,100

everything for the tow audience based on

458

00:17:20,870 --> 00:17:19,020

some questions they asked me such as how

459

00:17:23,090 --> 00:17:20,880

much caffeine do I enjoy and what's the

460

00:17:25,309 --> 00:17:23,100

bitterness ratio Etc you can get that

461

00:17:27,350 --> 00:17:25,319

line up or if that's not let's say your

462

00:17:29,750 --> 00:17:27,360

cup of coffee then you can take your own

463

00:17:32,030 --> 00:17:29,760

quiz on their website to find a set that

464

00:17:33,650 --> 00:17:32,040

matches your specific profile if you'd

465

00:17:35,390 --> 00:17:33,660

like to support small businesses and

466

00:17:37,970 --> 00:17:35,400

Brew the best cup of coffee you've ever

467

00:17:40,070 --> 00:17:37,980

made at home then it's time to try Trade

468

00:17:42,529 --> 00:17:40,080

coffee right now trade is offering our

469

00:17:45,430 --> 00:17:42,539

listeners thirty dollars off your first

470

00:17:48,970 --> 00:17:45,440

order plus free shipping at

471

00:17:51,950 --> 00:17:48,980

drinktrade.com everything that's

472

00:17:53,029 --> 00:17:51,960

drinktrade.com everything for thirty

473

00:17:54,890 --> 00:17:53,039

dollars off

474

00:17:57,110 --> 00:17:54,900

do you use the word rationality and

475

00:18:00,289 --> 00:17:57,120

belief differently than John

476
00:18:02,930 --> 00:18:00,299
um I don't know I have no idea whether

477
00:18:05,630 --> 00:18:02,940
we do or not I mean I tend to make a

478
00:18:07,850 --> 00:18:05,640
distinction which is not one that's hard

479
00:18:11,210 --> 00:18:07,860
and fast in the English language but is

480
00:18:12,830 --> 00:18:11,220
one I make for the purposes of being

481
00:18:15,529 --> 00:18:12,840
clear about what I'm talking about or

482
00:18:17,510 --> 00:18:15,539
clearer and that is to make a

483
00:18:21,049 --> 00:18:17,520
distinction between rationality and

484
00:18:24,590 --> 00:18:21,059
reason the rationality is a more

485
00:18:27,590 --> 00:18:24,600
technical thing but reason is the whole

486
00:18:29,150 --> 00:18:27,600
of one's ability to understand the world

487
00:18:31,909 --> 00:18:29,160
bringing together everything one has

488
00:18:35,150 --> 00:18:31,919

learned from experience one's ability to

489

00:18:37,010 --> 00:18:35,160

yes reason using logic one's ability to

490

00:18:39,470 --> 00:18:37,020

attend to one's intuitions it's the

491

00:18:41,870 --> 00:18:39,480

power that a good judge in the old days

492

00:18:45,730 --> 00:18:41,880

a wise judge as we would have thought of

493

00:18:49,130 --> 00:18:45,740

him usually would have been him uh

494

00:18:51,409 --> 00:18:49,140

brought to bear on a human situation so

495

00:18:53,750 --> 00:18:51,419

that's rationality I think it's terribly

496

00:18:56,330 --> 00:18:53,760

important I think in our I don't want to

497

00:18:59,870 --> 00:18:56,340

knock it at all it's just that it's it's

498

00:19:03,169 --> 00:18:59,880

certain very diminished form of it I.E

499

00:19:06,230 --> 00:19:03,179

the most mechanical rationalizations has

500

00:19:08,390 --> 00:19:06,240

taken over from that deep reason that

501
00:19:10,310 --> 00:19:08,400
deep wisdom which which was much admired

502
00:19:13,730 --> 00:19:10,320
in the Renaissance was thought to be the

503
00:19:15,770 --> 00:19:13,740
the sign of a fully educated and and

504
00:19:19,669 --> 00:19:15,780
well-read person

505
00:19:22,070 --> 00:19:19,679
so um I I think reasons in fact in

506
00:19:23,630 --> 00:19:22,080
danger in our time and also neither do I

507
00:19:26,090 --> 00:19:23,640
have anything to say against science

508
00:19:28,730 --> 00:19:26,100
science is hugely important and I'm very

509
00:19:31,730 --> 00:19:28,740
worried by the attacks on science for

510
00:19:33,830 --> 00:19:31,740
purely political reasons science is once

511
00:19:36,169 --> 00:19:33,840
we lose our anchors in reason and

512
00:19:38,270 --> 00:19:36,179
science we're totally lost but also if

513
00:19:41,169 --> 00:19:38,280

we only have reason and science we're

514

00:19:44,210 --> 00:19:41,179

lost they need to be mixed with properly

515

00:19:47,270 --> 00:19:44,220

what we can learn from intuition and

516

00:19:52,850 --> 00:19:51,529

so um uh I tend to use the word belief

517

00:19:54,470 --> 00:19:52,860

to mean the assertion of a proposition

518

00:19:56,930 --> 00:19:54,480

but I acknowledge it has an older

519

00:20:00,110 --> 00:19:56,940

meaning a Laban which is things in your

520

00:20:02,330 --> 00:20:00,120

heart to give your heart to exactly and

521

00:20:04,430 --> 00:20:02,340

uh but I've given up uh the Battle of

522

00:20:07,190 --> 00:20:04,440

trying to get people to use beliefs to

523

00:20:09,110 --> 00:20:07,200

mean that so I'll say you could keep it

524

00:20:11,270 --> 00:20:09,120

for the assertion of propositions I want

525

00:20:14,390 --> 00:20:11,280

to talk about something else that the

526

00:20:15,289 --> 00:20:14,400

Layman used to uh point to

527

00:20:17,870 --> 00:20:15,299

um

528

00:20:20,990 --> 00:20:17,880

I use I think I use rationality the way

529

00:20:25,610 --> 00:20:21,000

uh Ian uses reason and I'll give you my

530

00:20:28,070 --> 00:20:25,620

reasons which is I go back to the uh the

531

00:20:29,270 --> 00:20:28,080

word that translated logos and when I

532

00:20:31,490 --> 00:20:29,280

talk about rationality I'm talking about

533

00:20:33,730 --> 00:20:31,500

what the ancient Greeks meant by uh

534

00:20:37,190 --> 00:20:33,740

logos which is a much more comprehensive

535

00:20:39,230 --> 00:20:37,200

uh you know the the self-organizing of

536

00:20:41,330 --> 00:20:39,240

intelligibility such that the world can

537

00:20:43,490 --> 00:20:41,340

be real to us I think that's sort of the

538

00:20:45,289 --> 00:20:43,500

best understanding and the lat for that

539

00:20:47,510 --> 00:20:45,299

was ratio which means a proper

540

00:20:49,070 --> 00:20:47,520

proportioning and if you take a look at

541

00:20:51,049 --> 00:20:49,080

like if for example the use of the

542

00:20:53,090 --> 00:20:51,059

stoics or in Plato it means the proper

543

00:20:56,450 --> 00:20:53,100

proportioning as Ian said of attention

544

00:20:59,750 --> 00:20:56,460

it means the proper proportioning uh uh

545

00:21:01,850 --> 00:20:59,760

of your of your character traits uh

546

00:21:03,110 --> 00:21:01,860

think about Aristotle's golden mean you

547

00:21:05,930 --> 00:21:03,120

want to get the proper proportion

548

00:21:08,930 --> 00:21:05,940

between uh being cowardly and being full

549

00:21:10,789 --> 00:21:08,940

hearty so ratio is that much so ratio is

550

00:21:12,409 --> 00:21:10,799

the proper proportioning of your

551
00:21:14,570 --> 00:21:12,419
Consciousness your cognition and the

552
00:21:16,730 --> 00:21:14,580
character and your character such that

553
00:21:18,590 --> 00:21:16,740
virtue and virtue curiosity are possible

554
00:21:21,230 --> 00:21:18,600
that's and I think that's the ancient

555
00:21:23,750 --> 00:21:21,240
meaning of ratio and that's why I use

556
00:21:27,350 --> 00:21:23,760
rationality I reserve reason for the act

557
00:21:29,149 --> 00:21:27,360
of The Liberation uh but nothing much

558
00:21:31,070 --> 00:21:29,159
hangs on this distinction I think Ian

559
00:21:32,870 --> 00:21:31,080
and I are both pointing to something

560
00:21:34,250 --> 00:21:32,880
similar which is I talked about the

561
00:21:36,710 --> 00:21:34,260
truncation and the reduction of

562
00:21:38,990 --> 00:21:36,720
rationality to logicality and

563
00:21:41,149 --> 00:21:39,000

computation since the Advent of the

564

00:21:44,570 --> 00:21:41,159

Enlightenment and we have lost all those

565

00:21:46,970 --> 00:21:44,580

other aspects of

566

00:21:49,310 --> 00:21:46,980

um you know of rationality the proper

567

00:21:51,890 --> 00:21:49,320

proportioning like I say of attention of

568

00:21:55,370 --> 00:21:51,900

consciousness of character that is

569

00:21:58,490 --> 00:21:55,380

needed for virtue and I take virtue to

570

00:22:00,710 --> 00:21:58,500

not mean uh acting according to a moral

571

00:22:02,750 --> 00:22:00,720

rule like caught might but in the

572

00:22:04,610 --> 00:22:02,760

ancient sense of being deeply connected

573

00:22:06,950 --> 00:22:04,620

to what is most real

574

00:22:09,409 --> 00:22:06,960

so I think the person for example who

575

00:22:11,690 --> 00:22:09,419

demonstrates courage is able to see

576
00:22:15,470 --> 00:22:11,700
through the distractions and distortions

577
00:22:18,230 --> 00:22:15,480
of fear and connect to not just seeing

578
00:22:19,970 --> 00:22:18,240
but a properly connect to what is most

579
00:22:22,970 --> 00:22:19,980
real and what most matters in a

580
00:22:25,730 --> 00:22:22,980
situation and thereby has the affordance

581
00:22:27,590 --> 00:22:25,740
to act best in that situation that's

582
00:22:30,110 --> 00:22:27,600
what I mean by virtue connecting us to

583
00:22:32,390 --> 00:22:30,120
reality so rat for me rationality is

584
00:22:35,270 --> 00:22:32,400
exactly that capacity

585
00:22:37,789 --> 00:22:35,280
it's interesting that the word virtual

586
00:22:41,330 --> 00:22:37,799
now means precisely

587
00:22:43,430 --> 00:22:41,340
um not being real in the sense well

588
00:22:45,430 --> 00:22:43,440

that's that yeah and that's interesting

589

00:22:49,070 --> 00:22:45,440

I mean there is a connection because

590

00:22:51,529 --> 00:22:49,080

virtual have having the potential and

591

00:22:53,390 --> 00:22:51,539

the potential possibility

592

00:22:54,830 --> 00:22:53,400

um I'm aware of that

593

00:22:56,029 --> 00:22:54,840

um yeah I was just I don't think we're

594

00:22:58,010 --> 00:22:56,039

really disagreeing here I think it's

595

00:23:01,610 --> 00:22:58,020

just a matter of which words we choose

596

00:23:04,669 --> 00:23:01,620

to use sure yeah yeah I I like it uh

597

00:23:06,950 --> 00:23:04,679

because I I talk about ratio religio uh

598

00:23:09,169 --> 00:23:06,960

the the proper proportioning of how we

599

00:23:11,330 --> 00:23:09,179

are bound to things how we are connected

600

00:23:12,890 --> 00:23:11,340

to things and in that sense the

601
00:23:14,270 --> 00:23:12,900
distinction between what we've caught

602
00:23:17,029 --> 00:23:14,280
what we have since the enlightenment

603
00:23:21,169 --> 00:23:17,039
called rationality and what we used to

604
00:23:23,810 --> 00:23:21,179
call religion is is diminished uh

605
00:23:26,649 --> 00:23:23,820
because of religion is about again you

606
00:23:29,690 --> 00:23:26,659
know appropriately binding ourselves

607
00:23:32,330 --> 00:23:29,700
religio to what is most real the sacred

608
00:23:34,610 --> 00:23:32,340
then ratio religio and religion are no

609
00:23:36,770 --> 00:23:34,620
longer oppositional they have the

610
00:23:38,270 --> 00:23:36,780
potential to enter into real discourse

611
00:23:40,130 --> 00:23:38,280
with each other which I think is part of

612
00:23:42,590 --> 00:23:40,140
what is needed right now and I think I

613
00:23:44,210 --> 00:23:42,600

hear you saying that too I he I think

614

00:23:46,370 --> 00:23:44,220

you I hear you saying I agree with you

615

00:23:47,690 --> 00:23:46,380

I'm a scientist I love science and I

616

00:23:51,070 --> 00:23:47,700

think people who don't practice science

617

00:23:54,049 --> 00:23:51,080

should not uh recommend its eradication

618

00:23:56,270 --> 00:23:54,059

uh I I think that that is a ridiculous

619

00:23:58,310 --> 00:23:56,280

proposal it's even contradictory to

620

00:23:59,810 --> 00:23:58,320

their own claim that you have to have a

621

00:24:02,090 --> 00:23:59,820

lived experience of something in order

622

00:24:04,490 --> 00:24:02,100

to really understand it so I agree with

623

00:24:06,590 --> 00:24:04,500

you that that proposal is ridiculous but

624

00:24:08,390 --> 00:24:06,600

I think the the enlightenment proposal

625

00:24:11,149 --> 00:24:08,400

that everything that people were trying

626

00:24:13,370 --> 00:24:11,159

to Encompass what what in what was

627

00:24:15,289 --> 00:24:13,380

broadly called religion which includes a

628

00:24:18,649 --> 00:24:15,299

lot of what we now pulled out is Art and

629

00:24:21,409 --> 00:24:18,659

ritual and ceremony that that was also

630

00:24:24,049 --> 00:24:21,419

part of Rafael religio that was way in

631

00:24:26,210 --> 00:24:24,059

which we properly educated especially

632

00:24:29,330 --> 00:24:26,220

the non-propositional aspects of knowing

633

00:24:31,310 --> 00:24:29,340

uh that are are vital for the

634

00:24:32,090 --> 00:24:31,320

cultivation of virtue and a sense of

635

00:24:34,370 --> 00:24:32,100

meaning

636

00:24:36,350 --> 00:24:34,380

um so I agree with you there too and I

637

00:24:38,570 --> 00:24:36,360

hear you saying we should get those two

638

00:24:39,950 --> 00:24:38,580

at least it seems to me like you would

639

00:24:41,330 --> 00:24:39,960

agree with the proposal that we should

640

00:24:44,390 --> 00:24:41,340

find a way to get them talking to each

641

00:24:47,169 --> 00:24:44,400

other again past the division uh that

642

00:24:50,570 --> 00:24:47,179

separated them in the enlightenment

643

00:24:54,049 --> 00:24:50,580

yes certainly in um

644

00:24:56,330 --> 00:24:54,059

in the the new book

645

00:24:57,950 --> 00:24:56,340

um of mine which came out last year I

646

00:25:00,230 --> 00:24:57,960

have it I have it by the way Ian I

647

00:25:03,310 --> 00:25:00,240

haven't read it but I do have it so I

648

00:25:09,110 --> 00:25:06,830

I don't know I mean for that will be in

649

00:25:11,630 --> 00:25:09,120

the description how you'll find the time

650

00:25:14,870 --> 00:25:11,640

to read it I don't know but in this part

651
00:25:17,029 --> 00:25:14,880
two of that I specifically look at the

652
00:25:19,789 --> 00:25:17,039
various ways in which we can come to

653
00:25:24,710 --> 00:25:19,799
something we could call truth about the

654
00:25:27,769 --> 00:25:24,720
world and in in brief I did I conclude

655
00:25:31,549 --> 00:25:27,779
that we need each of science reason

656
00:25:34,370 --> 00:25:31,559
intuition and Imagination not just one

657
00:25:35,990 --> 00:25:34,380
or two of these and if possible in most

658
00:25:37,549 --> 00:25:36,000
situations we should try to bring as

659
00:25:40,070 --> 00:25:37,559
many of these as possible to bear

660
00:25:42,110 --> 00:25:40,080
however appropriate to whatever it is

661
00:25:43,970 --> 00:25:42,120
we're looking at I don't think this is

662
00:25:46,610 --> 00:25:43,980
what we're currently doing there's a

663
00:25:48,409 --> 00:25:46,620

sort of naive war between scientism

664

00:25:50,570 --> 00:25:48,419

people who've never really thought very

665

00:25:52,610 --> 00:25:50,580

much but just imagine that whatever it

666

00:25:56,450 --> 00:25:52,620

is they've fallen into believing about a

667

00:25:58,430 --> 00:25:56,460

Mechanical Universe must be right uh

668

00:26:00,289 --> 00:25:58,440

we've got a war on between them and and

669

00:26:02,750 --> 00:26:00,299

other people who reject science and

670

00:26:05,590 --> 00:26:02,760

reject reason and I I don't wish to

671

00:26:08,390 --> 00:26:05,600

encourage either party

672

00:26:10,130 --> 00:26:08,400

amongst those yeah I agree and I noticed

673

00:26:11,510 --> 00:26:10,140

in the second book because I have I I

674

00:26:14,690 --> 00:26:11,520

didn't just put it on the Shelf I have

675

00:26:16,909 --> 00:26:14,700

looked at it but it is yeah it's like I

676

00:26:18,169 --> 00:26:16,919

got to say this I didn't I this was a

677

00:26:19,850 --> 00:26:18,179

thunderbolt summer for me I was

678

00:26:22,310 --> 00:26:19,860

traveling so much and talking in so many

679

00:26:23,930 --> 00:26:22,320

places uh but but you also I did know it

680

00:26:26,090 --> 00:26:23,940

in a second you also talked about the

681

00:26:27,649 --> 00:26:26,100

sacred and recovering uh the sacred and

682

00:26:30,529 --> 00:26:27,659

the second part of the book as well so

683

00:26:33,830 --> 00:26:30,539

that's why I I was supposing that that

684

00:26:36,289 --> 00:26:33,840

uh whatever I'll propose to you that

685

00:26:38,090 --> 00:26:36,299

whatever the deficits and they're there

686

00:26:39,289 --> 00:26:38,100

they are many there were there are

687

00:26:40,970 --> 00:26:39,299

reasons behind the enlightenment

688

00:26:43,070 --> 00:26:40,980

critique but whatever deficits there are

689

00:26:44,750 --> 00:26:43,080

in religion it was an attempt to

690

00:26:47,529 --> 00:26:44,760

properly Orient people towards the

691

00:26:50,930 --> 00:26:47,539

sacred when it was functioning well yes

692

00:26:53,990 --> 00:26:50,940

undoubtedly yes yes and actually just to

693

00:26:56,630 --> 00:26:54,000

clarify for for viewers what um what

694

00:26:58,250 --> 00:26:56,640

John has just referred to is is not the

695

00:27:01,250 --> 00:26:58,260

part two that I was talking about is

696

00:27:03,669 --> 00:27:01,260

part three which confusingly is volume

697

00:27:06,470 --> 00:27:03,679

two oh okay sorry

698

00:27:07,909 --> 00:27:06,480

and the difference is that part two is

699

00:27:10,549 --> 00:27:07,919

epistemology in part three is

700

00:27:11,450 --> 00:27:10,559

metaphysics so I'm looking at what what

701
00:27:15,470 --> 00:27:11,460
is

702
00:27:18,529 --> 00:27:15,480
time motion space matter Consciousness

703
00:27:20,630 --> 00:27:18,539
what are values what his purpose what is

704
00:27:23,649 --> 00:27:20,640
the meaning of the feeling we have the

705
00:27:27,289 --> 00:27:23,659
sense of the Sacred and so on so that

706
00:27:28,549 --> 00:27:27,299
but anyway there we are well I'd like to

707
00:27:29,990 --> 00:27:28,559
talk to you about that but first I do

708
00:27:31,970 --> 00:27:30,000
want to talk to you about the previous

709
00:27:33,470 --> 00:27:31,980
thing you said because some of my most

710
00:27:36,350 --> 00:27:33,480
recent recent work has been around

711
00:27:38,810 --> 00:27:36,360
something that overlaps with that uh I

712
00:27:41,149 --> 00:27:38,820
mean I've published on Flow and

713
00:27:43,730 --> 00:27:41,159

intuition and we could we could perhaps

714

00:27:45,049 --> 00:27:43,740

talk about that uh but I've been doing

715

00:27:48,529 --> 00:27:45,059

recent work

716

00:27:51,470 --> 00:27:48,539

um I gave it invited talk at uh invited

717

00:27:54,289 --> 00:27:51,480

lecture at Cambridge about the imaginal

718

00:27:57,769 --> 00:27:54,299

um and its relationship to rationality

719

00:28:00,110 --> 00:27:57,779

um but what I mean by rationality and uh

720

00:28:01,909 --> 00:28:00,120

and you know I'm filming my next series

721

00:28:03,830 --> 00:28:01,919

after Socrates and there's a whole

722

00:28:05,810 --> 00:28:03,840

section where I where I'm talking about

723

00:28:08,750 --> 00:28:05,820

the how the neoplatonists try to

724

00:28:11,029 --> 00:28:08,760

integrate the imaginal back into sort of

725

00:28:12,230 --> 00:28:11,039

the depths of philosophy so I don't know

726

00:28:13,789 --> 00:28:12,240

if you're aware of the distinction that

727

00:28:15,470 --> 00:28:13,799

core band makes between the imaginary

728

00:28:18,830 --> 00:28:15,480

and the imaginal

729

00:28:20,169 --> 00:28:18,840

um would it be worthwhile for me to say

730

00:28:22,669 --> 00:28:20,179

what that is

731

00:28:24,470 --> 00:28:22,679

I've got an idea but I could be wrong so

732

00:28:26,990 --> 00:28:24,480

if you like to unpack what you mean

733

00:28:28,669 --> 00:28:27,000

there sure sure

734

00:28:29,630 --> 00:28:28,679

um and then and I'll ground it in a

735

00:28:30,890 --> 00:28:29,640

concrete

736

00:28:32,870 --> 00:28:30,900

um thing

737

00:28:35,169 --> 00:28:32,880

um and then I'll try and show how just

738

00:28:38,149 --> 00:28:35,179

one quick point about how you could not

739

00:28:39,769 --> 00:28:38,159

you know not exhausted but exemplary of

740

00:28:41,570 --> 00:28:39,779

how you could see how it functions

741

00:28:43,730 --> 00:28:41,580

necessarily within what I'm calling

742

00:28:45,110 --> 00:28:43,740

rationality so probably I made a

743

00:28:46,669 --> 00:28:45,120

distinction but the imaginary is when

744

00:28:48,350 --> 00:28:46,679

you picture things in your head and

745

00:28:50,149 --> 00:28:48,360

you're and it's not for the sake of

746

00:28:52,430 --> 00:28:50,159

perception and you're in some sense

747

00:28:55,610 --> 00:28:52,440

escaping from the the limitations of

748

00:28:57,409 --> 00:28:55,620

reality that's the imaginary okay and it

749

00:28:58,250 --> 00:28:57,419

and it sort of maps onto a Tolkien meant

750

00:29:01,430 --> 00:28:58,260

by

751
00:29:03,950 --> 00:29:01,440
um Escapist fantasy and then the

752
00:29:07,250 --> 00:29:03,960
imaginal is Imagination for the sake of

753
00:29:08,810 --> 00:29:07,260
enhancing perception and the the given

754
00:29:10,909 --> 00:29:08,820
deep learning and predictive processing

755
00:29:12,830 --> 00:29:10,919
this now makes tremendous sense right

756
00:29:13,930 --> 00:29:12,840
most of perception is imaginal in this

757
00:29:16,970 --> 00:29:13,940
sense

758
00:29:17,750 --> 00:29:16,980
yeah go ahead so if I may just comment

759
00:29:19,909 --> 00:29:17,760
that

760
00:29:21,950 --> 00:29:19,919
um this is precisely distinction I make

761
00:29:24,950 --> 00:29:21,960
between what I call imagination and

762
00:29:26,269 --> 00:29:24,960
fancy following following words within

763
00:29:27,710 --> 00:29:26,279

Coleridge

764

00:29:30,470 --> 00:29:27,720

um the greatest writers in the English

765

00:29:31,850 --> 00:29:30,480

language on this particular topic and

766

00:29:34,370 --> 00:29:31,860

what they meant was the distinction

767

00:29:36,830 --> 00:29:34,380

exactly between fantasy that takes us

768

00:29:39,370 --> 00:29:36,840

away from reality and Imagination which

769

00:29:42,289 --> 00:29:39,380

is our only chance to enter into reality

770

00:29:44,450 --> 00:29:42,299

right and there's a and there's a

771

00:29:46,610 --> 00:29:44,460

connection I believe

772

00:29:48,830 --> 00:29:46,620

uh I know Coleridge has a huge influence

773

00:29:49,970 --> 00:29:48,840

on Barfield and I believe there's some I

774

00:29:51,889 --> 00:29:49,980

don't know if it's directly between

775

00:29:53,870 --> 00:29:51,899

Barfield and Corbin but I think they

776

00:29:56,149 --> 00:29:53,880

both influenced Hillman and others so

777

00:29:57,789 --> 00:29:56,159

I'm aware there's connections between

778

00:30:01,610 --> 00:29:57,799

those two bodies

779

00:30:03,169 --> 00:30:01,620

no importantly the uh coverage and

780

00:30:05,090 --> 00:30:03,179

coverage wasn't the beginning of this

781

00:30:06,769 --> 00:30:05,100

because he learned a great deal from

782

00:30:08,990 --> 00:30:06,779

shelling

783

00:30:11,029 --> 00:30:09,000

um and more or less lifted some of it

784

00:30:13,370 --> 00:30:11,039

out of shedding

785

00:30:15,769 --> 00:30:13,380

um so it goes down the line from there

786

00:30:17,870 --> 00:30:15,779

to in our time or more recent time

787

00:30:20,090 --> 00:30:17,880

anyway Owen Battlefield and and so on

788

00:30:21,950 --> 00:30:20,100

yeah and I think bortoff is right that

789

00:30:23,990 --> 00:30:21,960

it actually goes back you can see it in

790

00:30:25,570 --> 00:30:24,000

Gutter and when good is trying to get

791

00:30:28,310 --> 00:30:25,580

the herb plant

792

00:30:30,590 --> 00:30:28,320

he's inventing the imaginal act of

793

00:30:32,889 --> 00:30:30,600

perception uh yes it's a very good point

794

00:30:35,210 --> 00:30:32,899

and he also makes distinctions which are

795

00:30:37,130 --> 00:30:35,220

remarkably apt about the difference

796

00:30:38,889 --> 00:30:37,140

between the world provided by the right

797

00:30:42,289 --> 00:30:38,899

and the world provided by the lifetime

798

00:30:44,029 --> 00:30:42,299

incidentally so there we are anyway so

799

00:30:45,889 --> 00:30:44,039

the point I was making and so for

800

00:30:47,810 --> 00:30:45,899

example when I'm teaching but thank you

801
00:30:49,789 --> 00:30:47,820
for that enrichment Kurt you wanted to

802
00:30:51,889 --> 00:30:49,799
say something should I continue or I

803
00:30:53,810 --> 00:30:51,899
want to see if this is correct so the

804
00:30:55,909 --> 00:30:53,820
imaginary versus imaginal the difference

805
00:30:57,289 --> 00:30:55,919
is one of intent the reason why is like

806
00:30:59,210 --> 00:30:57,299
if one plays video games they're

807
00:31:00,590 --> 00:30:59,220
escaping or they can be but yet they

808
00:31:02,870 --> 00:31:00,600
still acquire skills that they can use

809
00:31:04,610 --> 00:31:02,880
in the real world under the right

810
00:31:06,590 --> 00:31:04,620
circumstances right

811
00:31:09,289 --> 00:31:06,600
um but it's also what the phenomenology

812
00:31:11,990 --> 00:31:09,299
of the act so let me let me try and say

813
00:31:14,870 --> 00:31:12,000

so usually the uh the the imaginary

814

00:31:16,789 --> 00:31:14,880

involves picturing in your mind like if

815

00:31:19,010 --> 00:31:16,799

I ask you right now imagine a sailboat

816

00:31:20,330 --> 00:31:19,020

are the sales up or not down and you can

817

00:31:22,730 --> 00:31:20,340

say they're up or down you can tell me

818

00:31:24,769 --> 00:31:22,740

that whereas if a child is imagining

819

00:31:26,630 --> 00:31:24,779

being Zorro they are not picturing

820

00:31:28,909 --> 00:31:26,640

anything they're picking up a stick

821

00:31:31,070 --> 00:31:28,919

tying a blanket around them and they're

822

00:31:32,930 --> 00:31:31,080

taking on the salience Landscaping of

823

00:31:35,149 --> 00:31:32,940

Zorro getting a taste of what it would

824

00:31:37,850 --> 00:31:35,159

be like to have zoro's perspective to

825

00:31:40,549 --> 00:31:37,860

have zoro's identity and see what that

826

00:31:42,769 --> 00:31:40,559

feels like for them in terms of skills

827

00:31:44,810 --> 00:31:42,779

they might want to cultivate identities

828

00:31:47,210 --> 00:31:44,820

and roles they might want to enter into

829

00:31:49,430 --> 00:31:47,220

it's it's it overlaps with developmental

830

00:31:51,649 --> 00:31:49,440

play and so the phenomenology is also

831

00:31:53,389 --> 00:31:51,659

very fundamentally different

832

00:31:55,669 --> 00:31:53,399

um I use it when I'm teaching Tai Chio

833

00:31:58,250 --> 00:31:55,679

when I'm telling people to stand I say I

834

00:32:00,889 --> 00:31:58,260

want you to imagine that you're standing

835

00:32:02,870 --> 00:32:00,899

in a river and from your knees to your

836

00:32:04,850 --> 00:32:02,880

feet are sinking into the mud

837

00:32:06,769 --> 00:32:04,860

so you're kind of get that feeling of

838

00:32:09,110 --> 00:32:06,779

rootedness and then from your knees to

839

00:32:10,789 --> 00:32:09,120

around your navel just like flowing

840

00:32:12,529 --> 00:32:10,799

water because that's how you want that

841

00:32:14,510 --> 00:32:12,539

area of your body and from here up is

842

00:32:16,909 --> 00:32:14,520

like air you want to give it very little

843

00:32:19,730 --> 00:32:16,919

attention and it dissipated and that and

844

00:32:22,070 --> 00:32:19,740

that helps people get into the proper

845

00:32:24,169 --> 00:32:22,080

way of inhabiting their body in order to

846

00:32:26,090 --> 00:32:24,179

optimize it for you know Tai Chi Chuan

847

00:32:28,370 --> 00:32:26,100

perspiring now

848

00:32:32,710 --> 00:32:28,380

that that for example that's one example

849

00:32:36,590 --> 00:32:32,720

of how the imaginal helps uh ratio but

850

00:32:38,090 --> 00:32:36,600

hirschfield and others this just you

851

00:32:39,889 --> 00:32:38,100

give you give you go into people the

852

00:32:41,769 --> 00:32:39,899

academics who are supposed to be the

853

00:32:43,970 --> 00:32:41,779

best right and you give them clear

854

00:32:45,649 --> 00:32:43,980

argument and evidence that they should

855

00:32:47,450 --> 00:32:45,659

start saving for the retirement you make

856

00:32:49,549 --> 00:32:47,460

sure they understand you allow them to

857

00:32:51,289 --> 00:32:49,559

voice any disputes you get agreement

858

00:32:53,149 --> 00:32:51,299

from them all

859

00:32:55,370 --> 00:32:53,159

you come back in six months none of them

860

00:32:57,350 --> 00:32:55,380

are saving for the retirement

861

00:32:58,310 --> 00:32:57,360

then you do the following and of course

862

00:33:00,289 --> 00:32:58,320

you have control groups and everything

863

00:33:02,570 --> 00:33:00,299

I'm just giving the the experimental

864

00:33:06,110 --> 00:33:02,580

group you ask them

865

00:33:08,810 --> 00:33:06,120

to imagine their future self as somebody

866

00:33:10,610 --> 00:33:08,820

that they love and care about

867

00:33:12,950 --> 00:33:10,620

that somebody that they have a

868

00:33:14,810 --> 00:33:12,960

relationship and a responsibility to a

869

00:33:17,090 --> 00:33:14,820

member of their family

870

00:33:19,070 --> 00:33:17,100

you're coming back in six months and

871

00:33:21,470 --> 00:33:19,080

you'll find two things they are now

872

00:33:24,830 --> 00:33:21,480

saving and the people that were vividly

873

00:33:28,250 --> 00:33:24,840

imagined that future self were able to

874

00:33:30,470 --> 00:33:28,260

save even more and you say so what the

875

00:33:32,930 --> 00:33:30,480

ability to Aspire to your future self

876

00:33:35,690 --> 00:33:32,940

and this is Agnes calart's argument is

877

00:33:38,090 --> 00:33:35,700

Central to rationality rationality is

878

00:33:40,610 --> 00:33:38,100

ultimately about self-correcting it's

879

00:33:43,250 --> 00:33:40,620

about aspiring to get to become more

880

00:33:46,009 --> 00:33:43,260

rational wiser than you are and

881

00:33:48,889 --> 00:33:46,019

therefore the ability to properly Aspire

882

00:33:50,870 --> 00:33:48,899

is dependent on the imaginal yet it is

883

00:33:54,169 --> 00:33:50,880

Central to rationality and therefore

884

00:33:56,269 --> 00:33:54,179

they are inseparably bound together this

885

00:33:57,409 --> 00:33:56,279

is something I find Plato deeply deeply

886

00:33:59,870 --> 00:33:57,419

understood because he'll give an

887

00:34:01,370 --> 00:33:59,880

argument and then he'll give the and

888

00:34:04,130 --> 00:34:01,380

that he'll give the parable of the cave

889

00:34:07,130 --> 00:34:04,140

and he'll put the two side by side so

890

00:34:09,710 --> 00:34:07,140

your what right the imaginal and the

891

00:34:12,470 --> 00:34:09,720

rational are interwoven together and

892

00:34:15,829 --> 00:34:12,480

again said we have we have now set them

893

00:34:18,349 --> 00:34:15,839

into this weird opposition which doesn't

894

00:34:19,970 --> 00:34:18,359

actually make very much sense I suppose

895

00:34:23,329 --> 00:34:19,980

it could be because of the prevalence of

896

00:34:26,570 --> 00:34:23,339

entertainment in which uh the imaginary

897

00:34:30,050 --> 00:34:26,580

or the fanciful is taking priority over

898

00:34:32,389 --> 00:34:30,060

places in which people properly enact

899

00:34:33,770 --> 00:34:32,399

the imaginal and I propose to you that

900

00:34:36,109 --> 00:34:33,780

those places traditionally have been

901
00:34:38,329 --> 00:34:36,119
ritual the serious play of the imaginal

902
00:34:40,369 --> 00:34:38,339
in order to enhance people's sense of

903
00:34:43,990 --> 00:34:40,379
connectedness especially to their future

904
00:34:48,649 --> 00:34:46,970
of course there's an enormous amount

905
00:34:52,730 --> 00:34:48,659
that could be said about the imagination

906
00:34:55,129 --> 00:34:52,740
and its qualities and how it enables us

907
00:34:58,370 --> 00:34:55,139
to feel our way into the being of

908
00:34:59,930 --> 00:34:58,380
something other whereas fantasy Builds

909
00:35:01,910 --> 00:34:59,940
on the things that we already know

910
00:35:04,790 --> 00:35:01,920
putting them together yes putting them

911
00:35:07,070 --> 00:35:04,800
together in a new sort of way and and I

912
00:35:10,069 --> 00:35:07,080
use the analogy of those children's

913
00:35:13,250 --> 00:35:10,079

books in which there are animals and the

914

00:35:15,109 --> 00:35:13,260

pages are divided into three from top to

915

00:35:17,630 --> 00:35:15,119

bottom and you can turn over as many as

916

00:35:19,730 --> 00:35:17,640

you want of each part and you get the

917

00:35:22,550 --> 00:35:19,740

head of a goat and the body of a seal

918

00:35:24,349 --> 00:35:22,560

and the tale of a lion or something and

919

00:35:25,849 --> 00:35:24,359

and that's that's fantasy that's just

920

00:35:28,609 --> 00:35:25,859

putting together stuff that doesn't

921

00:35:31,010 --> 00:35:28,619

really exercise our imagination but

922

00:35:32,569 --> 00:35:31,020

words with famously with

923

00:35:35,810 --> 00:35:32,579

thought

924

00:35:37,550 --> 00:35:35,820

um in a way foolish risk being the

925

00:35:39,349 --> 00:35:37,560

person Wittgenstein said we all should

926
00:35:41,750 --> 00:35:39,359
be here For Heaven's Sake don't stop

927
00:35:43,609 --> 00:35:41,760
being foolish what he did was he looked

928
00:35:45,170 --> 00:35:43,619
at a very

929
00:35:47,030 --> 00:35:45,180
um Bleak looking

930
00:35:50,030 --> 00:35:47,040
Cliff or Rock

931
00:35:54,349 --> 00:35:50,040
and in his contemplation of it it became

932
00:35:56,870 --> 00:35:54,359
something more real than yes when we

933
00:35:58,609 --> 00:35:56,880
just look it's easy for us now at this

934
00:36:01,069 --> 00:35:58,619
stage in life and this is what words was

935
00:36:04,250 --> 00:36:01,079
wrote about in his own on informations

936
00:36:06,170 --> 00:36:04,260
of immortality that as we grow up we

937
00:36:08,270 --> 00:36:06,180
cease to be in immediate contact with

938
00:36:10,250 --> 00:36:08,280

things because we're in contact of our

939

00:36:12,470 --> 00:36:10,260

images of those things we have a

940

00:36:14,630 --> 00:36:12,480

category we go to a picturesque scene

941

00:36:16,790 --> 00:36:14,640

and instead of being completely blown

942

00:36:18,849 --> 00:36:16,800

away by the beauty of it we're already

943

00:36:21,290 --> 00:36:18,859

categorizing a picturesque scene

944

00:36:24,290 --> 00:36:21,300

mountains that's right a lake and so on

945

00:36:27,770 --> 00:36:24,300

and it's this process of getting beyond

946

00:36:30,109 --> 00:36:27,780

words and beginning Beyond a categorical

947

00:36:34,490 --> 00:36:30,119

thought towards the very experience that

948

00:36:40,130 --> 00:36:36,589

so I

949

00:36:41,930 --> 00:36:40,140

no I think that's right and for me

950

00:36:44,270 --> 00:36:41,940

um

951
00:36:47,569 --> 00:36:44,280
I'm not here to criticize woodsworth or

952
00:36:49,490 --> 00:36:47,579
or my favorite uh poet rilka who does

953
00:36:51,349 --> 00:36:49,500
something very similar uh a favorite

954
00:36:55,730 --> 00:36:51,359
person of mine as well by the way yes

955
00:36:59,030 --> 00:36:55,740
yeah yeah uh and uh but I guess for me

956
00:37:01,609 --> 00:36:59,040
part of the question becomes uh when I'm

957
00:37:03,670 --> 00:37:01,619
trying because I I not only I'm a

958
00:37:05,630 --> 00:37:03,680
scientist I'm also a person who's

959
00:37:08,150 --> 00:37:05,640
involved with a lot of these emerging

960
00:37:09,650 --> 00:37:08,160
communities in which people are trying

961
00:37:11,210 --> 00:37:09,660
um individually and collectively to

962
00:37:12,770 --> 00:37:11,220
build ecologies of practices for

963
00:37:14,210 --> 00:37:12,780

responding to the meeting crisis and

964

00:37:15,770 --> 00:37:14,220

doing it a good faith I'm not talking

965

00:37:16,910 --> 00:37:15,780

about the charlatans I'm not talking

966

00:37:18,650 --> 00:37:16,920

about the exploiters I'm not talking

967

00:37:21,770 --> 00:37:18,660

about the gurus I'm talking about people

968

00:37:23,950 --> 00:37:21,780

like Ray Kelly and uh and others uh and

969

00:37:26,630 --> 00:37:23,960

you know and I that recently with them

970

00:37:31,089 --> 00:37:26,640

in Vermont uh we're trying to organize

971

00:37:36,490 --> 00:37:33,950

why I bring that up is to me that the

972

00:37:40,010 --> 00:37:36,500

question becomes

973

00:37:43,550 --> 00:37:40,020

how do we

974

00:37:46,190 --> 00:37:43,560

reverse engineer and recommend practices

975

00:37:48,829 --> 00:37:46,200

for people individually and collectively

976

00:37:52,550 --> 00:37:48,839

such that this is recoverable to them

977

00:37:54,470 --> 00:37:52,560

not only in thought but in

978

00:37:56,930 --> 00:37:54,480

um actual

979

00:37:59,470 --> 00:37:56,940

conscious engagement with themselves

980

00:38:02,870 --> 00:37:59,480

other people in the world

981

00:38:05,390 --> 00:38:02,880

yeah okay great I'll start I'll quick go

982

00:38:07,370 --> 00:38:05,400

no no it's just I I've got a couple of

983

00:38:10,310 --> 00:38:07,380

thoughts about that

984

00:38:12,710 --> 00:38:10,320

um the first is that I don't think that

985

00:38:15,829 --> 00:38:12,720

practices in themselves will ever

986

00:38:19,190 --> 00:38:15,839

achieve what needs to happen because

987

00:38:20,890 --> 00:38:19,200

they can still go on without the mind

988

00:38:23,030 --> 00:38:20,900

and heart of the person having

989

00:38:26,810 --> 00:38:23,040

fundamentally shifted

990

00:38:30,890 --> 00:38:26,820

and in a way the reason the religions

991

00:38:33,230 --> 00:38:30,900

have rituals and practices is that if

992

00:38:35,630 --> 00:38:33,240

you think your way into feeling those

993

00:38:37,370 --> 00:38:35,640

things eventually eventually and live

994

00:38:39,710 --> 00:38:37,380

them in your life then things will begin

995

00:38:42,230 --> 00:38:39,720

to change but I'm worried that

996

00:38:44,750 --> 00:38:42,240

recommending practices to people like if

997

00:38:47,569 --> 00:38:44,760

you do so much meditation per day and if

998

00:38:49,010 --> 00:38:47,579

you you know spend so long in nature and

999

00:38:50,690 --> 00:38:49,020

you spend so long listening to music

1000

00:38:53,329 --> 00:38:50,700

there's nothing wrong with any of these

1001

00:38:55,190 --> 00:38:53,339

things but the trouble is that as

1002

00:38:58,010 --> 00:38:55,200

Einstein said we can't get out of the

1003

00:38:59,690 --> 00:38:58,020

particular mess we've produced with the

1004

00:39:01,790 --> 00:38:59,700

same thinking that got us into it in the

1005

00:39:04,430 --> 00:39:01,800

first place and so we need to shift

1006

00:39:09,230 --> 00:39:04,440

entirely what we

1007

00:39:11,750 --> 00:39:09,240

um meaning by meaning and another point

1008

00:39:13,190 --> 00:39:11,760

that occurs to me is these these people

1009

00:39:16,250 --> 00:39:13,200

that you mentioned that are not

1010

00:39:19,310 --> 00:39:16,260

charlatans and have something wise to

1011

00:39:22,670 --> 00:39:19,320

say I think it's an enormous load to

1012

00:39:25,670 --> 00:39:22,680

place on any one individual that their

1013

00:39:30,650 --> 00:39:25,680

ideas their practices their set of

1014

00:39:33,589 --> 00:39:30,660

whatever it is can really reach wisdom

1015

00:39:36,609 --> 00:39:33,599

in the way that

1016

00:39:40,849 --> 00:39:36,619

a tradition that has

1017

00:39:44,089 --> 00:39:40,859

absorbed and evolved with and changed in

1018

00:39:46,849 --> 00:39:44,099

the process ideas of many many people

1019

00:39:49,790 --> 00:39:46,859

wise people who live before us that is

1020

00:39:52,609 --> 00:39:49,800

more likely in the end to distill wisdom

1021

00:39:54,710 --> 00:39:52,619

which is why I think that I don't think

1022

00:39:57,410 --> 00:39:54,720

it's necessarily very easy to do that's

1023

00:39:59,089 --> 00:39:57,420

not impossible but to do it without some

1024

00:40:02,150 --> 00:39:59,099

sort of a tradition it doesn't have to

1025

00:40:04,250 --> 00:40:02,160

be Christianity of course it might be

1026

00:40:07,069 --> 00:40:04,260

um none of the monotheistic religions

1027

00:40:08,750 --> 00:40:07,079

good as they are it might be Daoism or

1028

00:40:10,730 --> 00:40:08,760

Buddhism and so on with their history

1029

00:40:12,190 --> 00:40:10,740

with their teachings with their Parables

1030

00:40:14,329 --> 00:40:12,200

with their practice

1031

00:40:16,849 --> 00:40:14,339

it's just it's I'm a little more

1032

00:40:19,370 --> 00:40:16,859

cautious about the idea that either you

1033

00:40:21,530 --> 00:40:19,380

or I however break we are can sort of

1034

00:40:23,270 --> 00:40:21,540

really take it upon ourselves to

1035

00:40:25,069 --> 00:40:23,280

recommend to people how they can acquire

1036

00:40:26,990 --> 00:40:25,079

wisdom in fact one of the points about

1037

00:40:29,150 --> 00:40:27,000

wisdom is it can't be acquired according

1038

00:40:30,950 --> 00:40:29,160

to any process

1039

00:40:32,870 --> 00:40:30,960

okay this sounds like a great point of

1040

00:40:34,010 --> 00:40:32,880

disagreement as much as there are

1041

00:40:35,630 --> 00:40:34,020

agreements because I know you have

1042

00:40:37,310 --> 00:40:35,640

non-theism which sounds like well why

1043

00:40:38,810 --> 00:40:37,320

don't you explain what non-theism is or

1044

00:40:40,130 --> 00:40:38,820

if you want to respond to that John well

1045

00:40:42,470 --> 00:40:40,140

I do want to respond to it first of all

1046

00:40:45,770 --> 00:40:42,480

I I wasn't proposing practices in place

1047

00:40:47,150 --> 00:40:45,780

of also fundamental philosophy I was

1048

00:40:50,810 --> 00:40:47,160

practicing I was proposing something

1049

00:40:52,910 --> 00:40:50,820

very much like what you see in stoicism

1050

00:40:54,829 --> 00:40:52,920

um in which or in Buddhism or in

1051
00:40:57,589 --> 00:40:54,839
neoplatanism you have both a fundamental

1052
00:40:58,970 --> 00:40:57,599
philosophy and a set of practices that

1053
00:41:01,069 --> 00:40:58,980
are integrated together

1054
00:41:03,829 --> 00:41:01,079
um and I also think whatever that

1055
00:41:05,810 --> 00:41:03,839
integration is also has to be in deep

1056
00:41:08,569 --> 00:41:05,820
and good faith dialogue with science

1057
00:41:10,190 --> 00:41:08,579
especially uh the the cognitive Sciences

1058
00:41:12,470 --> 00:41:10,200
because those are what I would call

1059
00:41:14,270 --> 00:41:12,480
cognitive science because those are the

1060
00:41:15,950 --> 00:41:14,280
ones directed towards helping us

1061
00:41:17,270 --> 00:41:15,960
understand the very processes of meaning

1062
00:41:19,310 --> 00:41:17,280
making

1063
00:41:22,250 --> 00:41:19,320

um so that's the first part of the

1064

00:41:24,170 --> 00:41:22,260

response I I think and that's exactly

1065

00:41:25,329 --> 00:41:24,180

what I'm trying to offer I'm trying and

1066

00:41:27,829 --> 00:41:25,339

this is how

1067

00:41:30,050 --> 00:41:27,839

a lot of these people are taking this

1068

00:41:32,750 --> 00:41:30,060

taking these practices out they're not

1069

00:41:35,510 --> 00:41:32,760

taking them up as just Panacea practices

1070

00:41:37,550 --> 00:41:35,520

they're taking it up as oh no no no we

1071

00:41:41,270 --> 00:41:37,560

need to be doing uh we need to be doing

1072

00:41:43,010 --> 00:41:41,280

a lot of attentional sensory motor a lot

1073

00:41:45,829 --> 00:41:43,020

of stuff and a lot of philosophical

1074

00:41:47,930 --> 00:41:45,839

reflection and a lot of dialogue if

1075

00:41:49,790 --> 00:41:47,940

we're going to get something and

1076

00:41:52,069 --> 00:41:49,800

properly

1077

00:41:54,589 --> 00:41:52,079

um enter into dialogue with the existing

1078

00:41:57,170 --> 00:41:54,599

wisdom Traditions so that's part of what

1079

00:41:59,990 --> 00:41:57,180

I meant by uh how these communities are

1080

00:42:01,370 --> 00:42:00,000

working uh for example I was at uh this

1081

00:42:03,410 --> 00:42:01,380

conference was being held at the maple

1082

00:42:05,870 --> 00:42:03,420

monastic Academy which comes out of the

1083

00:42:08,450 --> 00:42:05,880

Zen tradition is deeply influenced by it

1084

00:42:10,310 --> 00:42:08,460

but wants to talk to uh some of the you

1085

00:42:12,349 --> 00:42:10,320

know some of these emerging uh

1086

00:42:13,670 --> 00:42:12,359

communities that have come out of out of

1087

00:42:15,109 --> 00:42:13,680

other traditions

1088

00:42:16,609 --> 00:42:15,119

secondly

1089

00:42:21,730 --> 00:42:16,619

um

1090

00:42:26,450 --> 00:42:21,740

uh I do think uh and we I do think that

1091

00:42:28,250 --> 00:42:26,460

we are in a place that might be like the

1092

00:42:31,490 --> 00:42:28,260

place where some of these

1093

00:42:34,370 --> 00:42:31,500

and this is a this is this is uh a

1094

00:42:36,470 --> 00:42:34,380

somewhat Preposterous proposal uh but

1095

00:42:40,250 --> 00:42:36,480

it's a historical I think we're in a

1096

00:42:42,230 --> 00:42:40,260

Kairos I think we're at a pivot point uh

1097

00:42:44,150 --> 00:42:42,240

in our civilization because I think the

1098

00:42:47,930 --> 00:42:44,160

meaning crisis

1099

00:42:51,170 --> 00:42:47,940

um weakens us disables us in the face of

1100

00:42:52,910 --> 00:42:51,180

addressing the meta crisis uh in in many

1101

00:42:55,010 --> 00:42:52,920

powerful ways

1102

00:42:57,170 --> 00:42:55,020

um and and then the meta crisis feeds

1103

00:42:58,970 --> 00:42:57,180

back and makes the world seem Bleak and

1104

00:43:01,130 --> 00:42:58,980

in ahospitable for people wrestling with

1105

00:43:03,170 --> 00:43:01,140

meaning so I think they're interlocked

1106

00:43:05,510 --> 00:43:03,180

and so I think we're in a Kairos because

1107

00:43:07,609 --> 00:43:05,520

I do think actress is real and

1108

00:43:09,710 --> 00:43:07,619

accelerating and I do think the capacity

1109

00:43:11,210 --> 00:43:09,720

for social media to misdirect us is real

1110

00:43:14,930 --> 00:43:11,220

and accelerating

1111

00:43:16,849 --> 00:43:14,940

so my point is when we're in a Kairos we

1112

00:43:19,550 --> 00:43:16,859

may need to give birth to something new

1113

00:43:22,370 --> 00:43:19,560

all of these other great traditions did

1114

00:43:25,190 --> 00:43:22,380

start somewhere you know Socrates of the

1115

00:43:26,630 --> 00:43:25,200

neoplatonic tradition Jesus and the

1116

00:43:29,390 --> 00:43:26,640

Christian tradition Muhammad and the

1117

00:43:32,030 --> 00:43:29,400

Islamic tradition I'm not claiming to be

1118

00:43:34,490 --> 00:43:32,040

any of these speakers and I I will not

1119

00:43:36,530 --> 00:43:34,500

accept any any attempt uh job

1120

00:43:39,050 --> 00:43:36,540

description of that for me what do you

1121

00:43:41,390 --> 00:43:39,060

do it but but I know and nor do I think

1122

00:43:44,450 --> 00:43:41,400

that any of these I know Ray Ferry uh

1123

00:43:46,670 --> 00:43:44,460

for example rape rape as part of his

1124

00:43:49,670 --> 00:43:46,680

practice make sure that he steps out of

1125

00:43:51,290 --> 00:43:49,680

the leadership role other people he also

1126
00:43:53,270 --> 00:43:51,300
does not see him none none of the people

1127
00:43:55,790 --> 00:43:53,280
are talking to see themselves what they

1128
00:43:59,329 --> 00:43:55,800
do think is that something is emerging

1129
00:44:02,450 --> 00:43:59,339
right now and because of the urgency of

1130
00:44:05,770 --> 00:44:02,460
the situation uh we should

1131
00:44:09,410 --> 00:44:05,780
try to interact with it as best we can

1132
00:44:12,470 --> 00:44:09,420
uh to try and see if we can steer it to

1133
00:44:15,050 --> 00:44:12,480
becoming something that is a viable

1134
00:44:18,170 --> 00:44:15,060
response for the growing demographic

1135
00:44:20,870 --> 00:44:18,180
group of people who cannot find the

1136
00:44:22,370 --> 00:44:20,880
Legacy religions a proper home for the

1137
00:44:24,530 --> 00:44:22,380
cultivation of wisdom so that would be

1138
00:44:26,030 --> 00:44:24,540

my response

1139

00:44:27,890 --> 00:44:26,040

yes

1140

00:44:28,910 --> 00:44:27,900

but I I wouldn't really disagree with

1141

00:44:31,849 --> 00:44:28,920

that and thank you for your

1142

00:44:34,490 --> 00:44:31,859

clarification right um which really just

1143

00:44:37,670 --> 00:44:34,500

confirms and what I hoped that you might

1144

00:44:39,530 --> 00:44:37,680

say about because it was really more a

1145

00:44:41,630 --> 00:44:39,540

clarification because I think it's easy

1146

00:44:43,970 --> 00:44:41,640

for people to think I'm often asked you

1147

00:44:45,589 --> 00:44:43,980

know after lecturing so what do we do

1148

00:44:48,589 --> 00:44:45,599

right away you know what do we do now

1149

00:44:51,290 --> 00:44:48,599

yes and yeah and it's like the left

1150

00:44:52,970 --> 00:44:51,300

hemisphere's job is to solve an

1151

00:44:54,829 --> 00:44:52,980

immediate problem and it wants eight

1152

00:44:55,730 --> 00:44:54,839

bullet points and if we can do all of

1153

00:44:58,910 --> 00:44:55,740

those

1154

00:45:01,430 --> 00:44:58,920

phew we can carry on business as usual

1155

00:45:04,069 --> 00:45:01,440

but my message is we cannot conceivably

1156

00:45:06,530 --> 00:45:04,079

carry on business as usual and I'm not

1157

00:45:09,230 --> 00:45:06,540

talking about anything that can be

1158

00:45:12,050 --> 00:45:09,240

um summed up as a series of um steps

1159

00:45:13,550 --> 00:45:12,060

that we should take there are steps that

1160

00:45:16,430 --> 00:45:13,560

we should take that are very practical

1161

00:45:18,950 --> 00:45:16,440

we must stop poisoning the oceans we

1162

00:45:20,210 --> 00:45:18,960

must stop destroying the forest we must

1163

00:45:22,190 --> 00:45:20,220

stop

1164

00:45:24,650 --> 00:45:22,200

um extinguishing the ways of life of

1165

00:45:25,970 --> 00:45:24,660

indigenous peoples we there's many many

1166

00:45:28,670 --> 00:45:25,980

things we should do we should stop

1167

00:45:30,770 --> 00:45:28,680

basically attacking and destroying all

1168

00:45:32,930 --> 00:45:30,780

that's best actually out of our own

1169

00:45:35,990 --> 00:45:32,940

civilization there are many things that

1170

00:45:37,849 --> 00:45:36,000

we we need to do rather urgently but

1171

00:45:40,609 --> 00:45:37,859

that's not really what I'm saying I'm

1172

00:45:43,190 --> 00:45:40,619

saying we need to think about the

1173

00:45:45,370 --> 00:45:43,200

business of thinking and what we mean by

1174

00:45:47,870 --> 00:45:45,380

meaning and that these need to be

1175

00:45:50,230 --> 00:45:47,880

reconceived and the way that I like to

1176

00:45:54,050 --> 00:45:50,240

reconceive them is by

1177

00:45:56,030 --> 00:45:54,060

unfailing over a long stretches we both

1178

00:45:59,569 --> 00:45:56,040

acknowledge and I apologize for the

1179

00:46:02,329 --> 00:45:59,579

length of what I write but over a long

1180

00:46:04,370 --> 00:46:02,339

stretch but but yeah right you're a good

1181

00:46:06,290 --> 00:46:04,380

writer so I mean I I don't I don't want

1182

00:46:08,750 --> 00:46:06,300

people I don't want people to be put off

1183

00:46:10,550 --> 00:46:08,760

by that I I mean so I just wanted to

1184

00:46:12,950 --> 00:46:10,560

sorry for interrupting but I don't I

1185

00:46:15,770 --> 00:46:12,960

know I I we both did yeah it's a long

1186

00:46:17,510 --> 00:46:15,780

book but you're a good writer uh so I

1187

00:46:19,490 --> 00:46:17,520

don't yeah I don't want people to be put

1188

00:46:22,450 --> 00:46:19,500

off by that anytime you want to

1189

00:46:25,910 --> 00:46:22,460

interject a compliment of course

1190

00:46:27,890 --> 00:46:25,920

but really what I'm saying is that I

1191

00:46:29,329 --> 00:46:27,900

think it's a question of at the

1192

00:46:31,190 --> 00:46:29,339

beginning of the book I say in a very

1193

00:46:33,950 --> 00:46:31,200

short note to the reader which is only a

1194

00:46:35,630 --> 00:46:33,960

page and a half long I I think of it as

1195

00:46:37,130 --> 00:46:35,640

taking somebody on a journey from which

1196

00:46:39,829 --> 00:46:37,140

they can see something from different

1197

00:46:43,210 --> 00:46:39,839

perspectives and that that will in

1198

00:46:46,550 --> 00:46:43,220

itself bring about a kind of aha moment

1199

00:46:48,470 --> 00:46:46,560

wow this is how it looks from here

1200

00:46:50,030 --> 00:46:48,480

and it's not because I've explained

1201
00:46:52,490 --> 00:46:50,040
something and asked you to ascend to a

1202
00:46:55,970 --> 00:46:52,500
proposition it's because I have

1203
00:46:58,609 --> 00:46:55,980
suggested I have indicated I've taken

1204
00:47:00,890 --> 00:46:58,619
places I'm going to go over in a vast

1205
00:47:03,890 --> 00:47:00,900
array of things from literature from art

1206
00:47:06,290 --> 00:47:03,900
from Philosophy from you know all the

1207
00:47:08,030 --> 00:47:06,300
rest but I think it's that process of

1208
00:47:11,390 --> 00:47:08,040
actually guiding people towards a

1209
00:47:14,030 --> 00:47:11,400
different position that I think is key

1210
00:47:15,290 --> 00:47:14,040
I agree and for me that's the that's

1211
00:47:17,270 --> 00:47:15,300
where we're getting into perspectival

1212
00:47:19,150 --> 00:47:17,280
and participatory knowing as opposed to

1213
00:47:22,370 --> 00:47:19,160

propositional ascent

1214

00:47:24,170 --> 00:47:22,380

and I and thank you for agreeing with my

1215

00:47:26,390 --> 00:47:24,180

clarification I just want to uh

1216

00:47:29,450 --> 00:47:26,400

reciprocate I definitely did not mean a

1217

00:47:32,450 --> 00:47:29,460

bullet point I think DC Schindler he he

1218

00:47:34,069 --> 00:47:32,460

indicates that that is one of the uh in

1219

00:47:35,390 --> 00:47:34,079

his uh Plato's critique of Imperial

1220

00:47:37,790 --> 00:47:35,400

reason he indicates that's one of the

1221

00:47:40,309 --> 00:47:37,800

markers of Mythology the hatred of the

1222

00:47:43,010 --> 00:47:40,319

logos which is right a kind of

1223

00:47:45,410 --> 00:47:43,020

intellectual impatience uh a profound

1224

00:47:46,910 --> 00:47:45,420

kind of no I'm talking about that the

1225

00:47:50,630 --> 00:47:46,920

only thing that will resolve the meaning

1226

00:47:52,609 --> 00:47:50,640

crisis is a way of life the way

1227

00:47:55,609 --> 00:47:52,619

kirkegaard and beckenstein and soccer

1228

00:47:59,170 --> 00:47:55,619

exactly meant it to be but the problem

1229

00:48:00,950 --> 00:47:59,180

I'm saying is uh where do people go

1230

00:48:02,589 --> 00:48:00,960

to get

1231

00:48:06,849 --> 00:48:02,599

you know

1232

00:48:10,849 --> 00:48:06,859

the sets of practices Transformations

1233

00:48:12,950 --> 00:48:10,859

and community relations that afford them

1234

00:48:15,230 --> 00:48:12,960

entering into a new way of life that's

1235

00:48:17,329 --> 00:48:15,240

for me the pressing question uh and

1236

00:48:20,150 --> 00:48:17,339

that's what I'm trying to and as I see

1237

00:48:23,030 --> 00:48:20,160

people trying to commit create ways of

1238

00:48:24,410 --> 00:48:23,040

life within communities and a

1239

00:48:26,710 --> 00:48:24,420

reconciliation with the scientific

1240

00:48:29,450 --> 00:48:26,720

worldview such that they can be properly

1241

00:48:31,130 --> 00:48:29,460

cosmically homed and that's that's what

1242

00:48:34,370 --> 00:48:31,140

grabs my interest that's what I want to

1243

00:48:38,109 --> 00:48:34,380

try and support yes and I if I may I'd

1244

00:48:41,390 --> 00:48:38,119

like to emphasize the idea of a way

1245

00:48:44,690 --> 00:48:41,400

as never completed and always being

1246

00:48:46,630 --> 00:48:44,700

newly undertaken so it is a it's a

1247

00:48:49,430 --> 00:48:46,640

process I I I

1248

00:48:52,430 --> 00:48:49,440

happen to believe that all the things we

1249

00:48:54,290 --> 00:48:52,440

call things are in fact in process and

1250

00:48:58,069 --> 00:48:54,300

that it's therefore very important to

1251
00:48:59,990 --> 00:48:58,079
see that process because when we talk

1252
00:49:02,150 --> 00:49:00,000
about a way and needing a way and of

1253
00:49:03,890 --> 00:49:02,160
course Daoism is named after that way

1254
00:49:05,809 --> 00:49:03,900
which is a practice that needs to be

1255
00:49:08,270 --> 00:49:05,819
lived and when

1256
00:49:10,490 --> 00:49:08,280
um Christ said I am the way the truth

1257
00:49:12,410 --> 00:49:10,500
and the life he didn't mean once you

1258
00:49:16,970 --> 00:49:12,420
believe in me you got it he meant there

1259
00:49:19,370 --> 00:49:16,980
is a way yes you can enter into through

1260
00:49:21,290 --> 00:49:19,380
so we believe in what he was teaching

1261
00:49:24,130 --> 00:49:21,300
and in what he showed by his example

1262
00:49:27,109 --> 00:49:24,140
that would take one where one wishes to

1263
00:49:28,849 --> 00:49:27,119

go I deeply agree with that so much so

1264

00:49:31,430 --> 00:49:28,859

that I have said please carve on my

1265

00:49:34,370 --> 00:49:31,440

Tombstone neither Nostalgia nor Utopia I

1266

00:49:37,670 --> 00:49:34,380

do not think uh anything that claims to

1267

00:49:39,290 --> 00:49:37,680

have a total grip and a resolution in

1268

00:49:41,870 --> 00:49:39,300

fact and perhaps this will slide into

1269

00:49:45,290 --> 00:49:41,880

the topic I think we need to think of

1270

00:49:48,109 --> 00:49:45,300

the sacred as an inexhaustible source of

1271

00:49:50,349 --> 00:49:48,119

intelligibility rather than as some

1272

00:49:53,030 --> 00:49:50,359

state of perfection

1273

00:49:54,349 --> 00:49:53,040

you know I I didn't think we'd find much

1274

00:49:56,390 --> 00:49:54,359

to discuss there because we're

1275

00:49:59,329 --> 00:49:56,400

completely in agreement about that I

1276

00:50:00,890 --> 00:49:59,339

just wanted to say for me uh that's

1277

00:50:04,309 --> 00:50:00,900

exact that's exactly what I see

1278

00:50:06,050 --> 00:50:04,319

exemplified I mean that you know you

1279

00:50:07,670 --> 00:50:06,060

know people talk about the Socratic

1280

00:50:09,890 --> 00:50:07,680

method there's no such thing there is a

1281

00:50:14,210 --> 00:50:09,900

Socratic way there's a Socratic way of

1282

00:50:15,829 --> 00:50:14,220

life and and Socrates was so uh faithful

1283

00:50:18,650 --> 00:50:15,839

to that way of life that he was willing

1284

00:50:21,050 --> 00:50:18,660

to die for it but he does he undermines

1285

00:50:23,690 --> 00:50:21,060

all attempts to replace what he's doing

1286

00:50:26,630 --> 00:50:23,700

uh with a method or any sort of

1287

00:50:30,410 --> 00:50:26,640

totalizing vision and so for me and

1288

00:50:31,910 --> 00:50:30,420

again I practice uh uh like I don't

1289

00:50:35,150 --> 00:50:31,920

consider myself a Taoist but I've been

1290

00:50:38,329 --> 00:50:35,160

practicing Tai teach one and qikang uh

1291

00:50:40,970 --> 00:50:38,339

or for close to three decades and and

1292

00:50:42,950 --> 00:50:40,980

towards a point I was making earlier I I

1293

00:50:44,329 --> 00:50:42,960

don't let me say it this way I don't

1294

00:50:46,430 --> 00:50:44,339

think you should do tai chi Schwan

1295

00:50:47,990 --> 00:50:46,440

without ruling the Tate Chan but I also

1296

00:50:50,690 --> 00:50:48,000

think you shouldn't do telltheh read the

1297

00:50:52,730 --> 00:50:50,700

touth HM without doing patience one uh

1298

00:50:55,130 --> 00:50:52,740

because for me that's like reading the

1299

00:50:57,349 --> 00:50:55,140

Kama Sutra and never making love you you

1300

00:51:00,710 --> 00:50:57,359

really are you really aren't getting and

1301

00:51:03,109 --> 00:51:00,720

putting the two together and so

1302

00:51:05,270 --> 00:51:03,119

I I'm interested then if you agree with

1303

00:51:08,210 --> 00:51:05,280

me that

1304

00:51:09,430 --> 00:51:08,220

and by the way having a process view of

1305

00:51:11,870 --> 00:51:09,440

reality

1306

00:51:14,390 --> 00:51:11,880

you'd probably also influenced by

1307

00:51:15,430 --> 00:51:14,400

Whitehead as as I am

1308

00:51:19,730 --> 00:51:15,440

um

1309

00:51:22,670 --> 00:51:19,740

and right and and the idea that all all

1310

00:51:24,829 --> 00:51:22,680

that part of what is needed

1311

00:51:27,670 --> 00:51:24,839

and this is part of What's

1312

00:51:31,010 --> 00:51:27,680

um the the third wave scholarship around

1313

00:51:33,049 --> 00:51:31,020

uh neoplatonism and things like that but

1314

00:51:35,030 --> 00:51:33,059

is to

1315

00:51:37,849 --> 00:51:35,040

get out of a thingy way of thinking

1316

00:51:39,290 --> 00:51:37,859

absolutely well that's that's why my

1317

00:51:41,990 --> 00:51:39,300

latest book is called the matter with

1318

00:51:44,210 --> 00:51:42,000

things it's a pound on a whole range of

1319

00:51:45,829 --> 00:51:44,220

things to do with uh so I didn't get I

1320

00:51:48,109 --> 00:51:45,839

didn't get that second part I got the

1321

00:51:49,670 --> 00:51:48,119

matter a obsession with matter and our

1322

00:51:52,549 --> 00:51:49,680

obsession with things and the matter

1323

00:51:55,309 --> 00:51:52,559

with things now so it tries to bring

1324

00:51:57,710 --> 00:51:55,319

together a number of elements but I I

1325

00:52:00,309 --> 00:51:57,720

just wanted to also throw it into the

1326
00:52:03,589 --> 00:52:00,319
mix and see if you agree with me here

1327
00:52:07,670 --> 00:52:03,599
that a lot of what we've been talking

1328
00:52:10,490 --> 00:52:07,680
about is predicated typically for the

1329
00:52:13,609 --> 00:52:10,500
Western mind on the idea that there are

1330
00:52:16,210 --> 00:52:13,619
things good things that we can do

1331
00:52:18,890 --> 00:52:16,220
and I I

1332
00:52:22,730 --> 00:52:18,900
always think that we need to be careful

1333
00:52:24,829 --> 00:52:22,740
of thinking that it's doing that causes

1334
00:52:28,609 --> 00:52:24,839
change it may be

1335
00:52:31,069 --> 00:52:28,619
receiving and yes yes and there is

1336
00:52:33,770 --> 00:52:31,079
something that I choose the term active

1337
00:52:36,890 --> 00:52:33,780
passivity which is not just a kind of

1338
00:52:40,490 --> 00:52:36,900

let it all hang out thing but actually a

1339

00:52:41,990 --> 00:52:40,500

disciplined attention to the world

1340

00:52:44,150 --> 00:52:42,000

um I always come back to attention

1341

00:52:46,309 --> 00:52:44,160

because I believe it's a moral act and

1342

00:52:48,770 --> 00:52:46,319

changes the world and changes

1343

00:52:51,829 --> 00:52:48,780

us who do the attending so it's a very

1344

00:52:55,309 --> 00:52:51,839

very important thing and in that open

1345

00:52:57,170 --> 00:52:55,319

attending we come to hear things and we

1346

00:52:59,210 --> 00:52:57,180

can crowd them out I sometimes give the

1347

00:53:01,430 --> 00:52:59,220

image of a you know a gardener not

1348

00:53:04,370 --> 00:53:01,440

actually being able to make a plant of

1349

00:53:06,950 --> 00:53:04,380

course definitely no but what a gardener

1350

00:53:09,349 --> 00:53:06,960

can do is allow the plant to be stifled

1351
00:53:11,270 --> 00:53:09,359
or remove things that would get in the

1352
00:53:13,069 --> 00:53:11,280
way of the plants thriving and that's

1353
00:53:14,210 --> 00:53:13,079
really what a gardener is and we are

1354
00:53:17,750 --> 00:53:14,220
like that

1355
00:53:21,349 --> 00:53:17,760
shoes and spiritual depth and meaning

1356
00:53:25,270 --> 00:53:21,359
and wisdom come to us and we either

1357
00:53:29,870 --> 00:53:25,280
drive them out with our noisy uh

1358
00:53:31,670 --> 00:53:29,880
logicizing and rationalizing and what

1359
00:53:34,970 --> 00:53:31,680
they call Monkey mind as you know in

1360
00:53:37,970 --> 00:53:34,980
yeah yeah in Oriental traditions and

1361
00:53:39,349 --> 00:53:37,980
instead we should cultivate silence

1362
00:53:42,530 --> 00:53:39,359
really it's one of the things I like

1363
00:53:45,829 --> 00:53:42,540

about where I live on sky is it's a

1364

00:53:48,710 --> 00:53:45,839

you know probably silent

1365

00:53:50,510 --> 00:53:48,720

so in the analogy with the plants The

1366

00:53:52,490 --> 00:53:50,520

Gardener is doing something though

1367

00:53:54,950 --> 00:53:52,500

you're making an analogy about attention

1368

00:53:56,210 --> 00:53:54,960

so is there another analogy where it

1369

00:53:58,130 --> 00:53:56,220

doesn't require doing because you're

1370

00:54:00,589 --> 00:53:58,140

trying to show the act itself is not

1371

00:54:03,349 --> 00:54:00,599

what we should be pursuing you you you

1372

00:54:05,410 --> 00:54:03,359

you're very good to pick that up and I

1373

00:54:08,750 --> 00:54:05,420

was hoping that you wouldn't

1374

00:54:10,569 --> 00:54:08,760

uh it is it's just like being

1375

00:54:15,109 --> 00:54:10,579

um well I think actually

1376

00:54:17,750 --> 00:54:15,119

you know teaching is is a responsive

1377

00:54:20,510 --> 00:54:17,760

business so partly you are saying things

1378

00:54:23,390 --> 00:54:20,520

but partly you're also receiving things

1379

00:54:27,290 --> 00:54:23,400

and there's an exchange and I think that

1380

00:54:30,170 --> 00:54:27,300

a proper Gardener attends to what the

1381

00:54:32,410 --> 00:54:30,180

gardener is looking at but doesn't rush

1382

00:54:34,849 --> 00:54:32,420

in there kind of I mean

1383

00:54:36,650 --> 00:54:34,859

pulling it up to see whether it's root

1384

00:54:38,750 --> 00:54:36,660

system is working properly according to

1385

00:54:40,849 --> 00:54:38,760

the science is not a good way to improve

1386

00:54:43,130 --> 00:54:40,859

the life of a plug so there's a certain

1387

00:54:46,430 --> 00:54:43,140

degree of standing off I think is the

1388

00:54:48,530 --> 00:54:46,440

way I would put it of holding back of

1389

00:54:54,730 --> 00:54:48,540

being careful to observe rather than

1390

00:55:01,150 --> 00:54:56,809

no I was just going to say that it's

1391

00:55:06,349 --> 00:55:04,010

rings a bell for me as a doctor because

1392

00:55:07,790 --> 00:55:06,359

in my training I was constantly told I

1393

00:55:10,670 --> 00:55:07,800

mean although doctors are always doing

1394

00:55:12,770 --> 00:55:10,680

things that first of all one shouldn't

1395

00:55:15,950 --> 00:55:12,780

rush in and apply things

1396

00:55:17,930 --> 00:55:15,960

um but also that in making a diagnosis

1397

00:55:19,250 --> 00:55:17,940

the first thing to do is to stand back

1398

00:55:21,950 --> 00:55:19,260

and look

1399

00:55:24,710 --> 00:55:21,960

and allow things to come to observe

1400

00:55:28,910 --> 00:55:24,720

things and only then do you even lay a

1401

00:55:31,069 --> 00:55:28,920

finger on a patient and only as a last

1402

00:55:33,770 --> 00:55:31,079

resort do you send for an um an

1403

00:55:35,930 --> 00:55:33,780

investigation to confirm or disconfirm

1404

00:55:38,210 --> 00:55:35,940

the conclusion you've received so even

1405

00:55:39,890 --> 00:55:38,220

somebody as Interventional as a doctor

1406

00:55:42,410 --> 00:55:39,900

if they're going to be good has to be

1407

00:55:43,910 --> 00:55:42,420

able to receive things and there's a

1408

00:55:45,410 --> 00:55:43,920

psychiatrist of course which is what I

1409

00:55:47,690 --> 00:55:45,420

ended up at

1410

00:55:49,730 --> 00:55:47,700

um that's doubly true

1411

00:55:51,470 --> 00:55:49,740

okay I want to respond because I do

1412

00:55:53,930 --> 00:55:51,480

think cultivation is actually excellent

1413

00:55:55,549 --> 00:55:53,940

uh a metaphor

1414

00:55:57,950 --> 00:55:55,559

um and I I if you'll notice I always say

1415

00:55:59,809 --> 00:55:57,960

the cultivation of wisdom I'm very

1416

00:56:02,450 --> 00:55:59,819

careful about that for precisely that

1417

00:56:05,870 --> 00:56:02,460

reason

1418

00:56:08,150 --> 00:56:05,880

um and so uh first of all the the uh you

1419

00:56:10,370 --> 00:56:08,160

know conversions across very different

1420

00:56:11,990 --> 00:56:10,380

cultures at the heart of neoplatonism is

1421

00:56:13,549 --> 00:56:12,000

this idea of cultivating a profound

1422

00:56:15,950 --> 00:56:13,559

receptivity

1423

00:56:18,710 --> 00:56:15,960

um taoism you have Wu way which is the

1424

00:56:21,650 --> 00:56:18,720

profound uh receptivity I'll be liking

1425

00:56:23,690 --> 00:56:21,660

being like the uncarved block uh it's uh

1426

00:56:25,730 --> 00:56:23,700

at slingerland's book trying not to try

1427

00:56:27,530 --> 00:56:25,740

and that's what I would say to you Kurt

1428

00:56:29,210 --> 00:56:27,540

um the doing is a doing that undermines

1429

00:56:30,950 --> 00:56:29,220

itself is doing

1430

00:56:32,990 --> 00:56:30,960

um which sounds like a paradox but when

1431

00:56:34,609 --> 00:56:33,000

you do it like when when you if you want

1432

00:56:36,170 --> 00:56:34,619

to get into the Flow State and you keep

1433

00:56:38,030 --> 00:56:36,180

trying to get into the Flow State you

1434

00:56:41,450 --> 00:56:38,040

will never get into the Flow State it

1435

00:56:44,390 --> 00:56:41,460

doesn't mean being limply passive you

1436

00:56:46,430 --> 00:56:44,400

have to do in a way that undermines it

1437

00:56:49,790 --> 00:56:46,440

as a doing so that you find yourself

1438

00:56:52,130 --> 00:56:49,800

caught up in the Flow State and then you

1439

00:56:54,109 --> 00:56:52,140

flow which is not something you do it is

1440

00:56:56,210 --> 00:56:54,119

something you participate in and I think

1441

00:56:58,309 --> 00:56:56,220

getting that what stigmire calls that

1442

00:57:01,130 --> 00:56:58,319

proper orientation which is I think what

1443

00:57:03,109 --> 00:57:01,140

ratio religio is is the the key thing

1444

00:57:04,370 --> 00:57:03,119

and that's Iris Murdoch in the

1445

00:57:06,950 --> 00:57:04,380

sovereignty of the good speaking from

1446

00:57:09,770 --> 00:57:06,960

the neoplatonic tradition right that the

1447

00:57:12,530 --> 00:57:09,780

most important moral act the the the the

1448

00:57:15,470 --> 00:57:12,540

core moral Act is how giving things

1449

00:57:18,049 --> 00:57:15,480

their proper attention uh and she makes

1450

00:57:20,329 --> 00:57:18,059

that argument as the key to ethics and

1451

00:57:22,250 --> 00:57:20,339

how it has been largely ignored by the

1452

00:57:25,250 --> 00:57:22,260

analytic ethical tradition that had been

1453

00:57:26,870 --> 00:57:25,260

growing up right in the 20th century and

1454

00:57:29,870 --> 00:57:26,880

and I think that is fundamentally right

1455

00:57:31,490 --> 00:57:29,880

I think uh and I think that and virtue

1456

00:57:33,950 --> 00:57:31,500

ethics I think is moving towards that

1457

00:57:35,870 --> 00:57:33,960

that and because Murdoch also said you

1458

00:57:37,190 --> 00:57:35,880

know love is when you when you finally

1459

00:57:40,190 --> 00:57:37,200

acknowledge that something other than

1460

00:57:44,510 --> 00:57:40,200

yourself is real and and right and so

1461

00:57:48,530 --> 00:57:44,520

it's this this this this ability to get

1462

00:57:52,430 --> 00:57:48,540

oneself into a a receptivity to flow

1463

00:57:55,670 --> 00:57:52,440

such that one is properly evolving one's

1464

00:57:58,549 --> 00:57:55,680

attention to conform

1465

00:58:02,329 --> 00:57:58,559

in the Aristotelian sense to the

1466

00:58:05,390 --> 00:58:02,339

ligaments of reality I think that's the

1467

00:58:06,410 --> 00:58:05,400

ultimate thing that uh uh I'm trying to

1468

00:58:09,230 --> 00:58:06,420

talk about a lot when I'm talking about

1469

00:58:12,349 --> 00:58:09,240

relevance realization and etc etc

1470

00:58:14,150 --> 00:58:12,359

yeah I I just like to add a little

1471

00:58:18,290 --> 00:58:14,160

um Rider to all of this which is that

1472

00:58:20,270 --> 00:58:18,300

there is way is puzzling to westerners

1473

00:58:24,049 --> 00:58:20,280

initially because it means not doing

1474

00:58:26,930 --> 00:58:24,059

basically and and there is a not doing

1475

00:58:29,089 --> 00:58:26,940

which is quite different from passively

1476

00:58:31,309 --> 00:58:29,099

not doing something that is the other

1477

00:58:33,349 --> 00:58:31,319

side of doing just as there's an

1478

00:58:35,569 --> 00:58:33,359

unknowing which is not ignorance that

1479

00:58:38,510 --> 00:58:35,579

comes before knowing but the unknowing

1480

00:58:40,370 --> 00:58:38,520

that comes after knowledge sure and

1481

00:58:42,289 --> 00:58:40,380

there's an innocence that is not the

1482

00:58:44,750 --> 00:58:42,299

same as the innocence of a child but an

1483

00:58:47,030 --> 00:58:44,760

innocence that can only come after deep

1484

00:58:49,849 --> 00:58:47,040

experience of life and is what one

1485

00:58:53,809 --> 00:58:49,859

recognizes in truly deep wise spiritual

1486

00:58:56,150 --> 00:58:53,819

figures I agree and uh I argue that you

1487

00:58:57,890 --> 00:58:56,160

know Socrates claiming that he knows

1488

00:59:00,530 --> 00:58:57,900

that he does not know comes to fruition

1489

00:59:04,730 --> 00:59:00,540

in Nicholas of kuza's learned ignorance

1490

00:59:08,210 --> 00:59:04,740

yes uh right exactly that and and yes

1491

00:59:11,089 --> 00:59:08,220

it's a it's a profound way of

1492

00:59:13,010 --> 00:59:11,099

and for me it's a profound way of being

1493

00:59:15,890 --> 00:59:13,020

able to exercise this discernment so

1494

00:59:19,250 --> 00:59:15,900

Titus talks about the the nothingness

1495

00:59:21,950 --> 00:59:19,260

that is a privation and then the no

1496

00:59:25,190 --> 00:59:21,960

thingness that is a superlative the

1497

00:59:27,650 --> 00:59:25,200

really real and that you need a certain

1498

00:59:30,349 --> 00:59:27,660

proper kind of educating of your

1499

00:59:33,170 --> 00:59:30,359

sensibility and receptivity to be able

1500

00:59:35,569 --> 00:59:33,180

to discern nothingness from No thingness

1501

00:59:37,970 --> 00:59:35,579

and when you could when you could do

1502

00:59:40,490 --> 00:59:37,980

that that leads to a very

1503

00:59:42,349 --> 00:59:40,500

well one of the most profound kinds of

1504

00:59:44,809 --> 00:59:42,359

connectedness there there can possibly

1505

00:59:48,049 --> 00:59:44,819

be and that emptiness

1506

00:59:50,809 --> 00:59:48,059

um yes that is uh famously

1507

00:59:53,390 --> 00:59:50,819

um sought through Buddhist practices is

1508

00:59:55,270 --> 00:59:53,400

isn't as you say is not an emptiness in

1509

00:59:59,569 --> 00:59:55,280

the sense of the just nothing nothing

1510

01:00:00,650 --> 00:59:59,579

too it's it's the uh the the word in

1511

01:00:01,910 --> 01:00:00,660

Sanskrit

1512

01:00:08,390 --> 01:00:01,920

um

1513

01:00:11,089 --> 01:00:08,400

seed that is swelling and it's interior

1514

01:00:13,190 --> 01:00:11,099

and life is coming forward or a womb The

1515

01:00:15,890 --> 01:00:13,200

Emptiness of a womb that will be the

1516

01:00:18,170 --> 01:00:15,900

fertile space exactly exactly and and

1517

01:00:21,049 --> 01:00:18,180

the root word for compassion in the

1518

01:00:24,950 --> 01:00:21,059

Hebrew tradition is being womb-like uh

1519

01:00:27,170 --> 01:00:24,960

for exactly the same uh yes so yeah

1520

01:00:29,390 --> 01:00:27,180

that's exactly it but the point I was

1521

01:00:31,910 --> 01:00:29,400

making is to your point about westerners

1522

01:00:33,710 --> 01:00:31,920

like you have to develop this isn't

1523

01:00:35,569 --> 01:00:33,720

quite the right word but if you'll allow

1524

01:00:37,370 --> 01:00:35,579

me to pour a lot through conveyance into

1525

01:00:39,770 --> 01:00:37,380

the word you have to develop the taste

1526

01:00:42,710 --> 01:00:39,780

for that difference

1527

01:00:44,510 --> 01:00:42,720

um and it's like it's not a thought it's

1528

01:00:48,170 --> 01:00:44,520

more of that I mean it requires thought

1529

01:00:50,450 --> 01:00:48,180

but it's more but like for me I D I

1530

01:00:53,089 --> 01:00:50,460

could not understand Wu way until I've

1531

01:00:56,630 --> 01:00:53,099

been practicing Tai Chi Chuan for like

1532

01:00:59,870 --> 01:00:56,640

over six years because when I started oh

1533

01:01:02,089 --> 01:00:59,880

that's it that's it there and and and

1534

01:01:04,250 --> 01:01:02,099

what's amazing is that's what comes out

1535

01:01:05,630 --> 01:01:04,260

when you're sparring if you try to spar

1536

01:01:07,910 --> 01:01:05,640

you'll lose

1537

01:01:09,549 --> 01:01:07,920

but if you woo way into sparring you'll

1538

01:01:13,069 --> 01:01:09,559

do a great job

1539

01:01:15,170 --> 01:01:13,079

be in the full State well it means that

1540

01:01:18,789 --> 01:01:15,180

pregnant emptiness that Ian's talking

1541

01:01:22,190 --> 01:01:18,799

about that gives birth to what is needed

1542

01:01:26,170 --> 01:01:22,200

appropriately at the moment

1543

01:01:29,329 --> 01:01:26,180

okay and that's called no thingness

1544

01:01:32,930 --> 01:01:29,339

I'm not a signologist but I I think that

1545

01:01:35,569 --> 01:01:32,940

way means non-action it means yeah that

1546

01:01:37,849 --> 01:01:35,579

means not doing not doing exactly but

1547

01:01:39,130 --> 01:01:37,859

but the metaphors are still the the

1548

01:01:42,470 --> 01:01:39,140

metaphors

1549

01:01:45,109 --> 01:01:42,480

emptiness they give birth when I was

1550

01:01:47,390 --> 01:01:45,119

proposing they line up with uh very much

1551

01:01:49,130 --> 01:01:47,400

the alerted ignorance and the no

1552

01:01:52,309 --> 01:01:49,140

thickness of the neoplatonic tradition

1553

01:01:54,530 --> 01:01:52,319

Nicholas accuser platinus Etc

1554

01:01:55,849 --> 01:01:54,540

I I'm not I'm not I'm not a perennialist

1555

01:01:57,230 --> 01:01:55,859

I'm not claiming that they're all saying

1556

01:01:59,329 --> 01:01:57,240

exactly the same thing but I'm saying

1557

01:02:01,190 --> 01:01:59,339

there's deep convergence from very

1558

01:02:03,109 --> 01:02:01,200

different traditions and histories that

1559

01:02:05,150 --> 01:02:03,119

makes plausible the place they get to

1560

01:02:06,950 --> 01:02:05,160

well the concept of The Perennial

1561

01:02:09,530 --> 01:02:06,960

philosophy can be on the one hand

1562

01:02:12,230 --> 01:02:09,540

exaggerated and on the other under

1563

01:02:13,970 --> 01:02:12,240

respected uh yes there is a great deal

1564

01:02:16,670 --> 01:02:13,980

in common between the Traditions there

1565

01:02:17,750 --> 01:02:16,680

of course not not exactly the same and

1566

01:02:19,970 --> 01:02:17,760

that's the wonderful thing about

1567

01:02:21,530 --> 01:02:19,980

people's different traditions and

1568

01:02:23,569 --> 01:02:21,540

different perspectives looking at

1569

01:02:25,970 --> 01:02:23,579

something that is recognizably the same

1570

01:02:28,430 --> 01:02:25,980

but from each perspective something new

1571

01:02:31,190 --> 01:02:28,440

will be added to our understanding of

1572

01:02:34,789 --> 01:02:31,200

what it is in fact that's my idea of

1573

01:02:37,250 --> 01:02:34,799

what objectivity is it's not

1574

01:02:40,250 --> 01:02:37,260

um a rather peculiar state in which one

1575

01:02:42,349 --> 01:02:40,260

denies the humanness of the Observer who

1576

01:02:44,230 --> 01:02:42,359

is the only one who knows all this stuff

1577

01:02:46,849 --> 01:02:44,240

that one's calling objective

1578

01:02:48,289 --> 01:02:46,859

that would be a very very strange way of

1579

01:02:50,630 --> 01:02:48,299

looking at the world not necessarily

1580

01:02:53,089 --> 01:02:50,640

revealing of truth but what seems

1581

01:02:54,849 --> 01:02:53,099

important is not to be

1582

01:02:57,589 --> 01:02:54,859

um as it were

1583

01:02:59,030 --> 01:02:57,599

solely indebted to one perspective but

1584

01:03:01,190 --> 01:02:59,040

to be able to see a number of

1585

01:03:03,049 --> 01:03:01,200

perspectives and to allow them to

1586

01:03:05,390 --> 01:03:03,059

complement one another and that in that

1587

01:03:08,109 --> 01:03:05,400

sense one of them will be this one in

1588

01:03:10,849 --> 01:03:08,119

which one is trying to eliminate

1589

01:03:12,770 --> 01:03:10,859

forcibly one's own person in the

1590

01:03:14,329 --> 01:03:12,780

encounter with whatever it is it's a

1591

01:03:17,569 --> 01:03:14,339

strange thing to do but it it's worth

1592

01:03:19,250 --> 01:03:17,579

doing but it doesn't in the end uh as

1593

01:03:20,450 --> 01:03:19,260

modern physics tells us it doesn't in

1594

01:03:22,849 --> 01:03:20,460

the end

1595

01:03:25,670 --> 01:03:22,859

um work out as the the best way to

1596

01:03:28,609 --> 01:03:25,680

understand the material or immaterial

1597

01:03:30,530 --> 01:03:28,619

world yeah I agree wholeheartedly with

1598

01:03:31,370 --> 01:03:30,540

that I think

1599

01:03:35,150 --> 01:03:31,380

um

1600

01:03:37,910 --> 01:03:35,160

I think I'm deeply influenced by NATO on

1601
01:03:40,430 --> 01:03:37,920
this the attempt understanding the view

1602
01:03:43,190 --> 01:03:40,440
from nowhere no but but in the Absurd

1603
01:03:45,289 --> 01:03:43,200
yes sir he basically argues that the

1604
01:03:47,510 --> 01:03:45,299
view from nowhere also generates the

1605
01:03:49,190 --> 01:03:47,520
Absurd right yes the perspective of a

1606
01:03:52,250 --> 01:03:49,200
Flash and so there's something there's

1607
01:03:53,750 --> 01:03:52,260
something paradoxical if our of our

1608
01:03:55,670 --> 01:03:53,760
fundamental guiding metaphor of

1609
01:03:57,890 --> 01:03:55,680
objectivity is the same one that gets us

1610
01:03:59,450 --> 01:03:57,900
into finding reality absurd because

1611
01:04:00,670 --> 01:03:59,460
science is depending on the

1612
01:04:03,230 --> 01:04:00,680
intelligibility

1613
01:04:04,910 --> 01:04:03,240

and I just want to ghost what I said

1614

01:04:08,390 --> 01:04:04,920

because it's very very important that

1615

01:04:11,089 --> 01:04:08,400

I'm not misunderstood I don't think that

1616

01:04:13,490 --> 01:04:11,099

the term objectivity has no job to do I

1617

01:04:16,069 --> 01:04:13,500

think it's a very important term and

1618

01:04:19,789 --> 01:04:16,079

what it means is arriving at the most

1619

01:04:21,710 --> 01:04:19,799

rich most true perception of what it is

1620

01:04:24,230 --> 01:04:21,720

one's looking at and that means not

1621

01:04:26,450 --> 01:04:24,240

allowing oneself to be swayed by some

1622

01:04:28,849 --> 01:04:26,460

completely extraordinary biased way of

1623

01:04:31,510 --> 01:04:28,859

looking at the world so I know I'm

1624

01:04:35,210 --> 01:04:31,520

equally opposed to that and just because

1625

01:04:37,730 --> 01:04:35,220

the clinically detached impossible view

1626

01:04:40,490 --> 01:04:37,740

of the non-person is not possible

1627

01:04:42,890 --> 01:04:40,500

doesn't mean that it's free for all for

1628

01:04:45,650 --> 01:04:42,900

any point of view not at all some points

1629

01:04:47,690 --> 01:04:45,660

of view are Dreadful noxious and not

1630

01:04:50,630 --> 01:04:47,700

only untrue but damaging other points of

1631

01:04:53,569 --> 01:04:50,640

view may be rich welcoming and unfolding

1632

01:04:57,530 --> 01:04:53,579

of life and vitality and creativity yeah

1633

01:04:59,870 --> 01:04:57,540

I I and again I'm in agreement with you

1634

01:05:01,609 --> 01:04:59,880

um because I was not I was not proposing

1635

01:05:04,370 --> 01:05:01,619

a rejection of the notion of objectivity

1636

01:05:06,829 --> 01:05:04,380

no no no I was proposing to reject a

1637

01:05:08,809 --> 01:05:06,839

particular model that has helped captive

1638

01:05:10,490 --> 01:05:08,819

you know beckenstein's liechtenstein's

1639

01:05:13,250 --> 01:05:10,500

idea about a picture holding us captive

1640

01:05:14,870 --> 01:05:13,260

yeah I knew you weren't saying that I

1641

01:05:16,789 --> 01:05:14,880

just wanted for everyone's sake to make

1642

01:05:18,410 --> 01:05:16,799

clear that neither of us were were

1643

01:05:20,750 --> 01:05:18,420

really putting down that particular

1644

01:05:23,089 --> 01:05:20,760

Rabbit Hole of post-modernism in which

1645

01:05:25,309 --> 01:05:23,099

every every point of view is equally

1646

01:05:27,650 --> 01:05:25,319

valid absolutely no no no at some points

1647

01:05:30,589 --> 01:05:27,660

no absolutely absurd others are

1648

01:05:32,089 --> 01:05:30,599

extraordinarily deep so so my view my

1649

01:05:35,510 --> 01:05:32,099

view on this is deeply influenced by

1650

01:05:37,730 --> 01:05:35,520

Confluence of sort of of uh the the

1651
01:05:39,410 --> 01:05:37,740
third wave of platonic scholarship and

1652
01:05:43,250 --> 01:05:39,420
Marlo Ponte

1653
01:05:46,130 --> 01:05:43,260
um and the idea uh first of all

1654
01:05:47,990 --> 01:05:46,140
so here's a thing and first of all

1655
01:05:48,950 --> 01:05:48,000
realize that you can never see the whole

1656
01:05:53,030 --> 01:05:48,960
thing

1657
01:05:55,130 --> 01:05:53,040
matter where you look at it right there

1658
01:05:57,170 --> 01:05:55,140
are multiple aspects and they're not

1659
01:05:58,730 --> 01:05:57,180
only multiple aspects in terms of its

1660
01:06:00,890 --> 01:05:58,740
visibility there's multiple tactile

1661
01:06:04,490 --> 01:06:00,900
aspects there's multiple auditory

1662
01:06:07,370 --> 01:06:04,500
there's multiple uses of this and then

1663
01:06:10,309 --> 01:06:07,380

what you start to realize is that there

1664

01:06:12,109 --> 01:06:10,319

is multi-espectuality and then not only

1665

01:06:14,510 --> 01:06:12,119

is it multi-ess factuality within a

1666

01:06:17,030 --> 01:06:14,520

person there is multi there are multiple

1667

01:06:19,670 --> 01:06:17,040

perspectives on any one thing this is

1668

01:06:22,069 --> 01:06:19,680

why biological reason is so important

1669

01:06:24,410 --> 01:06:22,079

and then for me what you're trying to do

1670

01:06:26,870 --> 01:06:24,420

and this is Marlo ponte's sort of

1671

01:06:28,130 --> 01:06:26,880

critique of historal you're trying to

1672

01:06:30,710 --> 01:06:28,140

find the through line

1673

01:06:33,650 --> 01:06:30,720

because what you realize is that right

1674

01:06:36,890 --> 01:06:33,660

the these this doesn't come off as a

1675

01:06:39,529 --> 01:06:36,900

cacophonous you know Cubist painting

1676

01:06:41,630 --> 01:06:39,539

there's a Melody here and it's not this

1677

01:06:43,910 --> 01:06:41,640

is not logically identical to this or

1678

01:06:45,410 --> 01:06:43,920

this or this but nevertheless there is a

1679

01:06:48,829 --> 01:06:45,420

through line of intelligibility what

1680

01:06:50,450 --> 01:06:48,839

John Newsom calls a musicality to it and

1681

01:06:53,270 --> 01:06:50,460

for me

1682

01:06:55,970 --> 01:06:53,280

um and it's inexhaustible it's

1683

01:06:58,309 --> 01:06:55,980

inexhaustible that leads to the idea of

1684

01:07:00,289 --> 01:06:58,319

the person as continuous

1685

01:07:02,210 --> 01:07:00,299

um we've got a second idea that our

1686

01:07:04,849 --> 01:07:02,220

lives are made up of moments like time

1687

01:07:07,190 --> 01:07:04,859

slices but they're not they are like a

1688

01:07:10,130 --> 01:07:07,200

melody as as only Belgium said that

1689

01:07:12,410 --> 01:07:10,140

one's personality has this exactly

1690

01:07:15,589 --> 01:07:12,420

picture of a Melody which is always

1691

01:07:19,190 --> 01:07:15,599

unfolding and and that um that's a very

1692

01:07:21,109 --> 01:07:19,200

important Insight but thank you because

1693

01:07:24,230 --> 01:07:21,119

that's the point I want what for me

1694

01:07:26,529 --> 01:07:24,240

objectivity is when I have this melody

1695

01:07:29,930 --> 01:07:26,539

as you put it in sync with that Melody

1696

01:07:33,589 --> 01:07:29,940

there's a continuity of contact yeah so

1697

01:07:35,930 --> 01:07:33,599

that I can I can within my finite

1698

01:07:38,390 --> 01:07:35,940

Transcendence is how as Highland puts it

1699

01:07:41,329 --> 01:07:38,400

I can disclose as much of that

1700

01:07:43,069 --> 01:07:41,339

inexhaustible multi-ess factuality and

1701

01:07:46,250 --> 01:07:43,079

multi multiple perspectives as I

1702

01:07:48,049 --> 01:07:46,260

possibly can within a integrated

1703

01:07:50,930 --> 01:07:48,059

intelligibility

1704

01:07:53,089 --> 01:07:50,940

that that's that's the proposal that's

1705

01:07:55,430 --> 01:07:53,099

coming out of people like Marlo Ponte

1706

01:07:58,069 --> 01:07:55,440

how we should re-under and I think it's

1707

01:08:01,010 --> 01:07:58,079

actually Plato's proposal uh I think I

1708

01:08:03,289 --> 01:08:01,020

think I think Gonzalez and Highland uh

1709

01:08:05,690 --> 01:08:03,299

and Kirkland and all of the third wave

1710

01:08:08,089 --> 01:08:05,700

are right on about that and I think that

1711

01:08:09,770 --> 01:08:08,099

is how we should and that's not that's a

1712

01:08:12,710 --> 01:08:09,780

non-thangy way of thinking in because

1713

01:08:14,870 --> 01:08:12,720

the through line is not any aspect it is

1714

01:08:17,570 --> 01:08:14,880

not any perspective precisely because it

1715

01:08:19,189 --> 01:08:17,580

is that which binds all the aspects and

1716

01:08:21,050 --> 01:08:19,199

all the uh all the perspectives together

1717

01:08:23,329 --> 01:08:21,060

and for me what needs all those

1718

01:08:25,610 --> 01:08:23,339

perspective says what

1719

01:08:27,410 --> 01:08:25,620

um Russell called atombrations of the

1720

01:08:30,229 --> 01:08:27,420

thing one needs to see it from as many

1721

01:08:32,930 --> 01:08:30,239

exactly exactly exactly exactly but

1722

01:08:34,669 --> 01:08:32,940

without uh as I say this ridiculous idea

1723

01:08:38,390 --> 01:08:34,679

that anything goes

1724

01:08:40,930 --> 01:08:38,400

um do you know the uh the Japanese zen

1725

01:08:43,930 --> 01:08:40,940

garden riyANJI

1726

01:08:48,349 --> 01:08:43,940

it's a very beautiful garden it has 15

1727

01:08:50,090 --> 01:08:48,359

rocks set out in the in the sand and

1728

01:08:53,410 --> 01:08:50,100

from wherever you stand in the garden

1729

01:08:56,709 --> 01:08:53,420

the most you can ever see is 14 of them

1730

01:08:58,970 --> 01:08:56,719

okay so I love that

1731

01:09:00,769 --> 01:08:58,980

Nicholas accuser when he writes the

1732

01:09:03,289 --> 01:09:00,779

vision of God and he sends it to the

1733

01:09:05,570 --> 01:09:03,299

monastery he sends a painting

1734

01:09:07,010 --> 01:09:05,580

and no matter where you stand in the

1735

01:09:08,930 --> 01:09:07,020

room it looks like the painting is

1736

01:09:10,789 --> 01:09:08,940

looking at you and then he says first

1737

01:09:12,950 --> 01:09:10,799

everybody do that and then do the

1738

01:09:14,930 --> 01:09:12,960

following one monk stands in one place

1739

01:09:17,269 --> 01:09:14,940

and another Monk stands in the farthest

1740

01:09:19,189 --> 01:09:17,279

other place and they both claim that the

1741

01:09:20,809 --> 01:09:19,199

picture is looking at them and then he

1742

01:09:22,910 --> 01:09:20,819

says

1743

01:09:26,269 --> 01:09:22,920

go ahead no that's just true of any

1744

01:09:28,010 --> 01:09:26,279

painting where you exactly it's nothing

1745

01:09:29,990 --> 01:09:28,020

special it's just this phenomenon here

1746

01:09:31,490 --> 01:09:30,000

oh yeah he's a following no they're not

1747

01:09:33,910 --> 01:09:31,500

it's just that wherever you look you

1748

01:09:36,249 --> 01:09:33,920

think the face is looking at you

1749

01:09:39,169 --> 01:09:36,259

so he

1750

01:09:40,849 --> 01:09:39,179

he he well I think that's the point uh

1751

01:09:43,849 --> 01:09:40,859

because then he says

1752

01:09:45,829 --> 01:09:43,859

now try to what would it be like to be

1753

01:09:48,410 --> 01:09:45,839

able to realize this all at once and of

1754

01:09:50,209 --> 01:09:48,420

course you can't but he says that's what

1755

01:09:53,809 --> 01:09:50,219

it is to have the vision of God it's not

1756

01:09:57,290 --> 01:09:53,819

to see God it's to see the way God sees

1757

01:09:58,729 --> 01:09:57,300

right it's to see that through line that

1758

01:10:01,130 --> 01:09:58,739

you can't actually see because it makes

1759

01:10:04,010 --> 01:10:01,140

all seeing possible Right

1760

01:10:07,970 --> 01:10:04,020

and so this is again the non-thingness

1761

01:10:10,610 --> 01:10:07,980

that is not privation but is the

1762

01:10:12,950 --> 01:10:10,620

inexhaustible found which from which

1763

01:10:15,950 --> 01:10:12,960

intelligibility floats and flows and I

1764

01:10:18,850 --> 01:10:15,960

think for me that has been

1765

01:10:21,050 --> 01:10:18,860

that has been my fundamental

1766

01:10:23,750 --> 01:10:21,060

phenomenologically rich and reflective

1767

01:10:25,729 --> 01:10:23,760

experience of the Sacred to exactly find

1768

01:10:27,770 --> 01:10:25,739

that and for me Gerta is is talking

1769

01:10:29,689 --> 01:10:27,780

about that when he's looking at the

1770

01:10:31,550 --> 01:10:29,699

plants and I see the same thing when

1771

01:10:34,490 --> 01:10:31,560

when you're in the platonic dialogues

1772

01:10:36,350 --> 01:10:34,500

you have this Quest right to find the

1773

01:10:38,510 --> 01:10:36,360

virtue but you never get to the answer

1774

01:10:41,209 --> 01:10:38,520

but you get the through Line running and

1775

01:10:42,770 --> 01:10:41,219

all that sort of thing for me and like

1776

01:10:45,110 --> 01:10:42,780

you said that's when I find the sacred

1777

01:10:47,169 --> 01:10:45,120

in another person when I realize that

1778

01:10:49,490 --> 01:10:47,179

there's there's multi-aspected

1779

01:10:51,830 --> 01:10:49,500

multifaceted but there's a through line

1780

01:10:54,110 --> 01:10:51,840

and I can hear it and taste it and

1781

01:10:56,270 --> 01:10:54,120

follow it but I can never complete it or

1782

01:10:58,310 --> 01:10:56,280

grasp it totally and if I say that to

1783

01:11:00,410 --> 01:10:58,320

her I've destroyed the relationship so

1784

01:11:02,870 --> 01:11:00,420

that would be the most foolish thing to

1785

01:11:05,510 --> 01:11:02,880

do but as you said everything is like

1786

01:11:08,450 --> 01:11:05,520

that and that means we can fall in love

1787

01:11:12,350 --> 01:11:08,460

with being again it's not like for me

1788

01:11:15,590 --> 01:11:12,360

that's a real possibility for people

1789

01:11:18,850 --> 01:11:15,600

I'm sorry that that that's for me what I

1790

01:11:22,310 --> 01:11:18,860

I I think is if we could enable people

1791

01:11:24,649 --> 01:11:22,320

read through a way of life to fall in

1792

01:11:27,470 --> 01:11:24,659

love with being again I think that would

1793

01:11:30,169 --> 01:11:27,480

be a deep way of responding to the main

1794

01:11:33,890 --> 01:11:31,209

foreign

1795

01:11:36,169 --> 01:11:33,900

ly a rather nice way of expressing it I

1796

01:11:40,010 --> 01:11:36,179

agree and love is probably going to be

1797

01:11:43,970 --> 01:11:40,020

part of how one achieves that and

1798

01:11:45,950 --> 01:11:43,980

you you touched on that idea of the not

1799

01:11:48,410 --> 01:11:45,960

just the way God sees but of the way we

1800

01:11:50,810 --> 01:11:48,420

see God and I'm trying to think who it

1801

01:11:53,209 --> 01:11:50,820

was now was it it I'm not sure it was

1802

01:11:55,010 --> 01:11:53,219

that card it might have been

1803

01:11:56,649 --> 01:11:55,020

Bonaventure or somebody who said you

1804

01:11:58,510 --> 01:11:56,659

know the eye with which I see God

1805

01:12:01,130 --> 01:11:58,520

Eckhart

1806

01:12:05,570 --> 01:12:01,140

yeah it's the same I was which God sees

1807

01:12:07,910 --> 01:12:05,580

me exactly but anyway yes that's a a

1808

01:12:09,830 --> 01:12:07,920

good point but how on Earth

1809

01:12:11,870 --> 01:12:09,840

um are we to if

1810

01:12:14,450 --> 01:12:11,880

is the subject we're talking about is

1811

01:12:16,430 --> 01:12:14,460

how to bring this about how do we how do

1812

01:12:17,570 --> 01:12:16,440

we help bring it about or perhaps that

1813

01:12:19,729 --> 01:12:17,580

isn't the question or perhaps it's not

1814

01:12:21,229 --> 01:12:19,739

even a good question well I think it's

1815

01:12:23,689 --> 01:12:21,239

whether or not it's a well-formed

1816

01:12:24,290 --> 01:12:23,699

question or not I think it's probative

1817

01:12:25,550 --> 01:12:24,300

um

1818

01:12:27,470 --> 01:12:25,560

one of the books that's had the most

1819

01:12:30,350 --> 01:12:27,480

profound influence on me is religion and

1820

01:12:31,790 --> 01:12:30,360

nothingness by nishitani and he it's a

1821

01:12:34,010 --> 01:12:31,800

fall and it's a masterpiece and it's

1822

01:12:35,750 --> 01:12:34,020

rightly regarded so it's a follow-up to

1823

01:12:38,149 --> 01:12:35,760

his earlier book The self-overcoming of

1824

01:12:39,890 --> 01:12:38,159

violism and to give you a flavor of it

1825

01:12:41,810 --> 01:12:39,900

there's another book very similar to

1826

01:12:44,270 --> 01:12:41,820

eckhart's which was uttered by Nietzsche

1827

01:12:46,250 --> 01:12:44,280

uh if you stare long enough into the

1828

01:12:48,350 --> 01:12:46,260

abyss it begins to stare back into you

1829

01:12:50,689 --> 01:12:48,360

Nietzsche Came Upon something but he

1830

01:12:54,649 --> 01:12:50,699

gets to the edge of it but he doesn't it

1831

01:12:57,890 --> 01:12:54,659

doesn't flip over for him and what uh

1832

01:12:58,669 --> 01:12:57,900

what nishitani proposes is

1833

01:13:01,850 --> 01:12:58,679

um

1834

01:13:03,830 --> 01:13:01,860

he proposes that

1835

01:13:04,850 --> 01:13:03,840

and I I'm interested because you might

1836

01:13:07,790 --> 01:13:04,860

have a really interesting take on

1837

01:13:09,709 --> 01:13:07,800

Nietzsche doesn't doubt deeply enough

1838

01:13:11,390 --> 01:13:09,719

it it's almost like the left hemisphere

1839

01:13:13,189 --> 01:13:11,400

is capable of this profound doubt but it

1840

01:13:14,630 --> 01:13:13,199

can never doubt its own authority or its

1841

01:13:17,229 --> 01:13:14,640

own preeminence or something like that

1842

01:13:20,030 --> 01:13:17,239

yeah so very much yes yes

1843

01:13:21,709 --> 01:13:20,040

and and he proposes like one that one of

1844

01:13:24,110 --> 01:13:21,719

the practice one of the points of Zen is

1845

01:13:26,689 --> 01:13:24,120

to get the great doubt that drops you

1846

01:13:29,090 --> 01:13:26,699

but beneath and then that profound

1847

01:13:32,270 --> 01:13:29,100

resonance beliefs The propositional

1848

01:13:33,890 --> 01:13:32,280

Tyranny gets disclosed to people and I

1849

01:13:37,689 --> 01:13:33,900

think I think that's

1850

01:13:40,610 --> 01:13:37,699

part of what needs to happen right now

1851
01:13:43,189 --> 01:13:40,620
I'm not saying I'm not recommending Zed

1852
01:13:45,350 --> 01:13:43,199
I'm saying we have to get something in

1853
01:13:47,750 --> 01:13:45,360
which we

1854
01:13:49,189 --> 01:13:47,760
we live in the hermeneutics of Suspicion

1855
01:13:51,649 --> 01:13:49,199
where we doubt everything except we

1856
01:13:54,229 --> 01:13:51,659
doubt the perspective The Stance from

1857
01:13:57,290 --> 01:13:54,239
which that happens and I've been trying

1858
01:14:00,890 --> 01:13:57,300
to figure out the semantic philosophical

1859
01:14:04,970 --> 01:14:00,900
Jujitsu moved right in order to get that

1860
01:14:07,250 --> 01:14:04,980
doubt to actually turn onto itself in a

1861
01:14:08,930 --> 01:14:07,260
profoundly transformative way without of

1862
01:14:10,850 --> 01:14:08,940
course destroying people's sanity or

1863
01:14:12,410 --> 01:14:10,860

lives or putting them into a psychotic

1864

01:14:15,110 --> 01:14:12,420

break or anything ridiculous like that

1865

01:14:17,930 --> 01:14:15,120

no of course but one of the things that

1866

01:14:19,790 --> 01:14:17,940

can break us out of that doubting of

1867

01:14:22,910 --> 01:14:19,800

everything

1868

01:14:24,950 --> 01:14:22,920

um is the experience the Transcendent

1869

01:14:29,050 --> 01:14:24,960

experience of something very real and

1870

01:14:31,550 --> 01:14:29,060

it's yeah in a way that comes as part of

1871

01:14:32,990 --> 01:14:31,560

is it's one of these self-referential

1872

01:14:35,209 --> 01:14:33,000

things that you can't break into it

1873

01:14:37,550 --> 01:14:35,219

unfortunately because you can't cause

1874

01:14:39,050 --> 01:14:37,560

this experience to happen to you but you

1875

01:14:41,750 --> 01:14:39,060

can put yourself in the way of it

1876
01:14:43,790 --> 01:14:41,760
happening yes included and what worries

1877
01:14:47,030 --> 01:14:43,800
me is that the way we live now with our

1878
01:14:50,630 --> 01:14:47,040
attention so fragmented and ourselves so

1879
01:14:52,490 --> 01:14:50,640
bound up in verbal noise and discussion

1880
01:14:53,689 --> 01:14:52,500
about you know all the things we're

1881
01:14:56,330 --> 01:14:53,699
talking about one of the things that

1882
01:14:58,310 --> 01:14:56,340
troubles me actually about where this

1883
01:15:00,050 --> 01:14:58,320
conversation is going is that the wise

1884
01:15:01,850 --> 01:15:00,060
person stops talking at this point

1885
01:15:03,770 --> 01:15:01,860
because really we're entering the

1886
01:15:04,970 --> 01:15:03,780
territory where you cannot talk about it

1887
01:15:08,330 --> 01:15:04,980
so

1888
01:15:10,149 --> 01:15:08,340

um but we drown out the possibility of

1889

01:15:12,890 --> 01:15:10,159

being there for

1890

01:15:14,630 --> 01:15:12,900

whatever you mean by the sacred even for

1891

01:15:17,030 --> 01:15:14,640

the beautiful because you need to attend

1892

01:15:18,709 --> 01:15:17,040

to it deeply not just sort of allow it

1893

01:15:20,330 --> 01:15:18,719

to be in the background somewhere you

1894

01:15:22,430 --> 01:15:20,340

actually have to

1895

01:15:26,030 --> 01:15:22,440

have an encounter with it and it's that

1896

01:15:26,930 --> 01:15:26,040

that changes changes once one's way of

1897

01:15:30,050 --> 01:15:26,940

being

1898

01:15:33,169 --> 01:15:30,060

I suppose I agree with you and I I mean

1899

01:15:35,510 --> 01:15:33,179

I I do think what

1900

01:15:39,169 --> 01:15:35,520

there is an intermediary

1901

01:15:40,850 --> 01:15:39,179

which is to try and find people that are

1902

01:15:43,310 --> 01:15:40,860

exemplifying

1903

01:15:44,870 --> 01:15:43,320

an encounter with the really real and

1904

01:15:46,430 --> 01:15:44,880

there's a there's a large proportion of

1905

01:15:48,890 --> 01:15:46,440

the population in which that even

1906

01:15:52,550 --> 01:15:48,900

happens spontaneously at least 30 at

1907

01:15:54,290 --> 01:15:52,560

least 30 percent perhaps 40. so we've

1908

01:15:55,550 --> 01:15:54,300

got a culture that silences them but it

1909

01:15:57,770 --> 01:15:55,560

doesn't have to be the way there's no

1910

01:16:00,169 --> 01:15:57,780

necessity for that no you're right

1911

01:16:01,790 --> 01:16:00,179

so for me it's beyond a trend it's

1912

01:16:04,669 --> 01:16:01,800

beyond a mystical experience it's a

1913

01:16:08,470 --> 01:16:04,679

transformative experience so

1914

01:16:10,130 --> 01:16:08,480

um uh it's an experience in which

1915

01:16:12,290 --> 01:16:10,140

one

1916

01:16:15,410 --> 01:16:12,300

has many of the features of a mystical

1917

01:16:19,070 --> 01:16:15,420

experience the Oneness the the the the

1918

01:16:22,310 --> 01:16:19,080

the the the hereness the numbness the

1919

01:16:24,890 --> 01:16:22,320

altogetherness the depth of realness but

1920

01:16:26,209 --> 01:16:24,900

it's ultimately ineffable but it carries

1921

01:16:27,169 --> 01:16:26,219

with it

1922

01:16:34,070 --> 01:16:27,179

um

1923

01:16:36,229 --> 01:16:34,080

real such that people do the following

1924

01:16:38,090 --> 01:16:36,239

they will they'll do something weird

1925

01:16:39,530 --> 01:16:38,100

normally when we have an aberrant State

1926

01:16:41,870 --> 01:16:39,540

of Consciousness that doesn't fit into

1927

01:16:44,149 --> 01:16:41,880

our everyday Consciousness we use that

1928

01:16:46,370 --> 01:16:44,159

to say it's not real like a dream or

1929

01:16:47,990 --> 01:16:46,380

being drunk but they do the opposite

1930

01:16:50,810 --> 01:16:48,000

they cut they have these experiences and

1931

01:16:55,189 --> 01:16:50,820

they say that was really real and all of

1932

01:16:58,250 --> 01:16:55,199

this is an illusion and they then they

1933

01:17:00,410 --> 01:16:58,260

say I'm the must is not

1934

01:17:03,830 --> 01:17:00,420

a compulsive must it's what I call

1935

01:17:06,709 --> 01:17:03,840

autonomativity that they I need I need I

1936

01:17:08,630 --> 01:17:06,719

profoundly need to change who I am and

1937

01:17:10,310 --> 01:17:08,640

how I relate to the world maybe my

1938

01:17:11,630 --> 01:17:10,320

occupation my career they will

1939

01:17:14,090 --> 01:17:11,640

profoundly change their lives because

1940

01:17:16,790 --> 01:17:14,100

they want to be closer to that really

1941

01:17:19,550 --> 01:17:16,800

real they want to conform more to it and

1942

01:17:20,570 --> 01:17:19,560

jayden's work shows by many objective

1943

01:17:23,270 --> 01:17:20,580

measures

1944

01:17:26,510 --> 01:17:23,280

their lives get better uh that's what I

1945

01:17:27,770 --> 01:17:26,520

mean by a transformative and uh Steve

1946

01:17:30,290 --> 01:17:27,780

Taylor has a book I think it's called

1947

01:17:32,030 --> 01:17:30,300

waking up where he taught canvases all

1948

01:17:33,350 --> 01:17:32,040

of this it's not it's not it's not a

1949

01:17:35,450 --> 01:17:33,360

scientifically profound book but it's

1950

01:17:38,030 --> 01:17:35,460

great for just Gathering all these

1951

01:17:41,570 --> 01:17:38,040

accounts together now it's extraordinary

1952

01:17:43,910 --> 01:17:41,580

how commonly is experiences of

1953

01:17:46,610 --> 01:17:43,920

um well it even can be described as

1954

01:17:47,810 --> 01:17:46,620

encounters with God actually by a lot of

1955

01:17:49,729 --> 01:17:47,820

people even though they don't

1956

01:17:51,770 --> 01:17:49,739

necessarily believe in God at all but

1957

01:17:53,990 --> 01:17:51,780

they call them encounters with God or

1958

01:17:55,250 --> 01:17:54,000

with the cosmos with the ultimate truth

1959

01:17:56,930 --> 01:17:55,260

or whatever it is and they're

1960

01:17:59,930 --> 01:17:56,940

surprisingly common

1961

01:18:02,870 --> 01:17:59,940

well and and they are not predicted by

1962

01:18:05,570 --> 01:18:02,880

any kind of mental disorder and neither

1963

01:18:07,910 --> 01:18:05,580

neither do they generate any kind of men

1964

01:18:09,709 --> 01:18:07,920

no yeah no no the very important point

1965

01:18:12,229 --> 01:18:09,719

you've already made which is that when

1966

01:18:14,450 --> 01:18:12,239

people have hallucinations and delusions

1967

01:18:16,189 --> 01:18:14,460

when they're better they count them as

1968

01:18:18,590 --> 01:18:16,199

unreal and they see that they're better

1969

01:18:20,570 --> 01:18:18,600

off without them but after these

1970

01:18:23,630 --> 01:18:20,580

experiences they don't they they think

1971

01:18:26,510 --> 01:18:23,640

this is the this was the reality and it

1972

01:18:28,729 --> 01:18:26,520

often has long-term uh changing effects

1973

01:18:30,530 --> 01:18:28,739

on their lives exactly as you say so

1974

01:18:32,209 --> 01:18:30,540

it's something that needs to be taken

1975

01:18:33,770 --> 01:18:32,219

seriously and there is research and some

1976

01:18:36,350 --> 01:18:33,780

of it you've probably been mentioning

1977

01:18:39,050 --> 01:18:36,360

which which shows how very real and

1978

01:18:41,630 --> 01:18:39,060

important this is so we discount this

1979

01:18:43,729 --> 01:18:41,640

um because we're told that clever people

1980

01:18:46,070 --> 01:18:43,739

bright people intelligent people don't

1981

01:18:48,709 --> 01:18:46,080

think like this it's just some

1982

01:18:51,410 --> 01:18:48,719

um ill effect of something misbehaving

1983

01:18:54,770 --> 01:18:51,420

in one's brain but it it's not an

1984

01:18:57,110 --> 01:18:54,780

adequate account yeah and I I go over

1985

01:18:59,330 --> 01:18:57,120

both I've given talks on this a

1986

01:19:00,709 --> 01:18:59,340

conferences I go over it in Awakening

1987

01:19:03,350 --> 01:19:00,719

for the meeting crisis on higher States

1988

01:19:06,169 --> 01:19:03,360

Of Consciousness I've talked about it at

1989

01:19:09,169 --> 01:19:06,179

Yale Etc you can make a very good case

1990

01:19:10,790 --> 01:19:09,179

for this is actually a justifiable claim

1991

01:19:12,410 --> 01:19:10,800

I mean well

1992

01:19:14,750 --> 01:19:12,420

um I don't hang too much on the

1993

01:19:16,669 --> 01:19:14,760

propositions they come back with because

1994

01:19:19,669 --> 01:19:16,679

the propositions vary all over the place

1995

01:19:22,490 --> 01:19:19,679

but that sense I've done an experiment

1996

01:19:24,590 --> 01:19:22,500

in my lab where we like what's the

1997

01:19:26,209 --> 01:19:24,600

relationship nobody did this which we

1998

01:19:27,950 --> 01:19:26,219

thought I thought was astonishing is

1999

01:19:29,630 --> 01:19:27,960

there a correlation between having

2000

01:19:31,130 --> 01:19:29,640

mystical experiences and how meaningful

2001

01:19:32,630 --> 01:19:31,140

you find your life you would have

2002

01:19:34,790 --> 01:19:32,640

thought somebody had bothered to test

2003

01:19:36,410 --> 01:19:34,800

that it shows you the ignorance of our

2004

01:19:38,990 --> 01:19:36,420

orientation that that has not never even

2005

01:19:41,090 --> 01:19:39,000

been tested we tested it a huge amateur

2006

01:19:44,030 --> 01:19:41,100

study it is predictive it's Coral it's

2007

01:19:46,250 --> 01:19:44,040

correlative right and but it's not the

2008

01:19:48,709 --> 01:19:46,260

particular phenomenology phenomological

2009

01:19:51,050 --> 01:19:48,719

content it's the Insight Machinery it's

2010

01:19:53,390 --> 01:19:51,060

it's very much in a continue think about

2011

01:19:55,550 --> 01:19:53,400

when you have an Insight right and you

2012

01:19:57,530 --> 01:19:55,560

oh and then you know why you were wrong

2013

01:19:59,689 --> 01:19:57,540

before but you can't know that that

2014

01:20:02,149 --> 01:19:59,699

until you go through it right it's it's

2015

01:20:05,169 --> 01:20:02,159

that it's that kind of thing it's like

2016

01:20:07,970 --> 01:20:05,179

it's like a it's like a a systemic

2017

01:20:10,430 --> 01:20:07,980

insight and a systematic insight and

2018

01:20:12,530 --> 01:20:10,440

what's interesting is that the area in

2019

01:20:15,110 --> 01:20:12,540

which we have our moments the right

2020

01:20:17,410 --> 01:20:15,120

Superior temporal gyrus and sulcus is

2021

01:20:20,090 --> 01:20:17,420

very close to the area that has been

2022

01:20:22,010 --> 01:20:20,100

repeatedly found to be associated with

2023

01:20:25,310 --> 01:20:22,020

transformative religious experience

2024

01:20:28,070 --> 01:20:25,320

exactly the right temporary parietal

2025

01:20:31,750 --> 01:20:28,080

Junction effectively so I mean that's

2026

01:20:34,490 --> 01:20:31,760

interesting at every level but I feel

2027

01:20:36,290 --> 01:20:34,500

Kurt you need to help us reorientate

2028

01:20:38,209 --> 01:20:36,300

because we're talking about things that

2029

01:20:40,189 --> 01:20:38,219

well I just wanna I just wanted to talk

2030

01:20:43,130 --> 01:20:40,199

about I just wanted to follow up though

2031

01:20:45,530 --> 01:20:43,140

because right if we agree that this is a

2032

01:20:47,450 --> 01:20:45,540

real phenomena and if we agree that it's

2033

01:20:51,530 --> 01:20:47,460

not hallucinatory or something that we

2034

01:20:53,030 --> 01:20:51,540

can dismiss then like and then if we can

2035

01:20:55,370 --> 01:20:53,040

also find you know first of all if we

2036

01:20:58,250 --> 01:20:55,380

can support that culturally and also

2037

01:20:59,990 --> 01:20:58,260

watch people unfolding exemplary lives

2038

01:21:02,689 --> 01:21:00,000

this is sort of the socratic proposal

2039

01:21:03,950 --> 01:21:02,699

don't you know you know you know here's

2040

01:21:05,750 --> 01:21:03,960

a beautiful life

2041

01:21:07,370 --> 01:21:05,760

right the unexamined life is not worth

2042

01:21:08,990 --> 01:21:07,380

living here's a here's a beautiful life

2043

01:21:11,090 --> 01:21:09,000

and I think that's the kind of thing

2044

01:21:13,310 --> 01:21:11,100

that can attract people into what we're

2045

01:21:15,110 --> 01:21:13,320

talking about I I agree we can't we

2046

01:21:17,689 --> 01:21:15,120

can't give them here's how you do it but

2047

01:21:19,910 --> 01:21:17,699

what we can do we can we can cultivate

2048

01:21:22,250 --> 01:21:19,920

cultivate the people who are living

2049

01:21:24,110 --> 01:21:22,260

exemplary lives and create you know

2050

01:21:25,970 --> 01:21:24,120

communities where they Thrive that

2051

01:21:29,810 --> 01:21:25,980

attract people I propose we could do

2052

01:21:31,490 --> 01:21:29,820

that I I agree in in a way you've you've

2053

01:21:33,290 --> 01:21:31,500

given a description of what I aim to do

2054

01:21:35,209 --> 01:21:33,300

in my work which is to take people where

2055

01:21:37,189 --> 01:21:35,219

they see this is a beautiful vision of

2056

01:21:39,229 --> 01:21:37,199

life and it makes much more sense

2057

01:21:41,209 --> 01:21:39,239

okay so here's what an atheist may say

2058

01:21:42,950 --> 01:21:41,219

or an extremely staunch materialist

2059

01:21:45,530 --> 01:21:42,960

may say that sure you had an experience

2060

01:21:47,750 --> 01:21:45,540

of something real but your experiences

2061

01:21:50,209 --> 01:21:47,760

can be misleading and just because you

2062

01:21:52,130 --> 01:21:50,219

had potentially some psychedelic and you

2063

01:21:53,649 --> 01:21:52,140

feel like so-and-so is real well that

2064

01:21:56,510 --> 01:21:53,659

can be triggered let's say with

2065

01:21:58,130 --> 01:21:56,520

transcranial stimulation and other

2066

01:22:00,110 --> 01:21:58,140

methods so I can make you feel like

2067

01:22:02,510 --> 01:22:00,120

something's real when it's not so why

2068

01:22:04,550 --> 01:22:02,520

attribute realness to it just say it was

2069

01:22:06,649 --> 01:22:04,560

interesting so here's an example Sam

2070

01:22:08,330 --> 01:22:06,659

Harris said that he took an extreme

2071

01:22:09,590 --> 01:22:08,340

amount of mushrooms I'm not saying

2072

01:22:11,270 --> 01:22:09,600

anything that he hasn't said publicly

2073

01:22:13,189 --> 01:22:11,280

and then blindfolded himself went into a

2074

01:22:15,770 --> 01:22:13,199

room and he said he felt like he was

2075

01:22:18,709 --> 01:22:15,780

encountering something else but then

2076

01:22:21,590 --> 01:22:18,719

during and afterward he said well I was

2077

01:22:23,689 --> 01:22:21,600

saying well this is just me on drugs and

2078

01:22:25,370 --> 01:22:23,699

so I allowed it to take me whatever it

2079

01:22:27,770 --> 01:22:25,380

was some tiger or some other being I

2080

01:22:30,229 --> 01:22:27,780

allowed it to take me from realm to

2081

01:22:32,330 --> 01:22:30,239

realm but I didn't describe any realness

2082

01:22:35,149 --> 01:22:32,340

to it that also reminded me of this

2083

01:22:37,189 --> 01:22:35,159

quote I believe Ian you mentioned it the

2084

01:22:38,750 --> 01:22:37,199

last time you and John spoke on the

2085

01:22:41,630 --> 01:22:38,760

podcast

2086

01:22:43,850 --> 01:22:41,640

from Cars someone who Heidegger said was

2087

01:22:44,870 --> 01:22:43,860

the most important philosopher I don't

2088

01:22:47,270 --> 01:22:44,880

know if I'm pronouncing the name

2089

01:22:49,370 --> 01:22:47,280

correctly well James cause I didn't know

2090

01:22:51,290 --> 01:22:49,380

that how do you get a new cars I I think

2091

01:22:52,669 --> 01:22:51,300

it's a different person okay okay you

2092

01:22:54,350 --> 01:22:52,679

said that Heidegger spoke at his funeral

2093

01:22:56,870 --> 01:22:54,360

John he said Heidegger spoke at his

2094

01:23:00,229 --> 01:22:56,880

funeral oh no that's that's Max Shayla

2095

01:23:03,590 --> 01:23:00,239

okay with Heidegger spoke at Max

2096

01:23:05,870 --> 01:23:03,600

shayla's Funeral and said that that Max

2097

01:23:08,570 --> 01:23:05,880

Shayla was the greatest European

2098

01:23:11,450 --> 01:23:08,580

philosopher of his Generation

2099

01:23:15,229 --> 01:23:11,460

Um which was uncharacteristically humble

2100

01:23:18,590 --> 01:23:17,149

I think the connection was uh

2101
01:23:20,630 --> 01:23:18,600
reconstructive memory I had mentioned

2102
01:23:23,090 --> 01:23:20,640
that cars had just recently died I

2103
01:23:25,010 --> 01:23:23,100
believe oh so okay and then okay yeah

2104
01:23:26,990 --> 01:23:25,020
and that's uh that your memory put them

2105
01:23:30,290 --> 01:23:27,000
together in that fashion yeah yeah okay

2106
01:23:32,390 --> 01:23:30,300
so my two points are then Shaler perhaps

2107
01:23:34,430 --> 01:23:32,400
said I think it's trailer that you need

2108
01:23:35,810 --> 01:23:34,440
to open yourself up to knowledge rather

2109
01:23:37,970 --> 01:23:35,820
than having knowledge change you

2110
01:23:40,130 --> 01:23:37,980
something like that and it made me think

2111
01:23:44,750 --> 01:23:40,140
okay is it that someone like Sam Harris

2112
01:23:46,430 --> 01:23:44,760
is so closed to the Divine that even if

2113
01:23:48,290 --> 01:23:46,440

he encounters it he wouldn't see it and

2114

01:23:49,669 --> 01:23:48,300

he discounts it well that was just one

2115

01:23:50,689 --> 01:23:49,679

thought that came through my head and

2116

01:23:52,130 --> 01:23:50,699

then the next one was where it's

2117

01:23:53,709 --> 01:23:52,140

focusing so much on the nourishing

2118

01:23:56,270 --> 01:23:53,719

effects of these mystical experiences

2119

01:24:00,169 --> 01:23:56,280

but there is such a thing as totalizing

2120

01:24:01,850 --> 01:24:00,179

fear Terror and horror bad trips for

2121

01:24:04,189 --> 01:24:01,860

example whether or not they're even

2122

01:24:05,570 --> 01:24:04,199

trips and so then what's happening there

2123

01:24:07,550 --> 01:24:05,580

where one feels like yes what I've

2124

01:24:09,890 --> 01:24:07,560

encountered is real and I'm terrified

2125

01:24:11,330 --> 01:24:09,900

and I don't want that so those are two

2126

01:24:13,310 --> 01:24:11,340

separate points that I just wanted to

2127

01:24:15,050 --> 01:24:13,320

lay out there as potential jumping off I

2128

01:24:16,550 --> 01:24:15,060

think I think they're related but I'll

2129

01:24:18,530 --> 01:24:16,560

add and go first I think they are

2130

01:24:21,169 --> 01:24:18,540

related points yeah yeah maybe they are

2131

01:24:24,830 --> 01:24:21,179

and I think on the first point

2132

01:24:26,810 --> 01:24:24,840

um I would say uh yes of course

2133

01:24:30,530 --> 01:24:26,820

um things that one

2134

01:24:33,470 --> 01:24:30,540

um once one's mind brings before one may

2135

01:24:36,830 --> 01:24:33,480

be deceptive but there but then often

2136

01:24:38,930 --> 01:24:36,840

they're also real and it's not it's not

2137

01:24:41,209 --> 01:24:38,940

enough to say well we just dismiss it

2138

01:24:42,770 --> 01:24:41,219

because sometimes it's going to produce

2139

01:24:46,130 --> 01:24:42,780

something very important and sometimes

2140

01:24:49,310 --> 01:24:46,140

it isn't the same is true of every way

2141

01:24:50,630 --> 01:24:49,320

of arriving at knowledge reason can lead

2142

01:24:52,610 --> 01:24:50,640

you down

2143

01:24:54,050 --> 01:24:52,620

um blind at it or what I call

2144

01:24:57,169 --> 01:24:54,060

rationality

2145

01:25:00,169 --> 01:24:57,179

um leading one's life by pure logic

2146

01:25:01,270 --> 01:25:00,179

um reduces it to to a meaningless mess

2147

01:25:03,649 --> 01:25:01,280

as

2148

01:25:05,689 --> 01:25:03,659

demacio's description of a patient

2149

01:25:08,510 --> 01:25:05,699

called Elliot he had to work everything

2150

01:25:10,790 --> 01:25:08,520

out from first principles yeah it had no

2151
01:25:12,290 --> 01:25:10,800
understanding of Life whatever so recent

2152
01:25:14,930 --> 01:25:12,300
but I wouldn't say well in that case I'm

2153
01:25:16,790 --> 01:25:14,940
not going to use the reason and I I have

2154
01:25:19,310 --> 01:25:16,800
the same same view about intuition you

2155
01:25:21,350 --> 01:25:19,320
know psychologists are amused by

2156
01:25:23,270 --> 01:25:21,360
developing very clever little scenarios

2157
01:25:25,850 --> 01:25:23,280
in which one's normally extremely

2158
01:25:27,350 --> 01:25:25,860
helpful intuition is deceived there are

2159
01:25:29,990 --> 01:25:27,360
going to be such things I can show you

2160
01:25:32,090 --> 01:25:30,000
optical illusions that are completely

2161
01:25:34,130 --> 01:25:32,100
unbelievable are those two squares on

2162
01:25:37,070 --> 01:25:34,140
that checkerboard really the same they

2163
01:25:38,570 --> 01:25:37,080

can't be but they are but I've never

2164

01:25:40,250 --> 01:25:38,580

heard anyone after seeing a very good

2165

01:25:41,689 --> 01:25:40,260

optical illusion say well that does it

2166

01:25:43,250 --> 01:25:41,699

I'm not going to use my open my eyes

2167

01:25:45,070 --> 01:25:43,260

then from now forwards because they

2168

01:25:47,750 --> 01:25:45,080

might be wrong so

2169

01:25:49,610 --> 01:25:47,760

the the mode in which something comes to

2170

01:25:51,669 --> 01:25:49,620

one doesn't say either it's got to be

2171

01:25:54,590 --> 01:25:51,679

right or it's got to be wrong we need to

2172

01:25:57,050 --> 01:25:54,600

examine the experience see what its

2173

01:25:59,090 --> 01:25:57,060

effects on us are and and what I'm

2174

01:26:01,010 --> 01:25:59,100

suggesting is that experiences that have

2175

01:26:02,870 --> 01:26:01,020

long lasting benign effects from

2176

01:26:05,629 --> 01:26:02,880

somebody

2177

01:26:07,610 --> 01:26:05,639

oh not nothing and they are good which

2178

01:26:10,010 --> 01:26:07,620

is what the person believes they are

2179

01:26:11,750 --> 01:26:10,020

because what we're going to say is the

2180

01:26:13,430 --> 01:26:11,760

definition of this good experience if

2181

01:26:15,790 --> 01:26:13,440

it's not that it leads to good

2182

01:26:18,770 --> 01:26:15,800

consequences so

2183

01:26:20,990 --> 01:26:18,780

it's easy to dismiss things but that's

2184

01:26:23,270 --> 01:26:21,000

the lazy way you have to actually say

2185

01:26:25,550 --> 01:26:23,280

well some things no doubt deserve to be

2186

01:26:28,430 --> 01:26:25,560

dismissed some things don't

2187

01:26:30,590 --> 01:26:28,440

uh anyway

2188

01:26:33,590 --> 01:26:30,600

well I I want to buttress that first of

2189

01:26:35,629 --> 01:26:33,600

all yeah uh I I was thought I was not

2190

01:26:37,070 --> 01:26:35,639

reporting to argue give an argument from

2191

01:26:39,229 --> 01:26:37,080

the authority of a particular kind of

2192

01:26:41,629 --> 01:26:39,239

experience I think I think our culture

2193

01:26:43,669 --> 01:26:41,639

is I I don't think he desired I I think

2194

01:26:45,890 --> 01:26:43,679

our culture is beset by trying to find

2195

01:26:48,050 --> 01:26:45,900

the magical faculty that will give us

2196

01:26:50,870 --> 01:26:48,060

certainty this is a Cartesian wet dream

2197

01:26:52,970 --> 01:26:50,880

that we should abandon once and for all

2198

01:26:55,129 --> 01:26:52,980

um and also the other the other project

2199

01:26:57,110 --> 01:26:55,139

which is just this the flip side of it

2200

01:26:58,910 --> 01:26:57,120

finding the part the faculty that we

2201

01:27:00,649 --> 01:26:58,920

should demonize and scapegoat for all of

2202

01:27:01,970 --> 01:27:00,659

our failures I think we should give up

2203

01:27:04,430 --> 01:27:01,980

both of those projects they don't

2204

01:27:06,169 --> 01:27:04,440

comport well with how cognition works or

2205

01:27:07,729 --> 01:27:06,179

intelligence works or Consciousness

2206

01:27:09,169 --> 01:27:07,739

works so and I'm not saying you're

2207

01:27:11,450 --> 01:27:09,179

saying that Kurt I'm just responding to

2208

01:27:12,950 --> 01:27:11,460

your proposed uh perspective from The

2209

01:27:14,510 --> 01:27:12,960

Atheist

2210

01:27:17,629 --> 01:27:14,520

um secondly

2211

01:27:19,310 --> 01:27:17,639

um I said I I am suspicious of the

2212

01:27:21,050 --> 01:27:19,320

claims the propositional claims that

2213

01:27:23,149 --> 01:27:21,060

come out of the content of these

2214

01:27:25,070 --> 01:27:23,159

experience precisely because they vary

2215

01:27:27,890 --> 01:27:25,080

in the way you say

2216

01:27:30,470 --> 01:27:27,900

um what I make an argument for is we

2217

01:27:33,709 --> 01:27:30,480

have good reason and to believe that

2218

01:27:36,470 --> 01:27:33,719

these experiences are actually on a

2219

01:27:38,990 --> 01:27:36,480

Continuum with Insight experiences flow

2220

01:27:42,169 --> 01:27:39,000

experiences experiences by which we are

2221

01:27:45,110 --> 01:27:42,179

optimally sort of getting a a meta

2222

01:27:48,590 --> 01:27:45,120

optimal grip on the world uh where where

2223

01:27:51,530 --> 01:27:48,600

we are engaging in a kind of direct

2224

01:27:54,050 --> 01:27:51,540

sensory motor feedback with the world

2225

01:27:57,050 --> 01:27:54,060

Etc yes Harris is right there probably

2226

01:27:59,090 --> 01:27:57,060

is no tiger in the room what was he but

2227

01:28:00,830 --> 01:27:59,100

he doesn't bother to ask what might have

2228

01:28:03,229 --> 01:28:00,840

been happening

2229

01:28:05,810 --> 01:28:03,239

he just says well here's the proposition

2230

01:28:08,870 --> 01:28:05,820

that I came up with it's false therefore

2231

01:28:11,450 --> 01:28:08,880

everything was wrong well how do we know

2232

01:28:13,490 --> 01:28:11,460

how do we know what like why doesn't he

2233

01:28:15,410 --> 01:28:13,500

bother to ask why is a tiger being

2234

01:28:17,090 --> 01:28:15,420

thrown up in my altered perception of

2235

01:28:19,610 --> 01:28:17,100

the room

2236

01:28:23,030 --> 01:28:19,620

yeah there's no tiger there but what if

2237

01:28:26,450 --> 01:28:23,040

you were to say what what if what's that

2238

01:28:28,970 --> 01:28:26,460

the the very Act of coming up with the

2239

01:28:31,310 --> 01:28:28,980

tiger was connecting areas of cognition

2240

01:28:33,229 --> 01:28:31,320

that if he bothered to explore could

2241

01:28:35,930 --> 01:28:33,239

give him some more fundamental insight

2242

01:28:37,850 --> 01:28:35,940

into how he is perceiving or framing

2243

01:28:39,890 --> 01:28:37,860

things that's how many people within

2244

01:28:41,270 --> 01:28:39,900

these wisdom Traditions would respond to

2245

01:28:43,729 --> 01:28:41,280

him they would say well why did you stop

2246

01:28:45,470 --> 01:28:43,739

there why did you stop there why did you

2247

01:28:47,390 --> 01:28:45,480

why why didn't you talk to other people

2248

01:28:48,530 --> 01:28:47,400

and I mean when you when you're when

2249

01:28:50,930 --> 01:28:48,540

you're trying to determine if anything

2250

01:28:53,750 --> 01:28:50,940

else is real you stop after one moment

2251
01:28:57,110 --> 01:28:53,760
of thought or do you do do you do a lot

2252
01:28:58,310 --> 01:28:57,120
of science yeah firstly just to clarify

2253
01:28:59,990 --> 01:28:58,320
for the record I don't know if what he's

2254
01:29:01,669 --> 01:29:00,000
encountered was a tiger but it was some

2255
01:29:03,350 --> 01:29:01,679
other creature or being and I don't want

2256
01:29:05,930 --> 01:29:03,360
to spread misinformation but that's that

2257
01:29:07,129 --> 01:29:05,940
and then third and then secondly you

2258
01:29:10,250 --> 01:29:07,139
mentioned why didn't you talk to other

2259
01:29:12,709 --> 01:29:10,260
people okay interesting I was speaking

2260
01:29:14,689 --> 01:29:12,719
to Diana pasoka who's a professor of

2261
01:29:16,729 --> 01:29:14,699
religion and she was saying Kurt

2262
01:29:17,689 --> 01:29:16,739
something that's missing in all of these

2263
01:29:20,030 --> 01:29:17,699

modern

2264

01:29:21,709 --> 01:29:20,040

forms of religion which are spiritual

2265

01:29:24,890 --> 01:29:21,719

but not religious

2266

01:29:26,990 --> 01:29:24,900

is Sangha so a community yes totally

2267

01:29:29,990 --> 01:29:27,000

totally that's what I mean by Auto

2268

01:29:32,030 --> 01:29:30,000

didactic she said that that's even the

2269

01:29:34,070 --> 01:29:32,040

answer to Plato's Cave

2270

01:29:35,030 --> 01:29:34,080

then I asked her well is that in Plato's

2271

01:29:37,669 --> 01:29:35,040

Cave she said no it's in the Republic

2272

01:29:39,530 --> 01:29:37,679

and she gave me some explanation but

2273

01:29:42,470 --> 01:29:39,540

regardless from my understanding of the

2274

01:29:44,149 --> 01:29:42,480

non-theist position or neoplatonism I

2275

01:29:46,129 --> 01:29:44,159

think Peugeot says you can't simply

2276
01:29:48,530 --> 01:29:46,139
resurrect a religion from reading books

2277
01:29:50,030 --> 01:29:48,540
how is it that we become neoplatonists

2278
01:29:51,830 --> 01:29:50,040
is it truly a religion that you're

2279
01:29:52,850 --> 01:29:51,840
enacting well first of all I want to I

2280
01:29:54,709 --> 01:29:52,860
want to first of all pick up on the

2281
01:29:56,930 --> 01:29:54,719
first point yeah I don't mean to be

2282
01:29:58,910 --> 01:29:56,940
misspeaking if I'm incorrectly no no no

2283
01:30:00,770 --> 01:29:58,920
no no no no no no no no no no no I

2284
01:30:02,270 --> 01:30:00,780
mean this is this is all this is at the

2285
01:30:03,830 --> 01:30:02,280
core of the whole dialectic and to deal

2286
01:30:06,410 --> 01:30:03,840
with this project that I've engaged in

2287
01:30:08,209 --> 01:30:06,420
the after Socrates the which is

2288
01:30:10,729 --> 01:30:08,219

convergent from with all of this

2289

01:30:14,030 --> 01:30:10,739

increasing information that when people

2290

01:30:17,270 --> 01:30:14,040

are that reason I'll use Ian's word then

2291

01:30:20,169 --> 01:30:17,280

is uh evolved to be carried out

2292

01:30:21,950 --> 01:30:20,179

dialogically not monologically

2293

01:30:24,530 --> 01:30:21,960

multi-perspectively not model

2294

01:30:28,070 --> 01:30:24,540

perspectival right that we do not have a

2295

01:30:28,790 --> 01:30:28,080

magnetic self we have a fluid etc etc

2296

01:30:30,890 --> 01:30:28,800

etc

2297

01:30:32,090 --> 01:30:30,900

what's some of that evidence okay you

2298

01:30:35,090 --> 01:30:32,100

are you're familiar with the wasted

2299

01:30:37,310 --> 01:30:35,100

selection fast right people smart

2300

01:30:38,510 --> 01:30:37,320

educated people you give them a very

2301
01:30:40,729 --> 01:30:38,520
simple

2302
01:30:42,530 --> 01:30:40,739
reasoning experiment and only 10 of them

2303
01:30:45,470 --> 01:30:42,540
get it right reliably no replication

2304
01:30:47,870 --> 01:30:45,480
crisis on this robustly take the exact

2305
01:30:49,070 --> 01:30:47,880
same thing Let There be four people and

2306
01:30:52,070 --> 01:30:49,080
they're allowed to talk to each other

2307
01:30:55,550 --> 01:30:52,080
the success rate goes reliably from 10

2308
01:30:58,070 --> 01:30:55,560
to 80 yeah reliably that is and that is

2309
01:31:00,110 --> 01:30:58,080
not exhaustive read uh the Enigma of

2310
01:31:02,149 --> 01:31:00,120
Reason by Mercer and spur bear others

2311
01:31:04,370 --> 01:31:02,159
this just overwhelming evidence that we

2312
01:31:08,810 --> 01:31:04,380
have we have this mana and that's my

2313
01:31:11,390 --> 01:31:08,820

point to to Harris never questions I

2314

01:31:13,189 --> 01:31:11,400

mean at least the Harris of your example

2315

01:31:15,050 --> 01:31:13,199

maybe it's not the actual Harris right

2316

01:31:17,209 --> 01:31:15,060

but I I don't want it that's the name

2317

01:31:20,390 --> 01:31:17,219

I'm going to use this right he doesn't

2318

01:31:22,610 --> 01:31:20,400

question the monological frame from

2319

01:31:24,530 --> 01:31:22,620

which he is giving an answer and the

2320

01:31:27,790 --> 01:31:24,540

point is well

2321

01:31:30,110 --> 01:31:27,800

that's not how reason evolved to work

2322

01:31:32,530 --> 01:31:30,120

reasons should be carried out and this

2323

01:31:34,790 --> 01:31:32,540

is a I think the core Socratic claim

2324

01:31:37,010 --> 01:31:34,800

dialogically no there's dialogue there's

2325

01:31:39,229 --> 01:31:37,020

the theologos with other people

2326

01:31:42,470 --> 01:31:39,239

but you also have to practice the deal

2327

01:31:44,689 --> 01:31:42,480

logos within the psyche this is again a

2328

01:31:46,790 --> 01:31:44,699

proper platonic idea and those two

2329

01:31:49,010 --> 01:31:46,800

dialogues those two forms of deal logos

2330

01:31:52,729 --> 01:31:49,020

they have to be resonant with each other

2331

01:31:57,470 --> 01:31:52,739

in a profound way and for me that is

2332

01:32:00,770 --> 01:31:57,480

that is most properly how to try and be

2333

01:32:03,410 --> 01:32:00,780

as reasonable as I possibly can Will it

2334

01:32:05,149 --> 01:32:03,420

give me certainty no but as Ian said

2335

01:32:07,310 --> 01:32:05,159

nothing does

2336

01:32:09,050 --> 01:32:07,320

right if your criteria is well that

2337

01:32:11,209 --> 01:32:09,060

could fail therefore I reject it then

2338

01:32:13,970 --> 01:32:11,219

you are an absolute soul of cystic

2339

01:32:15,890 --> 01:32:13,980

skeptic and then if you and if I ask you

2340

01:32:17,930 --> 01:32:15,900

okay what do you do to well I talk to

2341

01:32:20,330 --> 01:32:17,940

other people I reflect them I ask

2342

01:32:22,189 --> 01:32:20,340

questions I like well do that with these

2343

01:32:23,689 --> 01:32:22,199

experiences too nobody's telling you

2344

01:32:26,209 --> 01:32:23,699

take the experience and then just accept

2345

01:32:28,189 --> 01:32:26,219

it take these experiences put them in

2346

01:32:30,350 --> 01:32:28,199

this framework make sure independent of

2347

01:32:32,570 --> 01:32:30,360

this Frame of these experience that this

2348

01:32:35,870 --> 01:32:32,580

framework is working profoundly to help

2349

01:32:38,149 --> 01:32:35,880

you self-correct catch your bias catch

2350

01:32:40,850 --> 01:32:38,159

your flaws and then integrate the two

2351
01:32:44,030 --> 01:32:40,860
together and for me that's would make it

2352
01:32:45,610 --> 01:32:44,040
much more like a religion than just a

2353
01:32:47,689 --> 01:32:45,620
belief system in the modern

2354
01:32:49,430 --> 01:32:47,699
Enlightenment sense of a belief system

2355
01:32:51,350 --> 01:32:49,440
did that answer your question Kurt

2356
01:32:52,910 --> 01:32:51,360
generally it takes me days of reflection

2357
01:32:53,810 --> 01:32:52,920
to realize if something answered my

2358
01:32:55,669 --> 01:32:53,820
question

2359
01:32:57,169 --> 01:32:55,679
fair enough that's exactly that's

2360
01:32:58,209 --> 01:32:57,179
exactly right that's exactly the right

2361
01:33:02,450 --> 01:32:58,219
answer

2362
01:33:05,110 --> 01:33:02,460
no I I just think your point no well

2363
01:33:08,030 --> 01:33:05,120

first of all I think that it cannot be

2364

01:33:11,750 --> 01:33:08,040

overstated how important that point of

2365

01:33:14,330 --> 01:33:11,760

community is at the core of religion and

2366

01:33:15,709 --> 01:33:14,340

it's what is one of the roots of what we

2367

01:33:18,229 --> 01:33:15,719

started by talking about the meaning

2368

01:33:20,149 --> 01:33:18,239

crisis yes meaning is held by

2369

01:33:23,450 --> 01:33:20,159

communities that have common history of

2370

01:33:26,450 --> 01:33:23,460

common narrative common myths and a

2371

01:33:27,950 --> 01:33:26,460

sense of belonging which is you know you

2372

01:33:32,629 --> 01:33:27,960

talked I think

2373

01:33:34,729 --> 01:33:32,639

um about uh John about the um I I don't

2374

01:33:35,810 --> 01:33:34,739

know what you called it D domiciled or

2375

01:33:37,970 --> 01:33:35,820

something but I mean if they can't

2376

01:33:40,430 --> 01:33:37,980

decide yeah yeah we know we no longer

2377

01:33:43,430 --> 01:33:40,440

have a home we no longer feel we belong

2378

01:33:45,350 --> 01:33:43,440

somewhere and that sense of belonging is

2379

01:33:47,510 --> 01:33:45,360

part of meaning and one gets it from

2380

01:33:49,669 --> 01:33:47,520

belonging to a functional family and

2381

01:33:52,129 --> 01:33:49,679

belonging to a functional Society there

2382

01:33:55,729 --> 01:33:52,139

is no such thing as an atomistic

2383

01:33:57,770 --> 01:33:55,739

individual we emerge from society and we

2384

01:34:00,050 --> 01:33:57,780

give back to society and we're in

2385

01:34:02,270 --> 01:34:00,060

constant communion with society and what

2386

01:34:04,850 --> 01:34:02,280

a religion does is to strengthen those

2387

01:34:07,550 --> 01:34:04,860

bonds and the feelings of empathy which

2388

01:34:10,010 --> 01:34:07,560

lead to extraordinary effects on

2389

01:34:12,530 --> 01:34:10,020

cognition on emotion on well-being

2390

01:34:14,510 --> 01:34:12,540

including physical well-being and mental

2391

01:34:16,790 --> 01:34:14,520

well-being obviously and the evidence

2392

01:34:18,950 --> 01:34:16,800

about this is so strong and it's not

2393

01:34:22,070 --> 01:34:18,960

widely known but I give it in the very

2394

01:34:24,050 --> 01:34:22,080

last part of um of the matter with

2395

01:34:26,209 --> 01:34:24,060

things so I think that's a very good

2396

01:34:28,910 --> 01:34:26,219

point I think another point is that we

2397

01:34:32,090 --> 01:34:28,920

we shouldn't over emphasize the

2398

01:34:34,250 --> 01:34:32,100

importance of you know mystical moments

2399

01:34:35,629 --> 01:34:34,260

we may or may not have them I mean a

2400

01:34:37,669 --> 01:34:35,639

very important thing is that many

2401
01:34:39,530 --> 01:34:37,679
spiritual people have never experienced

2402
01:34:43,070 --> 01:34:39,540
these things but are deeply good and

2403
01:34:45,649 --> 01:34:43,080
wise so there are and many people who

2404
01:34:47,810 --> 01:34:45,659
have achieved that state say you know if

2405
01:34:49,910 --> 01:34:47,820
you have a some sort of a you know a

2406
01:34:51,649 --> 01:34:49,920
vision or something that's great but

2407
01:34:53,930 --> 01:34:51,659
really forget about it and go back to

2408
01:34:56,450 --> 01:34:53,940
getting on with religion so it's okay

2409
01:34:59,030 --> 01:34:56,460
the icing on the cake it's the in a way

2410
01:35:01,430 --> 01:34:59,040
it's slightly too much of a lure for

2411
01:35:03,590 --> 01:35:01,440
people nowadays oh you know I want some

2412
01:35:05,530 --> 01:35:03,600
Sensational experience but it's not

2413
01:35:07,910 --> 01:35:05,540

really about The Sensational experience

2414

01:35:10,610 --> 01:35:07,920

the next thing I'm sorry because I've

2415

01:35:13,310 --> 01:35:10,620

been holding back on a yeah yeah yeah

2416

01:35:15,350 --> 01:35:13,320

I'm trying to say them very very quickly

2417

01:35:17,390 --> 01:35:15,360

another is that I think that what

2418

01:35:19,010 --> 01:35:17,400

happens when one takes psychedelic drugs

2419

01:35:20,629 --> 01:35:19,020

people have sometimes said to me does

2420

01:35:23,450 --> 01:35:20,639

this not shut down the left hemisphere

2421

01:35:27,550 --> 01:35:23,460

and at least right not at all in fact um

2422

01:35:30,470 --> 01:35:27,560

most um aberrant versions or or

2423

01:35:33,050 --> 01:35:30,480

peculiar versions unusual versions of

2424

01:35:35,450 --> 01:35:33,060

reality in the sense of hallucination to

2425

01:35:37,310 --> 01:35:35,460

delusions Anyway come from the left

2426
01:35:39,890 --> 01:35:37,320
hemisphere something I go into the very

2427
01:35:42,350 --> 01:35:39,900
fast part of the matter with things but

2428
01:35:45,770 --> 01:35:42,360
I think what happens is that the frontal

2429
01:35:47,629 --> 01:35:45,780
lobes are relatively shut down and I

2430
01:35:50,810 --> 01:35:47,639
think there's Imaging evidence that this

2431
01:35:52,850 --> 01:35:50,820
is the case so this lower

2432
01:35:54,649 --> 01:35:52,860
um circulation in the frontal load and

2433
01:35:57,590 --> 01:35:54,659
of course what the frontal waves are

2434
01:36:00,290 --> 01:35:57,600
above all is a filter and when you stop

2435
01:36:03,169 --> 01:36:00,300
filtering what the brain is proving to

2436
01:36:04,910 --> 01:36:03,179
then you get good and bad you may be

2437
01:36:07,550 --> 01:36:04,920
lucky and have a good experience you may

2438
01:36:09,169 --> 01:36:07,560

have a terrible experience and in fact I

2439

01:36:11,149 --> 01:36:09,179

believe that terribly although the

2440

01:36:14,149 --> 01:36:11,159

literature tends to stress the good

2441

01:36:15,229 --> 01:36:14,159

experiences terrible experiences bad

2442

01:36:17,990 --> 01:36:15,239

trips

2443

01:36:19,490 --> 01:36:18,000

um under reported in the sense that

2444

01:36:21,110 --> 01:36:19,500

they're not talked about but they're

2445

01:36:23,930 --> 01:36:21,120

very real and they happen an awful lot

2446

01:36:25,490 --> 01:36:23,940

so I I just wanted to make you know a

2447

01:36:28,570 --> 01:36:25,500

few points that we're getting off too

2448

01:36:31,729 --> 01:36:28,580

much onto emphasizing you know the very

2449

01:36:34,129 --> 01:36:31,739

unusual and to go back to this idea of

2450

01:36:36,410 --> 01:36:34,139

imagination in which you see into things

2451

01:36:38,390 --> 01:36:36,420

that you thought you knew and then

2452

01:36:41,629 --> 01:36:38,400

realize that you know them for the very

2453

01:36:44,030 --> 01:36:41,639

first time and that experience is a

2454

01:36:46,070 --> 01:36:44,040

sacred experience

2455

01:36:48,110 --> 01:36:46,080

so I wanna I wanna pick up on two things

2456

01:36:51,110 --> 01:36:48,120

that Ian said

2457

01:36:52,250 --> 01:36:51,120

um that's what I that's what I meant

2458

01:36:54,410 --> 01:36:52,260

when I said I wasn't holding these

2459

01:36:55,610 --> 01:36:54,420

experiences up as authoritative and I'm

2460

01:36:58,010 --> 01:36:55,620

also not saying everybody should have

2461

01:37:00,890 --> 01:36:58,020

them what I'm saying is we need to have

2462

01:37:03,770 --> 01:37:00,900

ways of life that uh properly hone them

2463

01:37:05,750 --> 01:37:03,780

and that that are beautified by them I

2464

01:37:07,090 --> 01:37:05,760

don't think everybody has to have them

2465

01:37:13,850 --> 01:37:07,100

but

2466

01:37:15,890 --> 01:37:13,860

ways of life in which many people can

2467

01:37:19,010 --> 01:37:15,900

benefit from some people having them is

2468

01:37:21,110 --> 01:37:19,020

what I would say yes and then the second

2469

01:37:21,950 --> 01:37:21,120

thing I would say is

2470

01:37:24,950 --> 01:37:21,960

um

2471

01:37:27,709 --> 01:37:24,960

look uh you know you know this Kirk

2472

01:37:29,930 --> 01:37:27,719

neural network overfitting to the data

2473

01:37:32,689 --> 01:37:29,940

what do you have to do you have to do

2474

01:37:34,250 --> 01:37:32,699

Dropout turn off half the nodes or you

2475

01:37:37,430 --> 01:37:34,260

have to throw noise in or step into

2476

01:37:39,530 --> 01:37:37,440

Dixon people are impassing on any on an

2477

01:37:42,050 --> 01:37:39,540

Insight problem and you literally put

2478

01:37:45,229 --> 01:37:42,060

visual static into it and they get the

2479

01:37:47,270 --> 01:37:45,239

Insight or the the mild mind wandering

2480

01:37:49,669 --> 01:37:47,280

that helps people have an Insight yeah

2481

01:37:52,910 --> 01:37:49,679

you have to you you have to throw some

2482

01:37:55,189 --> 01:37:52,920

noise and the noise noise isn't

2483

01:37:56,990 --> 01:37:55,199

noise is noise it's destructive it's

2484

01:37:59,270 --> 01:37:57,000

frame breaking that's horrific that's

2485

01:38:02,450 --> 01:37:59,280

why you the the the the sacred always

2486

01:38:05,390 --> 01:38:02,460

has a terrific or horrific aspect to it

2487

01:38:08,209 --> 01:38:05,400

and eyes connected to awful

2488

01:38:09,770 --> 01:38:08,219

for good reason right but throw but you

2489

01:38:11,870 --> 01:38:09,780

you know the reverse if you don't ever

2490

01:38:14,689 --> 01:38:11,880

throw any noise into the neural network

2491

01:38:16,729 --> 01:38:14,699

what happens it overfits to the data it

2492

01:38:19,390 --> 01:38:16,739

doesn't generalize it fixates it gets

2493

01:38:21,950 --> 01:38:19,400

locked into a local minimum

2494

01:38:24,110 --> 01:38:21,960

Woodward and other people do that we

2495

01:38:26,149 --> 01:38:24,120

have we have you know we can have

2496

01:38:29,570 --> 01:38:26,159

psychedelic experiences or meditative

2497

01:38:32,030 --> 01:38:29,580

experiences or sensory motor experiences

2498

01:38:34,129 --> 01:38:32,040

that break that do that massive frame

2499

01:38:35,930 --> 01:38:34,139

breaking but it's not just a frame

2500

01:38:37,729 --> 01:38:35,940

breaking that I don't think people

2501

01:38:40,189 --> 01:38:37,739

should just have these experiences in

2502

01:38:44,030 --> 01:38:40,199

fact I'm arguing the exact opposite we

2503

01:38:46,790 --> 01:38:44,040

need to have a proper like a sapiential

2504

01:38:50,090 --> 01:38:46,800

sacred Community around them so that

2505

01:38:53,890 --> 01:38:50,100

that frame breaking is compensated with

2506

01:38:57,169 --> 01:38:53,900

a lot of resources for brain making

2507

01:38:58,729 --> 01:38:57,179

that's what I'm trying to propose that's

2508

01:39:01,729 --> 01:38:58,739

what I'm trying to propose

2509

01:39:03,830 --> 01:39:01,739

um I just wanted to comment briefly on I

2510

01:39:06,709 --> 01:39:03,840

agree with all that you said

2511

01:39:09,350 --> 01:39:06,719

um the the idea of putting interference

2512

01:39:10,790 --> 01:39:09,360

in is not that I just want to

2513

01:39:13,910 --> 01:39:10,800

distinguish between two possibilities

2514

01:39:17,750 --> 01:39:13,920

one I believe is wrong and that is the

2515

01:39:20,330 --> 01:39:17,760

idea that somehow distraction is what is

2516

01:39:23,390 --> 01:39:20,340

good going on there what is good there

2517

01:39:26,450 --> 01:39:23,400

is that you at last I'm not sure that

2518

01:39:28,610 --> 01:39:26,460

you know so we're constantly going

2519

01:39:30,110 --> 01:39:28,620

familiar familiar familiar I get it I

2520

01:39:32,209 --> 01:39:30,120

know what it is and that's a very

2521

01:39:33,590 --> 01:39:32,219

uncreative state that is what the left

2522

01:39:36,950 --> 01:39:33,600

hemisphere

2523

01:39:39,350 --> 01:39:36,960

um brings to us a representation of life

2524

01:39:43,390 --> 01:39:39,360

that is clear and comprehensible and

2525

01:39:46,430 --> 01:39:43,400

sanitized and what they in in

2526

01:39:48,350 --> 01:39:46,440

informational kind of distraction is is

2527

01:39:50,390 --> 01:39:48,360

it's not the distraction in itself it's

2528

01:39:52,090 --> 01:39:50,400

the the rattling of arcades that we

2529

01:39:54,470 --> 01:39:52,100

don't actually know what's going on here

2530

01:39:56,649 --> 01:39:54,480

exactly that's exactly that's exactly

2531

01:39:59,330 --> 01:39:56,659

what I'm saying

2532

01:40:00,530 --> 01:39:59,340

yeah I don't want I don't want I I don't

2533

01:40:02,570 --> 01:40:00,540

want Elliot's distracted from

2534

01:40:05,149 --> 01:40:02,580

distraction by Distraction what I meant

2535

01:40:07,669 --> 01:40:05,159

is like that that you disidentify from

2536

01:40:10,729 --> 01:40:07,679

the framing enough that it can break up

2537

01:40:12,350 --> 01:40:10,739

you put criticality exactly so it can

2538

01:40:14,689 --> 01:40:12,360

self-organize a new that's what I would

2539

01:40:16,910 --> 01:40:14,699

say I completely agree yeah

2540

01:40:19,790 --> 01:40:16,920

where does faith enter into this

2541

01:40:22,010 --> 01:40:19,800

when I hear much about unknowing I was

2542

01:40:24,229 --> 01:40:22,020

reading about Nicholas of kuza and

2543

01:40:25,850 --> 01:40:24,239

someone said either commentary on him or

2544

01:40:27,530 --> 01:40:25,860

he said you must strive upward

2545

01:40:30,770 --> 01:40:27,540

unknowingly where does faith enter into

2546

01:40:32,689 --> 01:40:30,780

this so what are you I know you have a

2547

01:40:36,709 --> 01:40:32,699

partner

2548

01:40:38,629 --> 01:40:36,719

um and you uh are you know what if I ask

2549

01:40:40,010 --> 01:40:38,639

you are you going to be faithful to her

2550

01:40:42,169 --> 01:40:40,020

and I'm not asking you to divulge

2551

01:40:44,570 --> 01:40:42,179

privacy right but are you talking to me

2552

01:40:46,610 --> 01:40:44,580

or are you I'm talking to you I mean you

2553

01:40:48,229 --> 01:40:46,620

you're you if you love somebody there is

2554

01:40:51,169 --> 01:40:48,239

a call to faithfulness does that mean

2555

01:40:53,450 --> 01:40:51,179

you have a complete account of them

2556

01:40:55,189 --> 01:40:53,460

no that's ridiculous does it mean you

2557

01:40:56,810 --> 01:40:55,199

have an absolute certainty about them no

2558

01:40:58,189 --> 01:40:56,820

they're going to surprise you again and

2559

01:41:00,410 --> 01:40:58,199

again and again meet people that have

2560

01:41:03,350 --> 01:41:00,420

been married 25 years deeply in love and

2561

01:41:05,870 --> 01:41:03,360

they'll say man my partner can surprise

2562

01:41:08,510 --> 01:41:05,880

me again and again I never it's never

2563

01:41:10,550 --> 01:41:08,520

done it's never done this is my this is

2564

01:41:12,950 --> 01:41:10,560

my experience right so faithfulness

2565

01:41:15,410 --> 01:41:12,960

Faith doesn't mean I have certainty it

2566

01:41:17,570 --> 01:41:15,420

doesn't mean that I have a completion of

2567

01:41:19,930 --> 01:41:17,580

you that I rasp you that I can

2568

01:41:23,390 --> 01:41:19,940

manipulate you at will in fact it means

2569

01:41:27,290 --> 01:41:23,400

ah it doesn't mean any of those it means

2570

01:41:29,930 --> 01:41:27,300

that I have bound myself to you so that

2571

01:41:31,669 --> 01:41:29,940

I understand that there are truths about

2572

01:41:33,229 --> 01:41:31,679

you that will not be disclosed to me

2573

01:41:35,629 --> 01:41:33,239

unless I'm willing to undergo

2574

01:41:38,810 --> 01:41:35,639

transformation in relationship to you

2575

01:41:41,629 --> 01:41:38,820

and and allow you to do the same with me

2576

01:41:43,490 --> 01:41:41,639

it was a these are transformative truths

2577

01:41:45,350 --> 01:41:43,500

that are disclosed by maintaining a

2578

01:41:47,209 --> 01:41:45,360

continuity of contact and an

2579

01:41:49,870 --> 01:41:47,219

understanding that we are going to

2580

01:41:52,490 --> 01:41:49,880

reciprocally open with each other

2581

01:41:54,649 --> 01:41:52,500

learned ignorance is the place at which

2582

01:41:56,870 --> 01:41:54,659

you are most able to do that with the

2583

01:41:58,550 --> 01:41:56,880

ground of being you are you are

2584

01:42:00,470 --> 01:41:58,560

reciprocally opening to its

2585

01:42:03,169 --> 01:42:00,480

inexhaustibleness and you are being

2586

01:42:06,109 --> 01:42:03,179

reciprocally transformed by that opening

2587

01:42:08,990 --> 01:42:06,119

again and again it's not that you come

2588

01:42:10,850 --> 01:42:09,000

to some some conclusive statement that

2589

01:42:12,950 --> 01:42:10,860

you can make it is the same kind of

2590

01:42:15,050 --> 01:42:12,960

sense you have of the depth of

2591

01:42:17,990 --> 01:42:15,060

connectedness you have to somebody you

2592

01:42:20,450 --> 01:42:18,000

have been faithful to and it grows the

2593

01:42:23,030 --> 01:42:20,460

longer you've been faithful and they've

2594

01:42:24,430 --> 01:42:23,040

been Faith you've the the language that

2595

01:42:27,050 --> 01:42:24,440

we've been together

2596

01:42:29,629 --> 01:42:27,060

we should give up the idea of Faith as

2597

01:42:31,669 --> 01:42:29,639

the assertion of things without evidence

2598

01:42:33,410 --> 01:42:31,679

there's all kinds of evidence in your

2599

01:42:36,530 --> 01:42:33,420

relationship but if I was to say could

2600

01:42:38,090 --> 01:42:36,540

you deduce or induce or abduce that you

2601
01:42:39,709 --> 01:42:38,100
should stay with your partner because of

2602
01:42:41,990 --> 01:42:39,719
this evidence you'd say no that's

2603
01:42:44,689 --> 01:42:42,000
ridiculous it's way more than that and

2604
01:42:47,209 --> 01:42:44,699
that's exactly the faithfulness element

2605
01:42:49,550 --> 01:42:47,219
lan this reciprocal opening the way that

2606
01:42:51,470 --> 01:42:49,560
I imagine or the way that one generally

2607
01:42:53,930 --> 01:42:51,480
imagines God is that yes you can open up

2608
01:42:56,209 --> 01:42:53,940
to God but it's not as if God is

2609
01:42:57,830 --> 01:42:56,219
changing because of you now I know that

2610
01:43:00,050 --> 01:42:57,840
that means that there's a static view of

2611
01:43:03,169 --> 01:43:00,060
God and perhaps we should live away from

2612
01:43:05,830 --> 01:43:03,179
that yeah that we don't know that

2613
01:43:09,169 --> 01:43:05,840

um I actually believe with Whitehead

2614

01:43:12,709 --> 01:43:09,179

that the World by which he meant the

2615

01:43:14,450 --> 01:43:12,719

whole experiential Cosmos and God

2616

01:43:17,270 --> 01:43:14,460

are coming into being together

2617

01:43:19,430 --> 01:43:17,280

reciprocally and that we therefore have

2618

01:43:22,609 --> 01:43:19,440

a part to play a very important part so

2619

01:43:25,490 --> 01:43:22,619

it actually matters how we respond to

2620

01:43:27,169 --> 01:43:25,500

the world what we make of it what we see

2621

01:43:28,550 --> 01:43:27,179

in it and what we give back to it I'm

2622

01:43:30,590 --> 01:43:28,560

just going to go and put a light on I

2623

01:43:32,689 --> 01:43:30,600

didn't want to do it well John oh yes

2624

01:43:39,229 --> 01:43:32,699

because it seems a bit rude but I'm just

2625

01:43:43,010 --> 01:43:40,609

not sure this doesn't make any

2626

01:43:44,590 --> 01:43:43,020

difference but night is falling here

2627

01:43:47,890 --> 01:43:44,600

um

2628

01:43:52,990 --> 01:43:47,900

you kind of film The Walrus though Ian

2629

01:43:58,070 --> 01:43:55,910

you're lit on one side that's absolutely

2630

01:43:59,450 --> 01:43:58,080

fine yes I like asymmetry as you

2631

01:44:01,550 --> 01:43:59,460

probably know

2632

01:44:03,169 --> 01:44:01,560

um so yes

2633

01:44:05,209 --> 01:44:03,179

um where were we we were talking about

2634

01:44:06,830 --> 01:44:05,219

you were talking about right head and

2635

01:44:08,450 --> 01:44:06,840

yeah in the reciprocal opening between

2636

01:44:10,370 --> 01:44:08,460

goddesses it's a super glow opening so I

2637

01:44:13,010 --> 01:44:10,380

think that is a very important idea and

2638

01:44:14,930 --> 01:44:13,020

I think that another thing that um is

2639

01:44:18,169 --> 01:44:14,940

worth saying while talking about faith

2640

01:44:21,290 --> 01:44:18,179

is there is a similar duality in the

2641

01:44:23,629 --> 01:44:21,300

idea of belief so for example

2642

01:44:26,090 --> 01:44:23,639

um I can say I believe in a certain

2643

01:44:29,270 --> 01:44:26,100

person you know I really believe in him

2644

01:44:32,570 --> 01:44:29,280

it means I put my trust in him or her

2645

01:44:35,090 --> 01:44:32,580

and it and the point there is that there

2646

01:44:37,550 --> 01:44:35,100

is something about them that almost

2647

01:44:40,010 --> 01:44:37,560

places a responsibility on me to respond

2648

01:44:42,530 --> 01:44:40,020

but you're also by that very fact it

2649

01:44:45,410 --> 01:44:42,540

also places a responsibility on them to

2650

01:44:47,030 --> 01:44:45,420

be true to what it is I believe in you

2651
01:44:49,550 --> 01:44:47,040
know if they let you down then there has

2652
01:44:52,930 --> 01:44:49,560
been a failure of this relationship so

2653
01:44:55,310 --> 01:44:52,940
that what we are doing in life is always

2654
01:44:57,169 --> 01:44:55,320
assessing and helping to grow certain

2655
01:44:59,390 --> 01:44:57,179
relationships there is no certainty

2656
01:45:03,290 --> 01:44:59,400
about anything at all but that doesn't

2657
01:45:05,810 --> 01:45:03,300
make it blind yes this concept of faith

2658
01:45:10,490 --> 01:45:05,820
is blind needs to be put to bed once and

2659
01:45:13,129 --> 01:45:10,500
for all if I am forwarding a stream and

2660
01:45:16,970 --> 01:45:13,139
my companion has gone ahead across the

2661
01:45:19,729 --> 01:45:16,980
stream and as I get near the bank I need

2662
01:45:23,090 --> 01:45:19,739
a hand and he or she holds out a hand to

2663
01:45:25,729 --> 01:45:23,100

me it's not a random hand it's not like

2664

01:45:28,370 --> 01:45:25,739

blind to trust this hand I have to step

2665

01:45:30,590 --> 01:45:28,380

and I have to take the hand and and

2666

01:45:33,290 --> 01:45:30,600

that's that's the way I see it that you

2667

01:45:35,750 --> 01:45:33,300

see something that is calling to you and

2668

01:45:37,550 --> 01:45:35,760

saying if you understand this it will

2669

01:45:39,290 --> 01:45:37,560

radically change the way you think about

2670

01:45:41,450 --> 01:45:39,300

the world and there is no one right way

2671

01:45:42,890 --> 01:45:41,460

to know so just to say well I think I've

2672

01:45:44,510 --> 01:45:42,900

already got it and I'm not going to try

2673

01:45:46,850 --> 01:45:44,520

this at all I'm not going to put myself

2674

01:45:48,410 --> 01:45:46,860

in the way of something happening that's

2675

01:45:52,370 --> 01:45:48,420

really what I'm saying it has to be

2676

01:45:54,290 --> 01:45:52,380

experiential as John and I agree

2677

01:45:56,270 --> 01:45:54,300

um but what that means is that you do

2678

01:45:58,129 --> 01:45:56,280

have a responsibility to put yourself in

2679

01:46:00,890 --> 01:45:58,139

the way of something happening

2680

01:46:02,510 --> 01:46:00,900

um you know if you sit at home saying I

2681

01:46:04,129 --> 01:46:02,520

want to marry but I'll never I'll never

2682

01:46:06,470 --> 01:46:04,139

meet any but you never ever leave the

2683

01:46:07,970 --> 01:46:06,480

home you'll never get married so if you

2684

01:46:09,890 --> 01:46:07,980

want to you you don't know who you will

2685

01:46:11,870 --> 01:46:09,900

marry it's entirely unpredictable it may

2686

01:46:13,550 --> 01:46:11,880

be chance what happens but nonetheless

2687

01:46:15,109 --> 01:46:13,560

you have to open yourself to the

2688

01:46:17,090 --> 01:46:15,119

possibility otherwise it won't happen

2689

01:46:18,770 --> 01:46:17,100

and the same I think is true of our

2690

01:46:20,990 --> 01:46:18,780

relationship with

2691

01:46:22,450 --> 01:46:21,000

with the cosmos at large which I believe

2692

01:46:26,410 --> 01:46:22,460

is a living

2693

01:46:30,530 --> 01:46:26,420

organismic entity a conscious entity

2694

01:46:32,810 --> 01:46:30,540

or God depending on what it is to be I

2695

01:46:33,609 --> 01:46:32,820

don't want to rule anybody's

2696

01:46:36,530 --> 01:46:33,619

um

2697

01:46:38,930 --> 01:46:36,540

attempt to make this encounter out just

2698

01:46:41,270 --> 01:46:38,940

because of the word

2699

01:46:43,970 --> 01:46:41,280

I wanted to pick up on the the you know

2700

01:46:45,709 --> 01:46:43,980

the connections between you know trust

2701

01:46:48,050 --> 01:46:45,719

trough

2702

01:46:49,609 --> 01:46:48,060

truth we talk about being being

2703

01:46:51,649 --> 01:46:49,619

betrothed to somebody we talk about

2704

01:46:53,930 --> 01:46:51,659

being true to somebody there's deep

2705

01:46:56,510 --> 01:46:53,940

connections between these and and and

2706

01:46:58,850 --> 01:46:56,520

we've come up with the notion of faith

2707

01:47:01,129 --> 01:46:58,860

that is so disconnected from that

2708

01:47:03,709 --> 01:47:01,139

interconnecting set you know truth and

2709

01:47:06,050 --> 01:47:03,719

trough and Trust uh it's that that

2710

01:47:07,430 --> 01:47:06,060

that's just a fundamental mistake we

2711

01:47:08,689 --> 01:47:07,440

need a sense of that's why I propose the

2712

01:47:10,430 --> 01:47:08,699

notion of faithfulness because many

2713

01:47:11,870 --> 01:47:10,440

people hear something different in

2714

01:47:14,390 --> 01:47:11,880

faithfulness than they do to Faith

2715

01:47:17,030 --> 01:47:14,400

because it connects with that being true

2716

01:47:18,590 --> 01:47:17,040

to right betrothing yourself to somebody

2717

01:47:22,810 --> 01:47:18,600

trusting

2718

01:47:28,910 --> 01:47:25,910

good have you gone anywhere to answering

2719

01:47:30,470 --> 01:47:28,920

anything of your your questions I need

2720

01:47:32,510 --> 01:47:30,480

to think about this I generally think

2721

01:47:34,070 --> 01:47:32,520

more when I'm editing too do you hear

2722

01:47:36,410 --> 01:47:34,080

something interesting talking about the

2723

01:47:38,870 --> 01:47:36,420

Flow State there's also this adage that

2724

01:47:40,430 --> 01:47:38,880

we need to be more present and that life

2725

01:47:43,729 --> 01:47:40,440

will just pass you by if you're not

2726

01:47:45,350 --> 01:47:43,739

present however when one isn't at least

2727

01:47:47,510 --> 01:47:45,360

when I'm in the Flow State

2728

01:47:49,430 --> 01:47:47,520

maybe I'm present but life is certainly

2729

01:47:50,870 --> 01:47:49,440

passing me by in the sense that if you

2730

01:47:52,850 --> 01:47:50,880

stop me right now you say Kurt am I in

2731

01:47:54,470 --> 01:47:52,860

the Flow State I realize actually yes I

2732

01:47:55,910 --> 01:47:54,480

have been in the Flow State so much time

2733

01:47:57,649 --> 01:47:55,920

has passed by but I can consciously

2734

01:47:59,870 --> 01:47:57,659

remember little of it but that doesn't

2735

01:48:04,250 --> 01:47:59,880

mean that it's not implicit an estimated

2736

01:48:06,770 --> 01:48:04,260

over precise estimate of the amount of

2737

01:48:10,790 --> 01:48:06,780

the stuff that our brain is processing

2738

01:48:13,550 --> 01:48:10,800

is that only 0.6 of it is stuff that we

2739

01:48:16,129 --> 01:48:13,560

are aware of being aware of

2740

01:48:18,890 --> 01:48:16,139

so our self-conscious self-aware

2741

01:48:20,450 --> 01:48:18,900

awareness uh is the accompaniment to

2742

01:48:22,370 --> 01:48:20,460

almost all of our life it doesn't mean

2743

01:48:24,169 --> 01:48:22,380

it's not happening to us it doesn't mean

2744

01:48:26,209 --> 01:48:24,179

it's not changing us it doesn't mean

2745

01:48:29,270 --> 01:48:26,219

that we're not partaking in it it just

2746

01:48:31,490 --> 01:48:29,280

means that that bit of us in which we

2747

01:48:33,649 --> 01:48:31,500

stand back and consciously say I've been

2748

01:48:34,970 --> 01:48:33,659

in this state or I am in this state well

2749

01:48:37,669 --> 01:48:34,980

first of all doing that in the state

2750

01:48:40,430 --> 01:48:37,679

would interrupt it and it's again to

2751

01:48:42,770 --> 01:48:40,440

quote Whitehead he says that operations

2752

01:48:46,609 --> 01:48:42,780

of thought are like Cavalry Charges in

2753

01:48:49,490 --> 01:48:46,619

battle they need to be very rare they

2754

01:48:51,830 --> 01:48:49,500

require Fresh Horses and they're not a

2755

01:48:55,250 --> 01:48:51,840

solution to the way in which one carries

2756

01:48:57,590 --> 01:48:55,260

out a campaign so you know you

2757

01:48:59,890 --> 01:48:57,600

the fact that you're not aware but I

2758

01:49:03,770 --> 01:48:59,900

wanted just to talk about time because

2759

01:49:05,870 --> 01:49:03,780

there's a sense in which time is passing

2760

01:49:08,030 --> 01:49:05,880

in which we're outside the flow

2761

01:49:09,590 --> 01:49:08,040

objectively and we're watching things

2762

01:49:11,930 --> 01:49:09,600

happening and we have this image of

2763

01:49:14,149 --> 01:49:11,940

something moving past us but there's

2764

01:49:15,770 --> 01:49:14,159

another kind of being in the flow of

2765

01:49:18,830 --> 01:49:15,780

time where we're not standing on the

2766

01:49:21,050 --> 01:49:18,840

bank of the river with a clipboard and a

2767

01:49:22,970 --> 01:49:21,060

stopwatch measuring things but we are

2768

01:49:26,090 --> 01:49:22,980

actually in the flow we are literally

2769

01:49:28,250 --> 01:49:26,100

swimming with the river and as far as

2770

01:49:30,830 --> 01:49:28,260

we're concerned the river is not really

2771

01:49:33,350 --> 01:49:30,840

moving we're moving with the river so

2772

01:49:35,510 --> 01:49:33,360

relative to us as it where time is still

2773

01:49:38,270 --> 01:49:35,520

but in fact nonetheless the flow is

2774

01:49:40,010 --> 01:49:38,280

happening time is passing we are part of

2775

01:49:43,129 --> 01:49:40,020

it it just depends on whether we're

2776
01:49:45,770 --> 01:49:43,139
apart from it and imagining ourselves to

2777
01:49:48,530 --> 01:49:45,780
be stationary or taking part in it

2778
01:49:50,390 --> 01:49:48,540
yeah I I don't have much to add to that

2779
01:49:53,450 --> 01:49:50,400
other than sort of a brooksonian idea

2780
01:49:56,030 --> 01:49:53,460
that when we when we

2781
01:49:57,950 --> 01:49:56,040
when we were start reflecting on time

2782
01:50:01,310 --> 01:49:57,960
and I'm not saying we shouldn't but we

2783
01:50:03,229 --> 01:50:01,320
lose time in and and you know I mean

2784
01:50:05,270 --> 01:50:03,239
this is this is the way to distract this

2785
01:50:06,229 --> 01:50:05,280
is the way to it's a sneaky way to win

2786
01:50:08,390 --> 01:50:06,239
when you're sparring with somebody

2787
01:50:10,250 --> 01:50:08,400
compliment what they just did

2788
01:50:11,510 --> 01:50:10,260

because then they'll stand back and look

2789

01:50:13,250 --> 01:50:11,520

at it and they'll become precisely

2790

01:50:15,109 --> 01:50:13,260

disengaged from it and then you win

2791

01:50:16,629 --> 01:50:15,119

because you've got to open it right

2792

01:50:19,070 --> 01:50:16,639

right

2793

01:50:20,450 --> 01:50:19,080

and because they're not because they're

2794

01:50:22,609 --> 01:50:20,460

it's in an adversarial thing they're not

2795

01:50:24,709 --> 01:50:22,619

expecting a compliment you're a wicked

2796

01:50:28,550 --> 01:50:24,719

man Jones no I think it's excellent It's

2797

01:50:30,350 --> 01:50:28,560

Oriental Oriental uh it isn't it yeah so

2798

01:50:32,209 --> 01:50:30,360

yeah I I mean I'm not advising doing

2799

01:50:33,370 --> 01:50:32,219

that no I have done it and I absolutely

2800

01:50:35,930 --> 01:50:33,380

excited

2801
01:50:37,629 --> 01:50:35,940
once and I have seen that well maybe

2802
01:50:40,010 --> 01:50:37,639
more than once but not a lot of times

2803
01:50:43,430 --> 01:50:40,020
but just to make but the point I'm

2804
01:50:48,169 --> 01:50:43,440
making aside from my uh uh whether or

2805
01:50:50,570 --> 01:50:48,179
not I I fell into advice is that

2806
01:50:54,410 --> 01:50:50,580
um I hope you know I'm joking well

2807
01:50:58,189 --> 01:50:54,420
that's why I'm laughing um so yeah uh

2808
01:51:00,050 --> 01:50:58,199
yeah I I think there's a sense

2809
01:51:01,729 --> 01:51:00,060
I mean Augustine said it famously I know

2810
01:51:03,169 --> 01:51:01,739
what time is until somebody asks me and

2811
01:51:07,550 --> 01:51:03,179
I'm not I don't want to get too much

2812
01:51:11,030 --> 01:51:08,930
there are

2813
01:51:13,669 --> 01:51:11,040

I hope this doesn't come off as a

2814

01:51:15,649 --> 01:51:13,679

ridiculous pseudo postmodern pun there

2815

01:51:17,450 --> 01:51:15,659

are times when timing matters

2816

01:51:18,530 --> 01:51:17,460

and there's times when the future

2817

01:51:21,770 --> 01:51:18,540

matters

2818

01:51:25,669 --> 01:51:21,780

I I think giving you advice to always

2819

01:51:30,229 --> 01:51:25,679

stay in the present moment is is like

2820

01:51:32,930 --> 01:51:30,239

that's not true uh I mean we we we need

2821

01:51:36,830 --> 01:51:32,940

a present moment that is bound ratio

2822

01:51:39,229 --> 01:51:36,840

religio uh to our future self we have to

2823

01:51:41,149 --> 01:51:39,239

pursue long-term goals uh Mario Smith

2824

01:51:42,530 --> 01:51:41,159

and fischbach talk about you know you

2825

01:51:45,229 --> 01:51:42,540

have two different things you have to do

2826
01:51:47,149 --> 01:51:45,239
things inside a frame you have to be

2827
01:51:48,590 --> 01:51:47,159
able to self-regulate delay

2828
01:51:50,629 --> 01:51:48,600
gratification that's in the present

2829
01:51:52,729 --> 01:51:50,639
moment and mindfulness practices are

2830
01:51:55,250 --> 01:51:52,739
power meditative practices are powerful

2831
01:51:56,870 --> 01:51:55,260
for that but you also need to do frame

2832
01:51:58,370 --> 01:51:56,880
widening because you need to see if

2833
01:52:01,550 --> 01:51:58,380
what's happening in your present state

2834
01:52:03,830 --> 01:52:01,560
is concurrent not concurrent consonant

2835
01:52:05,209 --> 01:52:03,840
with your long-term future goals and

2836
01:52:07,370 --> 01:52:05,219
your future self remember the people who

2837
01:52:08,990 --> 01:52:07,380
don't save for their retirement you need

2838
01:52:10,250 --> 01:52:09,000

to balance properly between them and I

2839

01:52:12,709 --> 01:52:10,260

think that's what contemplative

2840

01:52:14,810 --> 01:52:12,719

practices do contemplative practices are

2841

01:52:16,910 --> 01:52:14,820

all often designed not to get us

2842

01:52:18,709 --> 01:52:16,920

immersed in the present moment in that

2843

01:52:21,109 --> 01:52:18,719

sense they're designed to remind us

2844

01:52:23,990 --> 01:52:21,119

about the comprehensive big picture is

2845

01:52:25,910 --> 01:52:24,000

powerful in deep ways and I put it to

2846

01:52:29,050 --> 01:52:25,920

you that what we're actually after is

2847

01:52:32,270 --> 01:52:29,060

Marlo Ponte sets up an optimal grip a

2848

01:52:35,450 --> 01:52:32,280

dynamic balance between those again that

2849

01:52:37,850 --> 01:52:35,460

for me is that is an essential dimension

2850

01:52:39,290 --> 01:52:37,860

of ratio religio how am I properly bound

2851
01:52:42,470 --> 01:52:39,300
to time

2852
01:52:47,810 --> 01:52:42,480
simplistic models I do not think give us

2853
01:52:50,149 --> 01:52:47,820
what is conducive to a good human life I

2854
01:52:51,890 --> 01:52:50,159
mean we don't we don't want to be wanted

2855
01:52:53,750 --> 01:52:51,900
right we don't want to be a creature of

2856
01:52:55,550 --> 01:52:53,760
pure impulse because then we'll just be

2857
01:52:57,290 --> 01:52:55,560
destroyed right this is bellman's point

2858
01:52:59,330 --> 01:52:57,300
our agency will just be destroyed

2859
01:53:03,109 --> 01:52:59,340
absolutely I think that's absolutely not

2860
01:53:04,790 --> 01:53:03,119
what many exponents of the idea that we

2861
01:53:07,310 --> 01:53:04,800
should remain in the present are meaning

2862
01:53:10,550 --> 01:53:07,320
not that we should be you know

2863
01:53:12,530 --> 01:53:10,560

Thoughtless and never reflect and note

2864

01:53:15,229 --> 01:53:12,540

that we should be impulsive above all

2865

01:53:17,689 --> 01:53:15,239

but that we should be able in fact by us

2866

01:53:20,930 --> 01:53:17,699

kind of standing back to be more present

2867

01:53:23,570 --> 01:53:20,940

to the whole yes I think I mean I don't

2868

01:53:25,129 --> 01:53:23,580

disagree with your essential point I I

2869

01:53:28,129 --> 01:53:25,139

often think you know it's all very well

2870

01:53:30,590 --> 01:53:28,139

but we are the the creature that looks

2871

01:53:33,669 --> 01:53:30,600

before and behind you know and that is

2872

01:53:36,729 --> 01:53:33,679

our nature we are of beings who reflect

2873

01:53:41,570 --> 01:53:36,739

towards the person and the future so

2874

01:53:44,149 --> 01:53:41,580

yeah I agree deeply what I meant was I

2875

01:53:46,070 --> 01:53:44,159

know I I'm not I'm not disagreeing with

2876

01:53:48,530 --> 01:53:46,080

you I'm just saying that's the way to

2877

01:53:51,310 --> 01:53:48,540

think of it I agree I'm agreeing with

2878

01:53:54,050 --> 01:53:51,320

how you're agreeing with me okay

2879

01:53:56,590 --> 01:53:54,060

but no but I want to respond to Curves

2880

01:53:58,550 --> 01:53:56,600

sure

2881

01:54:01,030 --> 01:53:58,560

because I

2882

01:54:07,189 --> 01:54:04,550

propose that many people are using the

2883

01:54:09,229 --> 01:54:07,199

slogan of being the present moment as a

2884

01:54:11,810 --> 01:54:09,239

license for impulsivity

2885

01:54:13,790 --> 01:54:11,820

for gratification for not long-term

2886

01:54:15,830 --> 01:54:13,800

planning or being Reckless for

2887

01:54:17,390 --> 01:54:15,840

justifying going for the Gusto and all

2888

01:54:21,290 --> 01:54:17,400

other of the we have a whole

2889

01:54:23,689 --> 01:54:21,300

constellation of memes around this right

2890

01:54:25,490 --> 01:54:23,699

which is of course designed to keep us

2891

01:54:27,109 --> 01:54:25,500

buying stuff and perpetually

2892

01:54:29,209 --> 01:54:27,119

dissatisfied

2893

01:54:31,790 --> 01:54:29,219

um and that was the sense I wanted to

2894

01:54:34,430 --> 01:54:31,800

challenge okay so let me see if I can

2895

01:54:35,629 --> 01:54:34,440

tie a few threads together and weave it

2896

01:54:37,370 --> 01:54:35,639

back to the beginning

2897

01:54:38,810 --> 01:54:37,380

Ian when you said yeah there's a

2898

01:54:40,490 --> 01:54:38,820

misinterpretation of what it means to be

2899

01:54:43,189 --> 01:54:40,500

in the present moment

2900

01:54:44,990 --> 01:54:43,199

this is interesting because much of the

2901
01:54:47,090 --> 01:54:45,000
advice that I read in the comment

2902
01:54:49,370 --> 01:54:47,100
section not on toe videos well onto

2903
01:54:51,590 --> 01:54:49,380
videos but on other people's videos and

2904
01:54:53,810 --> 01:54:51,600
advice that I hear from quote-unquote

2905
01:54:55,189 --> 01:54:53,820
gurus and so on I'm interpreting it in a

2906
01:54:56,570 --> 01:54:55,199
certain way because I grew up in the

2907
01:54:58,669 --> 01:54:56,580
west and the way that they're

2908
01:54:59,930 --> 01:54:58,679
interpreting something in from an

2909
01:55:01,430 --> 01:54:59,940
English text which was already

2910
01:55:02,750 --> 01:55:01,440
translated and perhaps they have a

2911
01:55:04,310 --> 01:55:02,760
misinterpretation then I'm

2912
01:55:06,830 --> 01:55:04,320
misinterpreting what they're saying so

2913
01:55:08,450 --> 01:55:06,840

when some people say well I am God or so

2914

01:55:11,570 --> 01:55:08,460

and so on people say yeah I feel that

2915

01:55:13,970 --> 01:55:11,580

well you don't know if what you if what

2916

01:55:16,070 --> 01:55:13,980

they mean is what you feel and then when

2917

01:55:17,750 --> 01:55:16,080

I hear about we were talking earlier

2918

01:55:20,209 --> 01:55:17,760

about practices and rituals and they're

2919

01:55:22,250 --> 01:55:20,219

important you hear what we should do we

2920

01:55:24,350 --> 01:55:22,260

should be mindful more and this feature

2921

01:55:26,229 --> 01:55:24,360

list as you call them John this bullet

2922

01:55:28,970 --> 01:55:26,239

point list of what we should do

2923

01:55:31,010 --> 01:55:28,980

it's it's not entirely clear like I

2924

01:55:33,590 --> 01:55:31,020

believe in I used to believe in all that

2925

01:55:35,629 --> 01:55:33,600

let's say two years one

2926

01:55:38,450 --> 01:55:35,639

in my adult life until one year ago

2927

01:55:40,070 --> 01:55:38,460

because I'm such a liberal person in the

2928

01:55:41,810 --> 01:55:40,080

sense that I want everyone to be correct

2929

01:55:43,550 --> 01:55:41,820

like every culture is correct in their

2930

01:55:45,109 --> 01:55:43,560

way and everyone's touching a certain

2931

01:55:47,270 --> 01:55:45,119

part of the elephant it's just a

2932

01:55:49,669 --> 01:55:47,280

different part and and no one's wrong so

2933

01:55:52,070 --> 01:55:49,679

let me just let me take the the good and

2934

01:55:55,669 --> 01:55:52,080

and put in different pieces into me

2935

01:55:57,649 --> 01:55:55,679

however I feel it's as if

2936

01:55:59,689 --> 01:55:57,659

trying to install mac software on a

2937

01:56:02,930 --> 01:55:59,699

Windows computer it's like we're we're

2938

01:56:04,850 --> 01:56:02,940

windows and if you force an Exe on a Mac

2939

01:56:07,310 --> 01:56:04,860

no no firstly it won't load but if you

2940

01:56:09,770 --> 01:56:07,320

force it it will corrupt it and so I

2941

01:56:11,390 --> 01:56:09,780

think so much of what's gone incorrect

2942

01:56:14,030 --> 01:56:11,400

with me and perhaps with others because

2943

01:56:16,790 --> 01:56:14,040

as I talk about certain let's say

2944

01:56:17,810 --> 01:56:16,800

episodes of mine publicly people say oh

2945

01:56:19,430 --> 01:56:17,820

my gosh I've gone through something

2946

01:56:20,870 --> 01:56:19,440

similar and I haven't heard almost

2947

01:56:22,070 --> 01:56:20,880

anyone else talk about it and here's

2948

01:56:23,930 --> 01:56:22,080

what I've gone through

2949

01:56:26,270 --> 01:56:23,940

I feel like what's happening is that

2950

01:56:28,250 --> 01:56:26,280

we're being told so many lessons from so

2951
01:56:30,290 --> 01:56:28,260
many different places and they're not

2952
01:56:31,729 --> 01:56:30,300
unified and we're trying to apply them

2953
01:56:33,890 --> 01:56:31,739
to ourselves

2954
01:56:35,149 --> 01:56:33,900
so lan you use this word marrying

2955
01:56:37,129 --> 01:56:35,159
earlier that you need to open yourself

2956
01:56:39,470 --> 01:56:37,139
up to marriage and earlier you talked

2957
01:56:41,149 --> 01:56:39,480
about traditional religion and Kurt his

2958
01:56:43,250 --> 01:56:41,159
entire adult life and his entire Teenage

2959
01:56:45,109 --> 01:56:43,260
life just an inexorable atheist and

2960
01:56:46,669 --> 01:56:45,119
uncompromising one one that's

2961
01:56:48,830 --> 01:56:46,679
condescending to anything that is

2962
01:56:50,990 --> 01:56:48,840
remotely superstitious or what I would

2963
01:56:52,729 --> 01:56:51,000

classify as superstitious would say no

2964

01:56:54,649 --> 01:56:52,739

there's nothing in traditional religion

2965

01:56:56,330 --> 01:56:54,659

that needs saving and if we're going to

2966

01:56:57,950 --> 01:56:56,340

formulate something that's a new

2967

01:56:59,810 --> 01:56:57,960

religion it has to be religion without

2968

01:57:01,010 --> 01:56:59,820

religion in John's word though I'm using

2969

01:57:02,689 --> 01:57:01,020

those words now I wouldn't have said

2970

01:57:05,270 --> 01:57:02,699

that before but I see that there's

2971

01:57:06,830 --> 01:57:05,280

something to marrying a religion and

2972

01:57:08,689 --> 01:57:06,840

what I mean by that is when it comes to

2973

01:57:10,250 --> 01:57:08,699

my wife it's not like I evaluated every

2974

01:57:12,050 --> 01:57:10,260

woman on the planet and said this was

2975

01:57:13,910 --> 01:57:12,060

the best one there's going to be flaws

2976

01:57:15,950 --> 01:57:13,920

with each one so it's as if I had to

2977

01:57:17,689 --> 01:57:15,960

decide that she's the right one or

2978

01:57:20,089 --> 01:57:17,699

create the right one together with her

2979

01:57:21,890 --> 01:57:20,099

and I wonder if the same is true with

2980

01:57:23,570 --> 01:57:21,900

religion that part of this is that we

2981

01:57:25,850 --> 01:57:23,580

simply need to decide a religion and

2982

01:57:27,050 --> 01:57:25,860

then make it right for us and it's not

2983

01:57:28,970 --> 01:57:27,060

going to be right there's going to be so

2984

01:57:30,530 --> 01:57:28,980

much that they say that's incorrect so

2985

01:57:32,390 --> 01:57:30,540

that I'm just like no there's like Adam

2986

01:57:34,970 --> 01:57:32,400

and Eve it's not literal why are you

2987

01:57:37,189 --> 01:57:34,980

excoriating Evolution constantly like

2988

01:57:39,229 --> 01:57:37,199

this is not how it is and I disbelieve

2989

01:57:40,490 --> 01:57:39,239

that and so on and so on there's so much

2990

01:57:42,350 --> 01:57:40,500

that I disbelieve but there's so much

2991

01:57:44,270 --> 01:57:42,360

that I gained from it there's so much

2992

01:57:47,689 --> 01:57:44,280

that I gain from having this community

2993

01:57:49,609 --> 01:57:47,699

that's in Wisconsin a tradition

2994

01:57:52,550 --> 01:57:49,619

so anyway those are some thoughts that

2995

01:57:53,689 --> 01:57:52,560

I'm laying out in a sense to tie what we

2996

01:57:55,550 --> 01:57:53,699

talked about in the beginning together

2997

01:57:57,229 --> 01:57:55,560

with some of the threads that were left

2998

01:57:59,089 --> 01:57:57,239

open throughout what are your thoughts

2999

01:58:00,530 --> 01:57:59,099

on that John do you want to start well

3000

01:58:02,689 --> 01:58:00,540

you were addressing the tea yet I

3001

01:58:05,570 --> 01:58:02,699

thought he should respond first

3002

01:58:07,790 --> 01:58:05,580

Ian please

3003

01:58:10,490 --> 01:58:07,800

well I don't know which bit to respond

3004

01:58:12,589 --> 01:58:10,500

to but um uh

3005

01:58:14,810 --> 01:58:12,599

but I mean first of all I think that

3006

01:58:18,709 --> 01:58:14,820

there's a huge problem in

3007

01:58:22,010 --> 01:58:18,719

um taking something that is clearly a

3008

01:58:24,709 --> 01:58:22,020

myth as literal truth I think that's a

3009

01:58:27,229 --> 01:58:24,719

very modern idea that you know we're so

3010

01:58:30,530 --> 01:58:27,239

used to talking only in literal terms

3011

01:58:32,149 --> 01:58:30,540

mean anything and not true that a myth I

3012

01:58:35,270 --> 01:58:32,159

mean the very word suggests that it's

3013

01:58:38,330 --> 01:58:35,280

false but now we only started using the

3014

01:58:39,410 --> 01:58:38,340

word in the 19th century and uh in fact

3015

01:58:42,050 --> 01:58:39,420

of course

3016

01:58:44,570 --> 01:58:42,060

um Mythos was anciently for the Greeks

3017

01:58:46,669 --> 01:58:44,580

the superior way of arriving at truth

3018

01:58:49,729 --> 01:58:46,679

logos was a secondary kind of Truth

3019

01:58:51,649 --> 01:58:49,739

which over time took over from it but it

3020

01:58:53,149 --> 01:58:51,659

was through through my thoughts that

3021

01:58:55,450 --> 01:58:53,159

when actually reach these deeper

3022

01:58:58,490 --> 01:58:55,460

realities that I think you're describing

3023

01:59:00,890 --> 01:58:58,500

as possibly being experienced by people

3024

01:59:04,669 --> 01:59:00,900

in religion

3025

01:59:06,410 --> 01:59:04,679

um the idea of marrying yes I mean uh of

3026
01:59:07,729 --> 01:59:06,420
course I'm not talking well I don't know

3027
01:59:09,890 --> 01:59:07,739
if I mentioned that I mean I was just

3028
01:59:13,129 --> 01:59:09,900
using it as an example but I I think

3029
01:59:16,010 --> 01:59:13,139
that the point there is that it brings

3030
01:59:18,109 --> 01:59:16,020
up the idea of something that is fitting

3031
01:59:21,109 --> 01:59:18,119
um Carpenters still talk about two

3032
01:59:23,629 --> 01:59:21,119
surfaces that meet perfectly as marrying

3033
01:59:25,930 --> 01:59:23,639
and they're fitting and it's this sense

3034
01:59:28,490 --> 01:59:25,940
of something that is a correspondence

3035
01:59:30,709 --> 01:59:28,500
that is attention or something that is

3036
01:59:35,570 --> 01:59:30,719
resolved in a new Union that something

3037
01:59:37,970 --> 01:59:35,580
is what we're describing uh as the the

3038
01:59:41,510 --> 01:59:37,980

meaningful encounter the faithful

3039

01:59:43,070 --> 01:59:41,520

encounter where something about the two

3040

01:59:45,169 --> 01:59:43,080

surfaces

3041

01:59:46,609 --> 01:59:45,179

produce something completely new that

3042

01:59:50,750 --> 01:59:46,619

neither surface on their own could even

3043

01:59:54,169 --> 01:59:51,470

um

3044

01:59:56,230 --> 01:59:54,179

yes uh I mean

3045

01:59:56,390 --> 01:59:56,240

the way I would put that

3046

01:59:57,589 --> 01:59:56,400

[Music]

3047

02:00:05,270 --> 01:59:57,599

um

3048

02:00:06,770 --> 02:00:05,280

continuous with what you're doing in all

3049

02:00:09,850 --> 02:00:06,780

of your cognition which is relevance

3050

02:00:13,729 --> 02:00:09,860

realization which is about trying to fit

3051
02:00:15,950 --> 02:00:13,739
your framing to the world and it is not

3052
02:00:18,530 --> 02:00:15,960
given by you nor received by the world

3053
02:00:21,169 --> 02:00:18,540
but transjective it is made by the two

3054
02:00:23,290 --> 02:00:21,179
fitting together just like biological

3055
02:00:26,209 --> 02:00:23,300
adaptivity

3056
02:00:28,370 --> 02:00:26,219
you know Kurt that's how I use I use

3057
02:00:30,169 --> 02:00:28,380
that as a metaphor of work the relevance

3058
02:00:32,510 --> 02:00:30,179
realization that I think is at the core

3059
02:00:35,810 --> 02:00:32,520
of our cognition and so what are you

3060
02:00:37,910 --> 02:00:35,820
doing with a myth I think you're doing a

3061
02:00:39,410 --> 02:00:37,920
kind of relevance realization myths

3062
02:00:42,229 --> 02:00:39,420
aren't

3063
02:00:44,330 --> 02:00:42,239

false stories about the paths their

3064

02:00:47,530 --> 02:00:44,340

imaginal stories to enable us to see

3065

02:00:49,970 --> 02:00:47,540

pertinent and profound and pervasive

3066

02:00:52,189 --> 02:00:49,980

problems and patterns that we are not

3067

02:00:53,930 --> 02:00:52,199

paying attention to myth and in that

3068

02:00:56,629 --> 02:00:53,940

sense is bound up with the proper sense

3069

02:00:59,149 --> 02:00:56,639

of Prophecy prophecy isn't telling the

3070

02:01:01,669 --> 02:00:59,159

future it's telling forth what needs to

3071

02:01:02,990 --> 02:01:01,679

be seen right now

3072

02:01:07,189 --> 02:01:03,000

deeply

3073

02:01:10,310 --> 02:01:07,199

and so for me like if you are getting a

3074

02:01:12,350 --> 02:01:10,320

lot out of it ask yourself Kev and you

3075

02:01:15,169 --> 02:01:12,360

know the fact that whoever is giving you

3076

02:01:17,689 --> 02:01:15,179

the really silly sermon about you know

3077

02:01:19,910 --> 02:01:17,699

the Book of Genesis disproves Darwin or

3078

02:01:23,570 --> 02:01:19,920

something ridiculous than that I I mean

3079

02:01:26,750 --> 02:01:23,580

like if you can if if the myth comes

3080

02:01:29,390 --> 02:01:26,760

alive for you what's it doing I mean the

3081

02:01:31,310 --> 02:01:29,400

best the best myths

3082

02:01:33,410 --> 02:01:31,320

make us aware of the fact that we're

3083

02:01:34,910 --> 02:01:33,420

bound up in Mythos that we're bound up

3084

02:01:36,470 --> 02:01:34,920

in relevance realization that we're

3085

02:01:38,629 --> 02:01:36,480

bound to the world that we're connected

3086

02:01:41,330 --> 02:01:38,639

to it we're connected to each other and

3087

02:01:43,189 --> 02:01:41,340

and this connectedness we don't make it

3088

02:01:45,350 --> 02:01:43,199

we nor do we merely receive it we

3089

02:01:47,330 --> 02:01:45,360

participate in it we cultivate it and

3090

02:01:49,790 --> 02:01:47,340

and we have a deep and profound

3091

02:01:53,270 --> 02:01:49,800

responsibility to it because of how much

3092

02:01:55,729 --> 02:01:53,280

we belong to it and participate in it

3093

02:01:59,089 --> 02:01:55,739

and I think that's what

3094

02:02:01,310 --> 02:01:59,099

um when religion is functioning well it

3095

02:02:03,410 --> 02:02:01,320

uses its Mythos to do that can religion

3096

02:02:05,930 --> 02:02:03,420

malfunction of course it can everything

3097

02:02:08,689 --> 02:02:05,940

can malfunction science can malfunction

3098

02:02:10,129 --> 02:02:08,699

math was on this crazy thing where they

3099

02:02:11,810 --> 02:02:10,139

you know this whole project we thought

3100

02:02:14,570 --> 02:02:11,820

we could give a logical foundation for

3101
02:02:16,129 --> 02:02:14,580
math you know A Century of this crazy it

3102
02:02:19,189 --> 02:02:16,139
turned out just to be Impossible Project

3103
02:02:23,089 --> 02:02:19,199
we can go everything even math can go

3104
02:02:26,290 --> 02:02:23,099
down rabbit holes we gotta stop again

3105
02:02:29,390 --> 02:02:26,300
like hoping that we'll find perfection

3106
02:02:31,850 --> 02:02:29,400
as the mark of the Sacred with meaning

3107
02:02:36,109 --> 02:02:31,860
that in which we should trust

3108
02:02:39,050 --> 02:02:36,119
right God We Trust right we we we've got

3109
02:02:40,850 --> 02:02:39,060
to get more to this sense of pecanity

3110
02:02:43,430 --> 02:02:40,860
richness

3111
02:02:44,930 --> 02:02:43,440
when I do my neoplatonic practices The

3112
02:02:48,169 --> 02:02:44,940
Virtue that I the virtues that I

3113
02:02:50,450 --> 02:02:48,179

cultivate in them transfer very well to

3114

02:02:54,709 --> 02:02:50,460

my experience into my mind to my my

3115

02:02:56,810 --> 02:02:54,719

practices as a scientist and vice versa

3116

02:02:59,149 --> 02:02:56,820

and a lot of people this is now becoming

3117

02:03:01,250 --> 02:02:59,159

a viable philosophical position virtue

3118

02:03:03,109 --> 02:03:01,260

epistemology that actually what we're

3119

02:03:05,089 --> 02:03:03,119

doing in all of our domains is trying to

3120

02:03:07,910 --> 02:03:05,099

cultivate a set of Virtues that we can

3121

02:03:09,050 --> 02:03:07,920

apply across these many domains and so

3122

02:03:11,930 --> 02:03:09,060

for me

3123

02:03:13,669 --> 02:03:11,940

if it's doing that if the Mythos allows

3124

02:03:14,930 --> 02:03:13,679

you to cultivate virtues that percolate

3125

02:03:17,810 --> 02:03:14,940

through your psyche and permeate through

3126

02:03:19,490 --> 02:03:17,820

your life why are you like that's what

3127

02:03:24,229 --> 02:03:19,500

more could you want

3128

02:03:25,910 --> 02:03:24,239

that's what that's what I mean that's

3129

02:03:30,229 --> 02:03:25,920

that that's what you want when you marry

3130

02:03:31,669 --> 02:03:30,239

someone uh and I think we've got we've

3131

02:03:34,430 --> 02:03:31,679

got to give up I keep saying this we've

3132

02:03:37,850 --> 02:03:34,440

got to give up the hunger for completion

3133

02:03:41,810 --> 02:03:37,860

for certainty for comprehensive grasp

3134

02:03:44,570 --> 02:03:41,820

we've got to stop that and it's so it's

3135

02:03:47,330 --> 02:03:44,580

so endemic and Insidious you know

3136

02:03:48,649 --> 02:03:47,340

thinking it takes a lot of effort

3137

02:03:50,209 --> 02:03:48,659

personally and collectively to address

3138

02:03:51,950 --> 02:03:50,219

that

3139

02:03:53,750 --> 02:03:51,960

Ian should we give up on all of

3140

02:03:55,370 --> 02:03:53,760

certainty or should we say oh I like

3141

02:03:56,810 --> 02:03:55,380

so-and-so because it's more certain I

3142

02:04:00,109 --> 02:03:56,820

don't have the idea that I'll ever be

3143

02:04:03,109 --> 02:04:00,119

100 certain but this gives me more

3144

02:04:04,669 --> 02:04:03,119

groundedness more certainty when we call

3145

02:04:07,250 --> 02:04:04,679

anything certain we can only mean

3146

02:04:09,350 --> 02:04:07,260

certain up to a point there is no such

3147

02:04:11,629 --> 02:04:09,360

thing as total certainty

3148

02:04:15,649 --> 02:04:11,639

and in different areas certainty means

3149

02:04:17,930 --> 02:04:15,659

different kinds of things really so uh I

3150

02:04:20,390 --> 02:04:17,940

think I agree entirely with John that

3151

02:04:22,310 --> 02:04:20,400

giving up on the idea of 70 is hugely

3152

02:04:25,609 --> 02:04:22,320

important and it's the belief that

3153

02:04:28,970 --> 02:04:25,619

either science or Reason will lead us to

3154

02:04:31,250 --> 02:04:28,980

the same infallible conclusion all of us

3155

02:04:33,609 --> 02:04:31,260

um and will reveal the truth about

3156

02:04:37,970 --> 02:04:33,619

things is is

3157

02:04:40,850 --> 02:04:37,980

naive dangerous deluded

3158

02:04:43,729 --> 02:04:40,860

but not that we should honor science and

3159

02:04:46,550 --> 02:04:43,739

reason we should we should also honor

3160

02:04:49,850 --> 02:04:46,560

intuition and Imagination and you know

3161

02:04:53,930 --> 02:04:49,860

just perhaps to the last thing I shall

3162

02:04:57,109 --> 02:04:53,940

say the greatest myth for me is the myth

3163

02:05:00,169 --> 02:04:57,119

that is about myth which is the myth of

3164

02:05:01,330 --> 02:05:00,179

Orpheus and euridity so Orpheus was a

3165

02:05:06,109 --> 02:05:01,340

demigod

3166

02:05:08,810 --> 02:05:06,119

and uh he he he could with his music Move

3167

02:05:10,250 --> 02:05:08,820

Stones he could move people obviously he

3168

02:05:12,050 --> 02:05:10,260

could even change the course of a river

3169

02:05:15,050 --> 02:05:12,060

so he had some magical power of his

3170

02:05:18,770 --> 02:05:15,060

music that nobody could resist and he

3171

02:05:20,570 --> 02:05:18,780

got married to a princess eurydice and

3172

02:05:22,250 --> 02:05:20,580

after the wedding eurydice with her

3173

02:05:24,470 --> 02:05:22,260

bridesmaids was walking in a meadow and

3174

02:05:26,030 --> 02:05:24,480

she was Bitten on the heel by a Viper

3175

02:05:28,910 --> 02:05:26,040

and she died

3176

02:05:32,750 --> 02:05:28,920

and orifice was completely

3177

02:05:35,270 --> 02:05:32,760

grief struck and he thought I'm going to

3178

02:05:36,649 --> 02:05:35,280

go down into the underworld and plead

3179

02:05:38,990 --> 02:05:36,659

for her

3180

02:05:41,330 --> 02:05:39,000

and something that nobody had ever been

3181

02:05:44,030 --> 02:05:41,340

able to succeed at doing or able to go

3182

02:05:46,729 --> 02:05:44,040

there at all never mind to succeed so he

3183

02:05:49,490 --> 02:05:46,739

went to the underworld and he played for

3184

02:05:53,330 --> 02:05:49,500

the gods of the underworld and they were

3185

02:05:55,550 --> 02:05:53,340

so moved that they said yes okay we will

3186

02:05:59,209 --> 02:05:55,560

give you back your bride on one

3187

02:06:01,490 --> 02:05:59,219

condition that you you walk out of the

3188

02:06:04,250 --> 02:06:01,500

underworld and you don't look back at

3189

02:06:07,970 --> 02:06:04,260

her until you are completely both clear

3190

02:06:10,129 --> 02:06:07,980

of the underworld and at the end of his

3191

02:06:11,570 --> 02:06:10,139

journey out he couldn't resist

3192

02:06:14,830 --> 02:06:11,580

taking

3193

02:06:17,450 --> 02:06:14,840

a look at his loved one and he was over

3194

02:06:18,950 --> 02:06:17,460

overwhelmed he reached towards her and

3195

02:06:20,629 --> 02:06:18,960

she shrunk away

3196

02:06:23,450 --> 02:06:20,639

back into the underworld never to be

3197

02:06:26,689 --> 02:06:23,460

seen again now what that seems to me to

3198

02:06:29,209 --> 02:06:26,699

be about is the power of the not looked

3199

02:06:30,410 --> 02:06:29,219

at the implicit the thing that has to

3200

02:06:33,589 --> 02:06:30,420

remain

3201
02:06:36,290 --> 02:06:33,599
outside our diminishing Consciousness

3202
02:06:38,390 --> 02:06:36,300
our world of words because it simply is

3203
02:06:42,109 --> 02:06:38,400
too great for it and can only be

3204
02:06:44,510 --> 02:06:42,119
conveyed through imagination in myths

3205
02:06:47,450 --> 02:06:44,520
imagination in

3206
02:06:49,729 --> 02:06:47,460
a religious Faith or a spiritual realm

3207
02:06:53,390 --> 02:06:51,649
well thank you all thank you all for

3208
02:06:55,129 --> 02:06:53,400
coming out I I think it's apt that you

3209
02:06:56,930 --> 02:06:55,139
said this may be the last thing I say

3210
02:06:58,370 --> 02:06:56,940
and then talk about how speaking itself

3211
02:07:01,790 --> 02:06:58,380
is besmirching whatever you're talking

3212
02:07:02,709 --> 02:07:01,800
about yes exactly that's been the

3213
02:07:05,149 --> 02:07:02,719

problem

3214

02:07:07,250 --> 02:07:05,159

yeah yeah many times I have these

3215

02:07:09,050 --> 02:07:07,260

intimations when I do this podcast and I

3216

02:07:10,970 --> 02:07:09,060

study these different theories I have

3217

02:07:13,850 --> 02:07:10,980

these intimations that what I'm doing is

3218

02:07:15,470 --> 02:07:13,860

a sin in a sense sin is maybe an

3219

02:07:17,570 --> 02:07:15,480

incorrect word but it's not progressing

3220

02:07:19,550 --> 02:07:17,580

forward it's progressing backward that

3221

02:07:22,850 --> 02:07:19,560

by explicating I'm performing and

3222

02:07:25,609 --> 02:07:22,860

undoing and I should just stop and

3223

02:07:27,770 --> 02:07:25,619

be a monk and go into the monastery and

3224

02:07:30,290 --> 02:07:27,780

just not speak because to speak of it

3225

02:07:32,810 --> 02:07:30,300

diminishes it one day we must talk about

3226

02:07:35,030 --> 02:07:32,820

that yeah yeah we could talk about that

3227

02:07:36,649 --> 02:07:35,040

yes right yeah let's talk about talking

3228

02:07:40,189 --> 02:07:36,659

exactly

3229

02:07:41,870 --> 02:07:40,199

John any last words and then we wrap

3230

02:07:43,910 --> 02:07:41,880

um

3231

02:07:45,649 --> 02:07:43,920

I gotta I got very excited at times

3232

02:07:49,250 --> 02:07:45,659

because

3233

02:07:50,570 --> 02:07:49,260

we've only spoken once before

3234

02:07:54,649 --> 02:07:50,580

um

3235

02:07:58,510 --> 02:07:54,659

finding a mind as deep

3236

02:08:02,149 --> 02:07:58,520

and the heart is deep and sharp

3237

02:08:05,410 --> 02:08:02,159

insightful as he had after writing a

3238

02:08:07,669 --> 02:08:05,420

truly impressive work

3239

02:08:09,470 --> 02:08:07,679

often converging

3240

02:08:11,390 --> 02:08:09,480

and this is in no way trying to take any

3241

02:08:13,370 --> 02:08:11,400

credit away from you but finding it

3242

02:08:17,570 --> 02:08:13,380

often converging with why work

3243

02:08:19,310 --> 02:08:17,580

I find deeply encouraging

3244

02:08:21,350 --> 02:08:19,320

um independent lines of research are

3245

02:08:22,910 --> 02:08:21,360

valued in science because the chances

3246

02:08:25,790 --> 02:08:22,920

that they have been produced by bias

3247

02:08:28,070 --> 02:08:25,800

independent lines that converge

3248

02:08:30,649 --> 02:08:28,080

the chance that they're producer of bias

3249

02:08:32,209 --> 02:08:30,659

is reduced by that very convergence and

3250

02:08:34,609 --> 02:08:32,219

the fact that he coming from something

3251

02:08:36,109 --> 02:08:34,619

they're very different and we often

3252

02:08:37,250 --> 02:08:36,119

found ourselves in very significant

3253

02:08:39,350 --> 02:08:37,260

agreement I hope it was still

3254

02:08:41,510 --> 02:08:39,360

entertaining for people watching but for

3255

02:08:43,189 --> 02:08:41,520

me I just wanted to express the

3256

02:08:45,830 --> 02:08:43,199

Gratitude and if I got over enthusiastic

3257

02:08:48,649 --> 02:08:45,840

at some points I apologize but I was

3258

02:08:51,109 --> 02:08:48,659

I've just I find it deeply encouraging

3259

02:08:53,990 --> 02:08:51,119

and I mean that we're very like that

3260

02:08:56,450 --> 02:08:54,000

almost literally very encouraging uh

3261

02:08:59,390 --> 02:08:56,460

that's that this kind of convergence has

3262

02:09:02,629 --> 02:08:59,400

occurred because for me it raises the

3263

02:09:04,490 --> 02:09:02,639

plausibility of my own work and also

3264

02:09:06,410 --> 02:09:04,500

helps me of course uh deeply appreciate

3265

02:09:10,250 --> 02:09:06,420

the answer but I wanted to thank you

3266

02:09:11,870 --> 02:09:10,260

for that because that I mean it I I take

3267

02:09:14,209 --> 02:09:11,880

it everything you would we're doing here

3268

02:09:17,149 --> 02:09:14,219

was sincere and authentic as a as I

3269

02:09:19,189 --> 02:09:17,159

tried to be yeah so for me for me it's

3270

02:09:21,790 --> 02:09:19,199

just it was it's it's powerful I find it

3271

02:09:24,410 --> 02:09:21,800

a very powerful experience

3272

02:09:27,410 --> 02:09:24,420

a true and I mean I hope this is not

3273

02:09:29,330 --> 02:09:27,420

meant in any way off but like a true

3274

02:09:31,129 --> 02:09:29,340

peer you know what I mean and playing

3275

02:09:32,290 --> 02:09:31,139

with the words we're peering at the same

3276

02:09:36,709 --> 02:09:32,300

thing

3277

02:09:38,990 --> 02:09:36,719

and and I just I I thank you thank you

3278

02:09:42,229 --> 02:09:39,000

very much well I can only respond in

3279

02:09:45,770 --> 02:09:42,239

kind uh John I feel the same thing it's

3280

02:09:47,870 --> 02:09:45,780

so rare to find mindset successfully in

3281

02:09:49,189 --> 02:09:47,880

in sync really

3282

02:09:50,930 --> 02:09:49,199

um we found things that we could

3283

02:09:53,270 --> 02:09:50,940

slightly gloss for one another but

3284

02:09:56,689 --> 02:09:53,280

effectively we're we're really talking

3285

02:09:59,390 --> 02:09:56,699

about the same things and I I I have

3286

02:10:01,970 --> 02:09:59,400

only gratitude for your kindness and

3287

02:10:04,189 --> 02:10:01,980

your warmth and and and the feeling of

3288

02:10:10,030 --> 02:10:04,199

you know Fellowship so thank you very

3289

02:10:15,709 --> 02:10:12,950

I hope we talk again again I hope so too

3290

02:10:18,290 --> 02:10:15,719

all right then bye-bye thank you bye-bye

3291

02:10:20,209 --> 02:10:18,300

bye bye okay all right thank you thank

3292

02:10:22,010 --> 02:10:20,219

you for sticking around for two and a

3293

02:10:23,930 --> 02:10:22,020

half hours I appreciate that I hope that

3294

02:10:25,330 --> 02:10:23,940

it was enjoyable to you again there's

3295

02:10:27,050 --> 02:10:25,340

the website

3296

02:10:28,910 --> 02:10:27,060

theoriesofeverything.org that's a place

3297

02:10:30,410 --> 02:10:28,920

that you can go to support toe if you're

3298

02:10:31,910 --> 02:10:30,420

interested in that like I mentioned in

3299

02:10:34,490 --> 02:10:31,920

the intro there are several benefits you

3300

02:10:37,790 --> 02:10:34,500

get an ads free audio version you get

3301

02:10:40,250 --> 02:10:37,800

that sometimes 12 to 48 hours to a few

3302

02:10:41,930 --> 02:10:40,260

days prior to premiering on YouTube you

3303

02:10:43,729 --> 02:10:41,940

get discounts to the Live Events when we

3304

02:10:45,770 --> 02:10:43,739

finally do have them sometimes those

3305

02:10:47,870 --> 02:10:45,780

tickets may even be free so for instance

3306

02:10:49,850 --> 02:10:47,880

I'm looking into doing something with

3307

02:10:51,589 --> 02:10:49,860

John verakee and Ian mcgilchrist in

3308

02:10:53,629 --> 02:10:51,599

person this is all extremely tentative

3309

02:10:55,790 --> 02:10:53,639

right now but this is a plan to do in

3310

02:10:57,350 --> 02:10:55,800

the future Carl friston in London live

3311

02:10:59,330 --> 02:10:57,360

in front of an audience is another

3312

02:11:01,189 --> 02:10:59,340

example there will be exclusive merch

3313

02:11:02,870 --> 02:11:01,199

and so on there's quite a few benefits

3314

02:11:04,189 --> 02:11:02,880

you can text me if you like there's a

3315

02:11:06,709 --> 02:11:04,199

number at least we're testing that for

3316

02:11:08,870 --> 02:11:06,719

about one week or one month or so again

3317

02:11:10,609 --> 02:11:08,880

that's theories of everything.org thank

3318

02:11:12,530 --> 02:11:10,619

you all for watching it's great to see